IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| LB 203 MAC comment resolution part 1 |
| Date: 2014-08-26 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Yongho Seok | Self |  |  | yongho.seok@gmail.com  |

Abstract

This submission proposes comment resolutions of MAC comments from TGah Draft 2.0.

* CIDs: 4049, 3682, 3779, 3778, 3573, 3864, 3147, 3118, 4026, 3512 (10 CIDs)

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGah Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGah Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGah Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGah Editor” are instructions to the TGah editor to modify existing material in the TGah draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGah editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGah Draft.***

| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 4049 | Ronald Murias | 165.00 | 9.17b | I object to the resolution of CID 1202. Why is COLOR used at all? Are some colors better than others? Rename all occurances of COLOR with something more descriptive. | See comment. | Rejected-CID 1202 is as the following: “The concept of "color" is not described. This is as good a place as any to do it.”Proposed changes from the commenter is as the following:“Please add a 1-para description of the purpose of Color.Also change the case of the word in the heading to "color" if the intro is added or "COLOR" if no intro is added (as this is the capitalization of the vector parameter).”Proposed resolution is as the following: “generally agree with commenter, TGah editor to execute proposed changes from 11-14-0611r1 found under all headings which include CID1202”As per request from the commenter, we added the following description of the COLOR. “The TXVECTOR parameter COLOR is used to assist a receiving STA in identifying the BSS from which a reception originates so that the receiving STA can reduce power consumption by terminating the reception process in the case when the reception is not from the BSS with which the STA is associated.”The terminology of COLOR is not a matter of CID 1202. Also, I don’t know why the commenter does not like the COLOR.  |
| 3682 | Lei Wang | 254.00 | 9.21.2.8 | Again, why do we need to specify non-S1G STA shall not use NDP CF-End frame? Cause unnecessary forward compatibility concern. | delete the last sentence in the paragraph in line 24 page 254. | Rejected- All NDP MAC frames are allowed only in S1G band. For example, please refer the following: In Page 231 Line 44:“A non-S1G STA shall not transmit NDP CTS frames.”In Page 233 Line 48: “A non-S1G STA shall not transmit NDP Ack and NDP PS-Poll-Ack frames.”  |
| 3779 | Liwen Chu | 255.00 | 9.21.2.8 | with 1MHz NDP CF-End, +/-8 may not work. | Using +/- 8 when 2MHz NDP CTS is used. Using +/- 48 when 1MHz NDP CTS is used. | Rejected- +/- 8 us is not related with the channel bandwidth. It is a time margin for considering the clock drift. And, it is determined by the TXOP limit and the TSF timer accuracy.  |
| 3778 | Liwen Chu | 255.00 | 9.21.2.8 | Why RID timer is not set when CF-End from the same STA whose PPDU is used to set RID is received. | Change the RID setting rules per the comment. | Rejected- The RID setting rule after receiving the NDP CF-END frame is already described in 9.3.2.4a. |
| 3573 | Hongyuan Zhang | 256.00 | 9.21.2.9a | "Transmit a 16MHz mask PPDU if...", since this paragraph talks about true 16/8MHz intended transmission, and "16MHz mask PPDU" also includes lower BW PPDUs that follows 16MHz mask, we may need to remove the word "mask"., same for line 57 for 8MHz PPDU | as in comment. | Revised- Agree in principle. TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14/1054r2 under the heading for CID 3573. |
| 3864 | Liwen Chu | 331.00 | 10.14 | "the S1G STA shall wake to listen to SA Query Request frame with the interval specified bydot11AssociationSAQueryMaximumTimeout"This requirement should only apply to a group of S1G STA. | Change the sentence per the comment. | Rejected- The SA Query procedure is used for keeping a valid security state for a single STA. The same philosophy is still vaild for S1G STA.If you are still confusing, please double check the original protocol from 10.14 SA Query procedures. |
| 3147 | Alfred Asterjadhi | 331.00 | 10.14 | How does the STA know when the S1G AP will send the SA Query Request frame? It seems an unnecessary burden for a STA to wake up and wait for a frame that it does not know when it can be received. Shouldnt the AP send the SA Query Request frame when it knows that the STA is in Awake mode? | Please clarify. | Rejected- A STA does not need to know when an AP will send the SA Query Request frame. But, it knows a timeout value of the SA Query Request timer. When it wakes up, the STA can receive the buffered SA Query Request frame from the AP.Also, it is not a requirement of all S1G STA in the power save mode. When the STA supports the SA Query procedure, it is required in the S1G band. |
| 3118 | Alfred Asterjadhi | 513.00 | C.3 | dot11BDTCapable MIB variable definition is missing and need to be added in Annex C. | As in comment. | Revised-Agree in principle. TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14/1054r2 under the heading for CID 3118. |
| 4026 | Rojan Chitrakar | 515.00 | C.3 | dot11ShortBeaconInterval is listed as Unsigned32 | Change to TruthValue | Revised-Agree in principle. TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14/1054r2 under the heading for CID 4026. |
| 3512 | David Hunter | 516.00 | C.3 | "receiving the S1G variant HT Control field": except that there is no S1G variant HT Control field. | Replace "S1G" with "VHT"? However, since this is the definition of dot11S1GControlFieldOptionImplemented, then the more likely solution is to delete this definition altogether. | Revised-Agree in principle. TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14/1054r2 under the heading for CID 3512. |

**Propose:**

Revised for CID 3778, 3573, 3118, 4026, 3512, per discussion and editing instructions in 11-14/1054r2.

***TGah editor: Change these subclauses (9.21.2.8) as follows:*** *(CID 3778)*

An S1G STA that receives an NDP CF-End frame should reset its NAV and RID and can start contending for the medium without further delay.

An S1G STA may transmit a CF-End frame containing a value greater or equal to 0 in the Duration/ID field.

An S1G STA shall interpret the reception of a CF-End frame with the Duration/ID field equal to zero as a NAV and RID reset, i.e., it resets its NAV and RID timer to 0 at the end of the PPDU containing this frame. After receiving a CF-End frame with the Duration/ID field equal to zero and a matching BSSID, an AP may respond by transmitting a CF-End frame with the Duration/ID field equal to zero after SIFS.

***TGah editor: Change these subclauses (9.21.2.9a) as follows:*** *(CID 3573)*

a) Transmit a 16 MHz ~~mask~~ PPDU if the secondary 2 MHz channel, the secondary 4 MHz channel and the secondary 8 MHz channel were idle during an interval of PIFS immediately preceding the start of the TXOP

b) Transmit an 8 MHz ~~mask~~ PPDU on the primary 8 MHz channel if both the secondary 2 MHz channel and the secondary 4 MHz channel were idle during an interval of PIFS immediately preceding the start of the TXOP

c) Invoke a new backoff procedure if the secondary 2 MHz and/or the secondary 4 MHz channel were busy.

***TGah editor: Change these subclauses (Annex C) as follows:*** *(CID 3118)*

Dot11S1GStationConfigEntry ::=

SEQUENCE {

 …

dot11MaxAwayDuration Unsigned32,

dot11APPMActivated TruthValue,

 dot11BDTCapable TruthValue

}

dot11APPMActivated OBJECT-TYPE

SYNTAX TruthValue

MAX-ACCESS read-only

STATUS current

DESCRIPTION

“This is a control variable.

It is written by an external management entity.

Changes take effect as soon as practical in the implementation.

This attribute indicates if the AP may go to doze state."

DEFVAL { false }

::= { dot11S1GStationConfigEntry 50}

dot11BDTCapable OBJECT-TYPE

SYNTAX TruthValue

MAX-ACCESS read-only

STATUS current

DESCRIPTION

“This is a control variable.

It is written by an external management entity.

Changes take effect as soon as practical in the implementation.

This attribute, when true, indicates that the station implementation is capable of supporting the bi directional TXOP Operation. The capability is disabled, otherwise."

DEFVAL { false }

::= { dot11S1GStationConfigEntry 51}

-- \*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

-- \* End of dot11S1GStationConfigTable TABLE

-- \*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

dot11S1GComplianceGroup OBJECT-GROUP

OBJECTS {

 …

dot11TIMADEImplemented,

dot11MaxAwayDuration,

dot11APPMActivated,

dot11BDTCapable }

STATUS current

DESCRIPTION

"Attributes that configure the S1G Group for IEEE 802.11."

::= { dot11Groups 84 }

***TGah editor: Change these subclauses (Annex C) as follows:*** *(CID 4026)*

Dot11S1GStationConfigEntry ::=

SEQUENCE {

dot11MaxMPDULength INTEGER,

dot11S1GMaxRxAMPDUFactor Unsigned32,

dot11S1GControlFieldOptionImplemented TruthValue,

dot11S1GRxVHTMCSMapOCTET STRING,

dot11S1GTxVHTMCSMapOCTET STRING,

dot11S1GOBSSScanCount Unsigned32,

dot11ShortBeaconInterval TruthValue~~Unsigned32~~,

***TGah editor: Change these subclauses (Annex C) as follows:*** *(CID 3512)*

dot11S1GControlFieldOptionImplemented OBJECT-TYPE

SYNTAX TruthValue

MAX-ACCESS read-only

STATUS current

DESCRIPTION

"This is a capability variable.

Its value is determined by device capabilities.

This attribute, when true, indicates that the station implementation is capable of receiving the VHT~~S1G~~ variant HT Control field."

DEFVAL { false }

::= { dot11S1GStationConfigEntry 3 }