IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| MAC Comment Resolutions  |
| Date: 2015-03-08 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Liwen Chu | Marvell |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This submission proposes comment resolutions for the following comments:

6083, 6084, 6085, 6086, 6087, 6088, 6095, 6142.

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGah Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGah Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGah Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGah Editor” are instructions to the TGah editor to modify existing material in the TGah draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGah editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGah Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Num** | **P** | **L** | **Comment** | **Propose Change** | **Resolution** |
| 6083 |  | 81 | 4 | The term "Broadcasting AID" is not defined. | Define broadcasting AID. Alternatively, identify the exact condition under wich B0-13 is set to 0. | RevisedTGah editor changes “Broadcasting AID for S1G, reserved in not S1G” to “AID 0 is used for broadcast transmission in S1G PPDU, reserved in not S1G PPDU” |
| 6084 |  | 81 | 4 | "for S1G" and "not S1G" is imprecise (S1G as a term is undefined) | Clarify. S1G STA? S1G PPDU? | RevisedSee Comment 6084. |
| 6085 |  | 82 | 6 | During 11ac development, B1 was reserved so that we could change the format of the HT Control field (again) in future. Why is it necessary that an S1G STA set this to 1? As far as I can make out, this would always be set to 1 when transmitted in an S1G PPDU. So it carries no additional information beyond what is available by virtue of the PPDU in which the field is carried. | Keep this field Reserved and remove the inserted sentence at P82L15. | Revised.Discussion: The commenter is right: VHT variant HT Control field in 5GHz band and S1G band can have different definition without the help of S1G subfield.TGah editor make changes shown in 11-15/0389r0 under the headings that includes CID 6085 |
| 6086 |  | 93 | 47 | This paragraph contains behavioral statements that do not belong in the Frame formats section. | How to derive the DA when this field is not present is behvioral and should not be present in the Frame formats clause. Move to behavioral clause" 9.12 A-MSDU operation" sounds like a good place. | ReviseTGah Editor makes changes shown in 11-15/0389r0 under the headings that includes CID 6086 |
| 6087 |  | 93 | 58 | This paragraph contains behavioral statements that do not belong in the Frame formats section. | How to derive the SA when the SA field is not present is behavioral. Move to 9.12. | ReviseTGah Editor makes changes shown in 11-15/0389r0 under the headings that includes CID 6087 |
| 6088 |  | 106 | 57 | "It is reserved otherwise" It is not clear what the otherwise condition applies to. S1G STAs? | Clarify | RevisedTGah editor change “it is reserved otherwise” to “For S1G STAs, it is reserved.” |
| 6095 |  | 340 | 55 | "shall include... as the first optional element". Which is it? "shall", i.e. mandatory, or "optional"? | Decide which it is and modify as appropriate. I suspect the intent was "If the element is present it shall be the first element". | RejectDiscussion: S1G Beacon Compatibility element is an option element in Optional Elements part in Figure 8-61. |
| 6142 | 8.3.2.2.4 | 93 | 56 | For dynamic A-MSDU in PV0 MPDU, A3 is not DA. The praragraph has some issue since the priority of A3 is higher than A1 and A1 can be DA. | Add the following text at the end of the paragraph: In a PV0 frame, DA Present is set to 0 when A3 of MPDU is stored in the receipent. | Reject.Discussion: In PV0 frame, A3/A4 are always included in Dynamic A-MSDU. |

**8.2.4.6 HT Control field**

**8.2.4.6.3 VHT variant**

***TGah editor: Remove the 1st, 2nd paragraph and Figure 8-12 from 802.11ah draft (6085).***

***Change the paragraph below as follows:***

For a non-S1G STA, t~~T~~he format of the MFB subfield in the VHT variant HT Control field is shown in Figure 14 (MFB subfield in the VHT variant HT Control field).

***TGah editor: Insert the following after Figure 14 (MFB subfield in the VHT variant HT control field):***

For an S1G STA, the format of the MFB subfield in the VHT variant HT Control field is shown in .

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | B9 B10 | B11 B14 | B15 B17 | B18 B23 |
|  | NUM\_STS | VHT-MCS | BW | SNR |
| Bits: | 2 | 4 | 3 | 6 |
| * MFB subfield in the VHT variant HT Control field when used in S1G band
 |

**8.3.2.2.4 Dynamic A-MSDU format**

***TGah editor: Change 7th paragraph in subclause 8.3.2.2.4 as following (6086):***

If present, the DA field of the Dynamic A-MSDU subframe header contains the destination address of the MSDU. When the DA field is not present, the DA of the MSDU is defined by the rules in subclause 9.12.

***TGah editor: Change 7th paragraph in subclause 8.3.2.2.4 as following (6087):***

If present, the SA field of the Dynamic A-MSDU subframe header contains the source address of the MSDU. When the SA field is not present in a Dynamic A-MSDU subframe, the SA isdefined by the rules in subclause 9.12

.