IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Comment Resolutions for Subclause 9.2.4.2 | | | | |
| Date: 2014-09-15 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Liwen Chu | Marvell |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This submission proposes comment resolutions for subclause 9.2.4.2:

3028, 3313, 3479, 3669, 3888, 3942***.***

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGah Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGah Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGah Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGah Editor” are instructions to the TGah editor to modify existing material in the TGah draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGah editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGah Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Num** | **P** | **L** | **Comment** | **Propose Change** | **Resolution** |
| 3028 | 9.2.4.2 | 220 | 56 | "The AC\_BE has the highest priority when the STA Type of the S1G STA is 1 (i.e., Sensor type STA)."  I have no idea what this note is telling me? Is it modifying the contents of the table? Is it limiting the UP values? If so, say so. | Replace with a statement that makes sense, or delete. | Revise  Discussion: generally agree with the comment.    TGah editor makes the changes in 11-14/1239r0 under CID 3028 |
| 3313 | 9.2.4.2 | 222 | 4 | The value of the PS-Poll ACI subfield overrides the PS\_Poll ACI only if the STA Type subfield coincides with that of the STA. Also not all Sensor type STAs have a single queue (see 9.21.2.1) so not all the frames are transmitted using AC\_BE, but rather the PS-Poll family only. And the PS-Poll ACI subfield based update is valid for Sensor type STAs as well. | Make the appropriate changes to this paragraph to clarify that the update is valid if the EDCA parameter Set is intended for the S1G STA's type and also the description for the Sensor type STA should be the same as the non-Sensor type STA with the only difference that the default value is AC\_BE in this case. | Revise  Discussion: generally agree with the comment.  TGah editor makes the changes in 11-14/1239r0 under CID 3313, 3479, 3888 |
| 3479 | 9.2.4.2 | 221 | 60 | Confusing: "shall transmit .. AC\_VO by default, unless the overridden PS-Poll ACI subfield .. Indicates a different access category for sending PS-Poll frames." How does a value of an overriden subfield take precedence over a default setting? At least break this up into separate components. | Replace "The S1G STA that is a non-Sensor type STA shall transmit the frame that is a PS-Poll, PS-Poll+BDT or NDP PS-Poll frame using the access category AC\_VO by default, unless the overridden PS-Poll ACI subfield in the Update EDCA Info field in an EDCA Parameter Set element, received from the AP with which the S1G STA is associated, indicates a different access category for sending PS-Poll frames." with: "By default a non-sensor S1G STA shall transmit each PS-Poll, PS-Poll+BDT or NDP PS-Poll frame using the access category AC\_VO. A different access category shall be used if the S1G STA receives, from the AP with which it is associated, an EDCA Parameter Set element whose PS-Poll ACI subfield value indicates a different access category for transmitting PS-Poll frames." Then, because it is redundant, delete the next sentence: "After reception of the EDCA Parameter Set element from the AP with which it is associated, an S1G STA shall transmit the frame using the access category indicated in the PS-Poll ACI subfield." And replace the final sentence of this paragraph with: "<new paragraph>A sensor S1G STA transmits all frames (including PS-Poll, PS-Poll+BDT and NDP PS-Poll frames) using the access category AC\_BE." (No new reference is needed because access categories are already included in the discussion.) | Revise  Discussion: Generally agree with the comment.  TGah editor makes the changes in 11-14/1239r0 under CID 3313, 3479, 3888 |
| 3669 | 9.2.4.2 | 221 | 31 | To support both sensor type and non-sensor type STA, STA Type subfield of EDCA parameter should be zero. Hence this sentence is not correct. | Change from "any value that is less than 3" to "zero" or "0." | Reject  Discussion: When an AP support sensor and non-sensor STAs, the AP can set EDCA parameters for sensor only, non-sensor only, sensor and non-sensor separately. So ‘any value that is less than 3” is right. |
| 3888 | 9.2.4.2 | 221 | 61 | wrong articles | Change "The S1G STA that is a non-Sensor type STA shall transmit the frame that is a" to "An S1G STA that is a non-Sensor type STA shall transmit" and change "or NDP PS-Poll frame using the access" to "and NDP PS-Poll frames using access" and change and change " change "After reception of the EDCA Parameter Set" to "After reception of an EDCA Parameter Set" change "shall transmit the frame using" to "shall transmit these frames using" change "transmits all the frames" to "transmits each of these frames" and change "the same access" to "access" | Revise  Discussion: generally agree with the comment.  TGah editor makes the changes in 11-14/1239r0 under CID 3313, 3479, 3888 |
| 3942 | 9.2.4.2 | 221 | 35 | If an S1G Beacon frame includes an EDCA Parameter Set element with Override field equal to 1, unpredictable number of non-AP S1G STAs are overridden. The Override field of the EDCA Parameter Set element in the S1G Beacon frame shall be set to 0. | Insert a following text after P221L40. --- An S1G AP shall not set the Override field of the EDCA Parameter Set element in an S1G Beacon frame to 1. | Reject.  Discussion: Although a STA may miss some beacon, it will receive the EDCA Parameter Set element eventually. 802.11 baseline uses beacon to change EDCA parameter set of the BSS which is same here. |

9.2.4.2 HCF contention-based channel access (EDCA)

***TGah Editor: Change Table 9-1 as follows (CID3028 ):***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| * UP-to-AC mappings | | | | | | |
| Priority | UP  (Same as 802.1D user priority) | 802.1D designation | AC | Transmit queue (dot11Alternate-EDCAActivated false or  not present) | Transmit queue (dot11AlternateEDCAActivated true) | Designation (informative) |
| Lowest  Highest | 1 | BK | AC\_BK | BK | BK | Background |
| 2 | — | AC\_BK | BK | BK | Background |
| 0 | BE | AC\_BE | BE | BE | Best Effort or Sensor Traffic |
| 3 | EE | AC\_BE | BE | BE | Best Effort |
| 4 | CL | AC\_VI | VI | A\_VI | Video (alternate) |
| 5 | VI | AC\_VI | VI | VI | Video (primary) |
| 6 | VO | AC\_VO | VO | VO | Voice (primary) |
| 7 | NC | AC\_VO | VO | A\_VO | Voice (alternate) |
|  | | | | | | |

**TGah editor: *Insert the following paragraph after the 9th***(#3130) ***paragraph of sub-clause 9.2.4.2 as follows (***CID 3313, 3479, 3888***):***

An S1G STA that is a non-Sensor type STA shall transmit PS-Poll, PS-Poll+BDT and NDP PS-Poll frames using access category AC\_VO by default. An S1G STA that is sensor type STA shall transmit PS-Poll, PS-Poll+BDT and NDP PS-Poll frames using access category AC\_BE by default. After reception of an EDCA Parameter Set element from the AP with which it is associated, an S1G STA shall transmit PS-Poll, PS-Poll+BDT and NDP PS-Poll frames using the access category indicated in the PS-Poll ACI subfield.