IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| LB 205 Comment Resolution Relay Operation part 2 |
| Date: 2015-13-01 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm Inc. | 5775 Morehouse Dr, San Diego, CA 92109 | +1-858-658-5302 | aasterja@qti.qualcomm.com |
| Menzo Wentink | Qualcomm | Straatweg 66-S, Breukelen, The Netherlands |  | mwentink@qti.qualcomm.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for multiple comments of TGah Draft 3.0 with the following CIDs (TOT 4 CIDs):

* 5487, 5488, 5489, 5412

Revisions:

- Rev 0: Initial version of the document

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGah Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGah Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGah Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGah Editor” are instructions to the TGah editor to modify existing material in the TGah draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGah editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGah Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 5487 | Joseph Levy | 317.37 | 9.42h.1 | The description of what a relay is unclear. As currently stated a relay logically consist of a relay AP and a relay STA. My understanding is that a relay is a STA which has relay capability. The relay capability is logically broken down into two logical entities a relay AP and a relay STA. My understanding is that the relay STA provides a means of transferring frames to and from the root AP to the relay and the relay AP provides the means for transferring frames to and from the relay and the target STA. Clarify the description. | replace "A relay is an entity that logically consists of a relay AP and a relay STA." with "A relay is a STA with the MAC features that allow the STA to relay frames from an AP (the root AP) to an other STA. A STA with these features contains two logically entities that enable this capability: a relay AP and a relay STA. | Revised – Agree in principle with the comment that the description may be somewhat unclear. For this purpose the descriptive subclause of the relay operation (4.3.13a.2) is updated to make this clearer (the clarifying description was suggested by the same commenter in CID 5480 and is proposed in 11-14/1615r2. TGah editor to make the changes shown in 11-14/1615r2 under all headings that include CID 5480. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 5488 | Joseph Levy | 317.39 | 9.42h.1 | This paragraph is very confusing and does not provide a clear definition as to what a relay STA or relay AP is. Pease clarify. | replace the paragraph with:"When a relay capable non-AP STA is acting as a relay it may function as a relay STA (a logical entity), when functioning as a relay STA the STA behaves as a non-AP STA with dot11RelaySTAOperation equal to true. When a relay capable non-AP STA is acting as a relay it may function as a relay AP (a logical entity), when functioning as a relay AP the STA behaves as an AP with dot11RealyAPOperation equal to true. Note: the relay capable non-AP STA may also act as a STA when it is not acting as a relay." | Rejected – The comment refers to the following paragraph:“A relay STA is a non-AP STA with dot11RelaySTAOperation equal to true. A relay AP is an AP with dot11RelayAPOperation equal to true.” which simply defines the STA depending on its setting of the corresponding MIB variable. Hence there is no confusion on the definition because such definition depends on the setting of the MIB variable. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 5489 | Joseph Levy | 318.7 | 9.42h.1 | The figure of the relay architecture is very unclear. It would be helpful if both Relay 1 and Relay 2 were shown as containing a relay-STA and a relay-AP. Currently it is not clear what the relationship of the relay-STA/relay-AP box and the two relays in the figure are. It would be helpful to clarify things if the figure showed that the relay-STA is associated with the Root AP, and that the STA1 is associated with the relay-AP of Relay 1. The association of the other STAs and relay-STA would also be helpful. Also since a relay is a STA, it would be helpful to show the STA portion of the relay also. | update the figure so that the architecture is clear. | Rejected - This comment has been rejected because the figure appears to illustrate what the commenter is asking for, and there has been no submission (yet) with an illustration that improves the existing one. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 5412 | Mark Hamilton | 135.19 | 5.1.5 | The Relay function introduced in this amendment needs a data plane model in clause 5.1.5. | Add a 5.1.5 subclause with the role-specific model for Relay AP and Relay STA. | Rejected - The comment is rejected in absence of sufficiently detailed proposed changes that would satisfy the comment and in absence of a submission on how to resolve this comment. |