IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LB 205 Clause 9 comment resolution | | | | |
| Date: 2014-12-01 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Yongho Seok | NEWRACOM | 9008 Research Drive, Irvine, CA 92618 |  | [yongho.seok@newracom.com](mailto:yongho.seok@newracom.com) |

Abstract

This submission proposes comment resolutions of Clause 9 comments from TGah Draft 3.0.

* CIDs: 5292, 5484, 5221, 5293, 5225, 5226, 5227, 5483, 5097, 5090, 5297, 5298, 5228, 5452 (14 CIDs)

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGah Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGah Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGah Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGah Editor” are instructions to the TGah editor to modify existing material in the TGah draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGah editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGah Draft.***

| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 5292 | 251.29 | 9.7.6.1 | A control frame is also carried in an S1G\_1M PPDU and of course in their respective duplicate formats as well as discussed in the following subclauses. | Insert S1G\_1M PPDU case. Also probably we need to add here also the duplicate cases referencing the respective subclauses. | Revised-  Generally, I agree with the comment.  But, a control frame can use S1G\_1M, S1G\_SHORT\_PREAMBLE and S1G\_LONG\_PREAMBLE.  Simply remove the short preamble from current sentence.  TGah editor to make changes as the following editing instructions:  Replace  “A control frame shall be carried in an S1G PPDU using short preamble, long GI, no LDPC coding, non-STBC format, with no traveling pilots and with NSS=1 when the control frame is transmitted by an S1G STA.”  with  “A control frame shall be carried in an S1G PPDU with NSS equal to 1 without using long preamble, short GI, LDPC coding, STBC format and traveling pilots when the control frame is transmitted by an S1G STA.”  from sub-clause 9.7.6.1. |
| 5484 | 254.43 | 9.7.6.5.4b | the phrase "two STA" is incorrect it should be "two STAs" | replace "STA" with "STAs" in the appropriate place. | Accepted |
| 5221 | 255.21 | 9.7.6.6 | With the bullet combined with the previous bullet, it is not clear when same bandwidth or narrower bandwidth is used in multiple frame exchange. | Make it clear. | Revised-  The second bullet is for a multiple frame exchange in a TXOP.  For more clarification:  TGah editor to make changes as the following editing instructions:  Replace “Channel Bandwidth of PPDU during the multiple frame exchange sequences in a TXOP shall be the same or narrower than the Channel Bandwidth of the preceding PPDU.” with “In a TXOP, a STA shall not set the TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH to a value greater than the RXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH for the next frame exchange sequence.” |
| 5293 | 255.35 | 9.7.6.6 | Replace "OBSS mitigation support" with "OBSS Mitigation Support" | As in comment. | Revised-  Agree in principle.  An initial word of the field name shall be a capital letter.  TGah editor to make changes as the following editing instructions:  Replace “the OBSS mitigation support subfield” with “the OBSS Mitigation Support subfield”. |
| 5225 | 261.28 | 9.20a | "that is transmitting an S1G NDP intended for multiple recipients shall set the TXVECTOR parameter PARTIAL\_AID to 0"    Does this include multiple recipients with same AID? | Make it clear. | Rejected-  It includes multiple recipients with same partial AID.  But, please refer the following sentence defined in in IEEE 802.11 REVmc D3.0.  “transmitting a VHT NDP intended for multiple recipients shall set the TXVECTOR parameters GROUP\_ID to 63 and PARTIAL\_AID to 0.”  Both wording are same and both meaning are same.  If this wording is still not clear, please submit a comment to IEEE 802.11 REVmc. |
| 5226 | 262.04 | 9.20a | If this app;lies Multicast/group AID for multiple STAs, make it clear. | As in comment | Rejected-  “A frame that is sent by an AP and addressed to a STA associated with that AP or sent by a DLS or TDLS STA in a direct path to a DLS or TDLS peer STA, or to a group of STAs with a common multicast AID and a common BSSID”  The sentence is exactly saying that this PARTIAL \_AID values is used for a group of STAs with a common multicast AID and a common BSSID.  Additional clarification is not needed. |
| 5227 | 262.40 | 9.20a | If this app;lies Multicast/group AID for multiple STAs, make it clear. | As in comment | Rejected-  “A frame that is not a Control frame that is sent by an AP and addressed to a STA associated with that AP or is sent by a DLS or TDLS STA in a direct path to a DLS or TDLS peer STA or is sent to a group of STAs with a common multicast AID and a common BSSID”  The sentence is exactly saying that this PARTIAL \_AID values is used for a group of STAs with a common multicast AID and a common BSSID.  Additional clarification is not needed. |
| 5483 | 263.64 | 9.20a | UPLINK\_INDICATION can be used for reducing power consumptions since a non-AP STA may terminate reception when the TXVECTOR UPLINK\_INDICATION indicates that the packet is for an AP, not for an Non-AP STA. This should be explicitly specified here since the same has been specified for COLOR in the next paragraph. | Add the following sentence to Line 64 at the end of the paragraph: " The TXVECTOR parameter UPLINK\_INDICATION is used to assist a receiving STA in identifying the targeted destination STA so that the receiving STA might reduce power consumption by terminating the reception process in the case when PPDU being received is not destined for the receiving STA." | Rejected-  The STA should not filter the received PPDU by the UPLINK\_INDICATION field.  For example, when RTS and CTS frame are transmitted to AP, all STAs shall receive the corresponding RTS and CTS frames.  Similar to IEEE 802.11ac, the STA should filter the received PPDU only by the PAID field. |
| 5097 | 264.01 | 9.20a | This is an incomplete description of the uses of the COLOR field | Insert that the COLOR field also leads to changed (weakened) CCA behavior by OBSS STAs | Revised-  I agree that the description of the COLOR field is not complete.  TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14-1569r1 under the heading for CID 5097. |
| 5090 | 264.57 | 9.22.2.4 | Remaining conflicts with baseline standard | Resolve conflicts with baseline before going to sponsor ballot | Revised-  Agree in principle.  The conflict was addressed by the resolution of CID 5297. |
| 5297 | 265.01 | 9.22.2.4 | As pointed out by the editor this paragraph is in conflict with REVmc D3.0. Find a way to organize and move the content of this paragraph to 9.22.2.5a (EDCA channel access in an S1G BSS) and remove this paragraph from this subclause. In the proposed change it is suggested the same language that is used in 11ac. | Remove the first paragraph of this subclause.    Insert the following paragraph after Table 9-10a of subclause 9.22.2.5a:  "When a STA and the BSS, of which the STA is a member, both support multiple channel widths, an EDCA TXOP is obtained based solely on activity of the primary channel. "Idle medium" in this subclause means "idle primary channel." Likewise "busy medium" means "busy primary channel." | Accepted |
| 5298 | 266.48 | 9.22.2.6 | Subclauses from 9.22.2.6 to 9.22.2.10 have undergone major changes from REVmc D2.0 to REVmc D3.0 due to the incorpation of 11ac and 11af. In order to ensure that 11ah amendment is inline with the normative behavior specified in these subclauses check that the neccessary changes to this subclauses are performed to be inline with the normative behavior of S1G STAs and their functionality. This may be as simple as adding S1G qualifiers when applicable. | As in comment. | Revised-  I will propose the detailed resolution in the next revised document. |
| 5228 | 267.44 | 9.22.2.9 | It is not clear from the text whether and when NDP CTS and normal CTS are used, e.g. can NDP CTS be used for reseting NAV within a predefined duration. | Make it clear. | Rejected-  Reseting the NAV through the NDP CTS frame has not been described in the sub-clause 9.22.2.9.  The comment fails to identify a specific issue to be addressed. |
| 5452 | 269.09 | 9.22.2.9 | "A NAV value ... is permitted" is a direct normative statement inside an informative NOTE. Also, the value really doesn't account for inaccuraceis; it just allows for (or accommodates) them. | Replace "is permitted and accounts for" with "allows for". | Accepted |

**Propose:**

Revised for CID 5097 per discussion and editing instructions in 11-14/1569r1.

TGah Edior: Modify the below paragraph of the sub-clause 9.20a as the following:

The TXVECTOR parameter COLOR is used to assist a receiving STA in identifying the BSS from which a reception originates so that the receiving STA might increase spatial reuse and reduce power consumption by terminating the reception process in the case when the reception is not from the BSS with which the STA is associated. A STA transmitting an S1G PPDU that is not a 1 MHz PPDU and is not an NDP frame and that is addressed to an AP need not include the TXVECTOR parameter COLOR in the TXVECTOR. A STA transmitting an S1G PPDU that is not a 1 MHz PPDU and is not an NDP frame and that is sent by a DLS or TDLS STA in a direct path to a DLS or TDLS peer STA shall set the TXVECTOR parameter COLOR to the value of the COLOR parameter, if present, from the RXVECTOR of the most recently received frame from its associated AP or from the DO of the IBSS of which it is a member that contained a COLOR parameter. An AP transmitting an S1G PPDU that is not a 1 MHz PPDU and is not an NDP frame shall set the TXVECTOR parameter COLOR to a value of its choosing within the range 0 to 7 and shall maintain that value for the duration of the existence of the BSS. The AP which is a member of a Multiple BSSID Set shall set the TXVECTOR parameter COLOR for each different BSSID(*i*) to a same value.