IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| LB 200 MAC Editorial Part 2 comment resolution |
| Date: 2014-05-01 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Yongho Seok  | LG Electronics |  |  | yongho.seok@lge.com  |

Abstract

This submission proposes comment resolutions of MAC Editorial comments from TGah Draft 1.0.

* CIDs: 1410, 1006, 1013, 1014, 1016, 1668, 1821, 2361, 2836, 2565, 1028, 1678, 2381, 1679, 1680, 1416, 1835, 2383, 1990, 2420, 2421, 1157, 2752, 2424 (24 CIDs)

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGah Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGah Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGah Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGah Editor” are instructions to the TGah editor to modify existing material in the TGah draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGah editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGah Draft.***

| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1410 | 1 | 3 | References to several subclauses include only the subclause number but not the corresponding title. To avoid confusion when referring to different draft versions, add in parenthesis the subclause title whenever it is not present. Also clause numbers are not aligned with the version 1.1 of REVmc | As in comment. | Revised- TGah editor should review the subclause number and add in parenthesis the subclause title whenever the subclause title is not present.  |
| 1006 | 1 | 3.2 | Please observe "that" vs "which" rules."that" is used when building conditions, and forms an integral part of a condition."which" is used to add additional information, but does not form part of the condition. It is prefixed either by a preposition or a comma. | Review the WG11 style guide (which gives more detail and some examples). Then review all use of that/which and correct. (in particular ", that" and "which" with no preceding comma are suspect. Antconc regular expressions can help locate). | Accepted-Agree in principle.TGah editor will review all use of that/which and correct. |
| 1013 | 4 | 4.13 | "The AID assignment criteria can depend on STA location"Review the WG11 Style document. WG11 style is to use "can" in the sense of "is able to, given the rules defined in this document". If you have not described how this can can be performed, it should be an express of possibility using "might".FYI on REVmb during one ballot we had 660 separate comments on the use of "can", which gave rise to the WG11 interpretation. | Review all uses of "can" in the document (117 instances) and replace any with "might" that do not meet the WG11 meaning of the verb. | Revised- Agree in principle. The corresponding wording was reviewed and it was revised in 11-14/337r3. But, 11-14/337r3 was approved in March meeting, no chane is needed for the resolution of the comment. |
| 1014 | 4 | 4.13 | "Grouping of non-AP STAs may be used to reduce network energy consumption""May" is used with a particular meaning in IEEE-SA standards, equivalent to "is hearby permitted to".This disagrees with common English usage, which also interprets "may" as "might". | Review all use of "may". Replace those that do not mean "is hearby permitted to" with an alternate permitted verb (might/can/should/shall). | Revised- Agree in principle. The corresponding wording was reviewed and it was revised in 11-14/337r3. But, 11-14/337r3 was approved in March meeting, no chane is needed for the resolution of the comment. |
| 1016 | 4 | 4.14 | Please note that all "i.e." and "e.g." need to be followed with a comma. | Change to "i.e., TWT values". Do this globally (7 of 26 instances).Also fix "e.g." (13 of 21 instances). | Accepted-Agree in principle.  |
| 1668 | 4 | 4.14 | "target wake time" here is the name of a function, not the name of a defined STA exchange object (frame, field, element, etc.), so does not use initial caps. | Replace "Wake Time" with "wake time" in this heading and "Target Wake Time" with "target wake time" when it is used to refer to the function. | Accepted-Agree in principle. |
| 1821 | 26 | 4.14 | General description only required. Keep only first two sentences. | Delete from "...within specific frames." | Revised- I agree in principle. A criterion of a general description is very subjective.The following sentence can be removed since it is very vague. “Some of the frames containing TWT values are response frames, the use of which allows for minimal wake activity between successive STA accesses of the medium.”TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14-0551r0 under the heading for CID 1821. |
| 2361 | 4 | 4.14 | What is a "response frame"? | Clarify (response to what?) | Revised-See the proposed resolution of CID 1821. |
| 2836 | 4 | 4.14 | Suggest to move 4.14 to before 4.13 so that the new term of TWT was introduced before using. | move the section of 4.14 to prior of the section of 4.13 | Accepted-Agree in principle.  |
| 2565 | 8 | 6.3.3.3.2 | It is better to use 'octet' instead of 'byte'. | Replace 'bytes' by 'octets' throughout the draft. | Accepted- Agree in principle.But, There is no occurrence from TGah Draft 1.2.No change is needed. |
| 1028 | 11 | 6.3.5.2.3 | "Insert a sentence at the end of section 6.3.5.2.3 as follows :"There are two reasons why this is wrong. 1) we have clauses and subclauses, not sections. 2) references to subclauses don't need the word "subclause" before them. | Review the ~25 instances of "section" (excluding "this section", which is the subject of another comment) and either delete them (correct for cited location) or replace with "subclause" where they are a reference to an IEEE-SA standard. | Revised- TGah editor replaces “subsection” and “section” with “subclause” throughout the draft except of clause D.  |
| 1678 | 39 | 8.3.1.19 | Names of frames, fields, etc. use initial caps. | Use initial caps for the names of all frames, fields, etc. (of course not capitalizing any "frame", "field" that follows the name). | Accepted- Agree in principle.  |
| 2381 | 40 | 8.3.1.19 | Where is Figure 8-29k1 used? | Either add some text to refer to it, or delete it | Revised-Agree in principle. TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14-0551r0 under the heading for CID 2381. |
| 1679 | 40 | 8.3.1.21 | Per the Style Guide "set to" is used only when the value of a field is being set, not when the field simply holds the relevant value or is being read. | Delete "set to". Also, throughout the draft delete or replace "set to" in every instance in which the reference is not explicitly to the process of setting a value. | Revised-Agree in principle. TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14-0551r0 under the heading for CID 1679. |
| 1680 | 40 | 8.3.1.22 | "Change Sequence variable" -- is this referring to the element? Then that needs to be made explicit. | Replace "variable" with "element". | Revised-Agree in principle. TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14-0551r0 under the heading for CID 1680. |
| 1416 | 39 | 8.3.1.5 | merge the lines as suggested | The Duration/ID field contains Duration as determined according to 8.2.5 (Duration/ID field (QoS STA)) if the PS-Poll is sent as the initial frame of aSpeed Frame exchange by S1G STAs; otherwise, the Duration/ID field contains AID. | Revised- Agree in principle. TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14-0551r0 under the heading for CID 1416. |
| 1835 | 61 | 8.3.1.5 | Do not change the format of a PS Poll. If you want to have a special Poll packet to start a Speed Frame make one and call it "SP Poll". | Delete all the changes to 8.3.1.5. Create a new SP Poll format that does what you want. | Revised-Agree in principle. In the 11-14/0038r1, new SF variant of the PS-Poll frame format was created. But, because 11-14/0038r1 was already approved, no change is needed. |
| 2383 | 41 | 8.3.2.1 | I don't think you can remove the specification of what the RA and TA are from the table and relegate them to notes (even if they aren't NOTEs), especially since the notes don't say what the RA and TA are set to in some cases | Make the table cells say "RA = DA or <something> (see 1)" and "TA = SA or <something> (see 2)" with the right <something>s, delete the notes shown, and put in the references (not Notes or NOTEs) 1 and 2 | Revised-Agree in principle.TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14-0551r0 under the heading for CID 2383. |
| 1990 | 82 | 8.4.2.30 | The acronym SID is not defined | Add definition of SID to clause 3 | Revised- Agree in principle. TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14-0551r0 under the heading for CID 1990. |
| 2420 | 129 | 8.5 | The sizes of the Dialog Token, Suspend Duration fields in the various Action frames is not described | Specify the sizes (see existing uses of the Dialog Token in the baseline) | Rejected- Please see the Dialog Token field of the ADDBA Request/Response frames in 802.11 REVmc Draft 2.5.If you still has same concern, please submit a comment to TGmc.  |
| 2421 | 129 | 8.5 | The contents of the Synch Control, AID Announcement element [sic], EDCA Parameter Set, Activity Specificaiton element [sic], TWT element [sic], Group ID List element [sic] fields in the various Action frames is not described | Add the usual blurb (see other Action frames' fields) | Revised- Agree in principle. TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14-0551r0 under the heading for CID 2421. |
| 1157 | 128 | 8.5.13.2 | Number of this subclause is wrong | Change to 8.5.13.3 | Revised- Agree in principle. TGah Editor: Replace“8.6.13.2 TDLS Setup Request frame format” with“8.6.13.2 TDLS Setup Request Action field format”TGah Editor: Replace “8.6.13.2 TDLS Setup Response frame format” with “8.6.13.3 TDLS Setup Response Action field format” |
| 2752 | 180 | 9.31.7 | Change to "RESPONSE\_INDICATION set to Long Response" | as commented | Accepted-Agree in principle.  |
| 2424 |  |  | The point of saying "6 or 2" is unclear | Either change it to "2 or 6" (4 instances) or clarify the intent in some way | Revised- Agree in principle. Please add some notes the total octets of A1 and A2 is 8.TGah editor to make changes shown in 11-14-0551r0 under the heading for CID 2424. |

**Propose:**

Revised for CID 1821, 2381, 1679, 1680, 1416, 2383, 1990, 2421, 2424, per discussion and editing instructions in 11-14/0551r0.

***TGah editor: Modify the sub-clause 8.3.1.5 as the following:***

8.3.1.5 PS-Poll frame format

…

The BSSID is the address of the STA contained in the AP. The TA field is the address of the STA transmitting the frame. The Duration/ID field contains Duration as determined according to 8.2.5 (Duration/ID field (QoS STA)) if the PS-Poll is sent as the initial frame of a Speed Frame exchange by S1G STAs; otherwise, the Duration/ID field contains AID. ~~The Duration/ID field contains Duration if the PS-Poll is sent as the initial frame of a Speed Frame exchange by S1G STAs; otherwise, the Duration/ID field contains AID.~~

~~When the Duration/ID field contains a duration, the value for the field is determined according to 8.2.5 (Duration/ID field (QoS STA)).~~

***TGah editor: Modify the sub-clause 8.3.1.19 as the following:***

8.3.1.~~19~~ 20 VHT NDP Announcement frame format

…

For S1G band, the same NDP announcement frame is used for sounding exchange, with "VHT" replaced by "S1G", and the format of the STA Info field is shown in Figure 8-29k1 with the following exception:

—In Table 8-18a(STA Info subfields), Nc index field shall not indicate a value that is more than 4.

***TGah editor: Modify the sub-clause 8.3.1.21 as the following:***

8.3.1.22 TACK frame format

…

The Beacon Sequence field contains ~~the current value of the Change Sequence variable of the transmitting STA.~~ the value of the Change Sequence Field from the most recently transmitted Beacon frame.

…

The Next TWT field contains the value of the TSF timer corresponding to the next scheduled TWT SP for the STA that is the intended recipient of the frame. The Next TWT field is optionally present if the Next TWT Present field is ~~set to~~ 1 in the FC field. Otherwise, the field is not present in the TACK frame.

***TGah editor: Modify the sub-clause 8.2.4.1.3 as the following:***

8.2.4.1.3 Type and Subtype fields

…

The Poll Type field is 2 bits in length. (#14/0126r1) The following indication is only valid when Power Management field is ~~set to~~ 1. Otherwise, (#14/0126r1) the Poll Type bits are reserved.

3.3 Abbreviations and acronyms

***TGah editor: Insert the following abbreviations into 3.3 in alphabetic order:***

SID short identifier

***TGah editor: Modify the sub-clause 8.7.2 as the following:***

8.7.2 General short frame format

Figure 8-532a (Short frame format) depicts the general short MAC frame format. The first three fields (Frame Control, A1 and A2) and the last field FCS are always present in short frames. The Sequence Control, A3, A4 and Frame body fields are optionally present. Each field is defined in 8.7.3 (Short frame fields).

NOTE — In Figure 8-532a (Short frame format), a total octets of A1 and A2 fields is 8.

***TGah editor: Insert the following paragraph at the end of the sub-clause 8.5.24.4 as the following:***

* Synch Control frame format

The Sync Control field is defined in 8.4.1.53 (Sync Control field).

***TGah editor: Insert the following paragraph at the end of the sub-clause 8.5.24.5 as the following:***

* STA Information Announcement frame format

The AID Announcement element field contains an AID Announcement element as specified in 8.4.2.170r (AID Announcement element).

***TGah editor: Insert the following paragraph at the end of the sub-clause 8.5.24.6 as the following:***

* EDCA Parameters Set frame format

The Category field is set to the value for S1G, specified in Table 8-38 (Category values).

The S1G Action field is set to the value for EDCA Parameter Set, specified in Table 8-363a (S1G Action field values).

The EDCA Parameter Set element field contains an EDCA Parameter Set element as specified in 8.4.2.28 (EDCA Parameter Set element).

***TGah editor: Insert the following paragraph at the end of the sub-clause 8.5.24.7 as the following:***

* Activity Specification frame format

The Category field is set to the value for S1G, specified in Table 8-38 (Category values).

The S1G Action field is set to the value for Activity Specification, specified in Table 8-363a (S1G Action field values).

The Activity Specification element field contains an Activity Specification element as specified in 8.4.2.170u (Activity Specification element).

***TGah editor: Insert the following paragraph at the end of the sub-clause 8.5.24.10 as the following:***

* Group ID List frame format

The Sectorized Group ID List element field contains a Sectorized Group ID List as specified in 8.4.2.170v (Sectorized Group ID List element).

***TGah editor: Change Table 8-23 and add the notes below the Table as the following:***

8.3.2.1 Data frame format

|  |
| --- |
| **Table 8-23—Address field contents** |
| **To DS** | **From DS** | **Address 1** | **Address 2** | **Address 3** | **Address 4** |
| **MSDU case** | **A-MSDU case** | **MSDU case** | **A-MSDU case** |
| 0 | 0 | RA = DA | TA = SA | BSSID | BSSID | N/A | N/A |
| 0 | 1 | RA ~~= DA~~ (see NOTE 1) | TA = BSSID | SA | BSSID | N/A | N/A |
| 1 | 0 | RA = BSSID | TA ~~= SA~~ (see NOTE 2) | DA | BSSID | N/A | N/A |
| 1 | 1 | RA | TA | DA | BSSID | SA | BSSID |

NOTE 1~~Note~~- Address 1 field of a frame with To DS set to 0 and From DS set to 1 is equal to the DA, except when an individually addressed A-MSDU frame is used in DMS and Relay, in which case, the destination address of the frame is included in the DA field of the A-MSDU subframe (see 10.23.15 and 9.48 (Relay operation)).

NOTE 2~~Note~~- Address 2 field of a frame with To DS set to 1 and From DS set to 0 is equal to the SA, except when an individually addressed A-MSDU frame is used in Relay, in which case, the source address of the frame is included in the SA field of the A-MSDU subframe (see 9.48 (Relay operation)).

***TGah editor: Modify the sub-clause 4.14 as the following:***

4.14 Target w~~W~~ake t~~T~~ime

Target w~~W~~ake t~~T~~ime (TWT) is a function that permits an AP to define a specific time or set of times (i.e., TWT values) for individual STAs to access the medium. The AP conveys the TWT value(s) to each participating STA within specific frames. ~~Some of the frames containing TWT values are response frames, the use of which allows for minimal wake activity between successive STA accesses of the medium.~~ TWT values can be periodic or aperiodic. The use of periodic TWT values further reduces the amount of wake time for a STA by eliminating the need to send a TWT value at each wake interaction. The STA and the AP exchange information that includes an expected activity duration to allow the AP to control the amount of contention and overlap among competing STAs. The AP can protect the expected duration of activity with various protection mechanisms. The use of TWT is negotiated between an AP and a STA.

***TGah editor: Modify the heading of sub-clause 4.15 as the following:***

**4.15 Speed f~~F~~rame e~~E~~xchange**