IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| LB 200 Comment Resolution for Miscellaneus Part 1 |
| Date: 2014-03-03 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Alfred Asterjadhi | Qualcomm Inc. | 5775 Morehouse Dr, San Diego, CA 92109 | +1-858-658-5302 | aasterja@qti.qualcomm.com |
| Amin Jafarian | Qualcomm Inc. |  |  | jafarian@qti.qualcomm.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for comments that impact multiple clauses of TGah Draft 1.1 with the following CIDs:

1175, 1073, 1676, 1715, 1185, 1455

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGah Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGah Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGah Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGah Editor” are instructions to the TGah editor to modify existing material in the TGah draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGah editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGah Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **P.L** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 1175 | 152.22 | 9.3.2.1 | "Duration Indication field set to 0"No. No. No.If the intent was to mislead readers, then you have succeeded magnificently.Apparently this field indicates the presence of a Duration Indication when set to zero. | Rename it the "No Duration Indication" field. Or redefine the encoding so that it is set to 1 when it indicates a duration is present. | Revised – Agree in principle with the commenter. For NDP (Modified) ACK frames when the Duration Indication field is set to 1 the value of the Duration field indicates an Idle Period. Hence, the proposed resolution is to rename “Duration Indication” as “Idle Indication”.TGah Editor to replace “Duration Indication”with “Idle Indication” throughout the 802.11ah Draft to become D2.0. |
| 1073 | 51.18 | 8.3.5 | "Modified Ack". The standard stands alone, not in the context of its own history. That explains why words like "legacy" and "modified" have no meaning. | Replace "Modified Ack" with a more descriptive term. | Revised – Agree with commenter. Given that the NDP Modified Ack is sent as a response to an NDP PS-Poll frame the proposed resolution is to re-name it as NDP PS-Poll-Ack.TGah Editor to replace “NDP Modified ACK” with “NDP PS-Poll-Ack” and “NDP (Modified) ACK” with NDP (PS-Poll-)Ack” throughout the 802.11ah Draft to become D2.0. TGah Editor to add the following new definition in subclause 3.3 (Abbreviations and acronyms): “ NDP (PS-Poll-)Ack NDP Ack or NDP PS-Poll-Ack”. |
| 1676 | 37.13 | 8.2.5.2 | "ACK" (as a word) has been replaced with "Ack" throughout 11mc. | Replace "ACK" (as separate word, including in the name "NDP ACK") with "Ack" throughout the draft. | Accepted –TGah Editor to make the changes proposed by the commenter throughout the 802.11ah Draft to become D2.0. |
| 1715 | 157.18 | 9.3.2.8 | In 802.11mc the "Ack" in the name of the Ack frame only uses an initial cap. | Replace "ACK" (as separate word, including in the name "NDP ACK") with "Ack" throughout the draft. | Accepted –TGah Editor to make the changes proposed by the commenter throughout the 802.11ah Draft to become D2.0. |
| 1185 | 158.01 | 9.3.2.8 | "When dot11S1GOptionImplemented is set to true"Please read the WG11 style guide. "is set to" is reserved for the act of setting something, not testing it. | " When dot11S1GOptionImplemented is true" suffices.Review all "set to" in the draft and reword any that relate to testing a value, i.e., is part of a condition. | Accepted –TGah Editor to make the changes proposed by the commenter throughout the 802.11ah Draft to become D2.0. |
| 1455 | 144.30 | 8.7.4.2 | The Next TWT field in the BAT frame is optionally present which means that the length of this control response frame can be either 26 or 32 bytes. Hence, it is not clear what value the STA soliciting a BAT frame should use to calculate the Duration field of the soliciting frame. In addition it creates problems for RID setting of third party STAs as they assume a 32 byte long control response to calculate their RID. To avoid these ambiguities simply have BAT frames of 32 bytes. Similar considerations hold for the TACK frame defined in 8.3.1.21. | unify the length of control response frames | Revised – Note: This CID was already addressed in doc 14/0040r1 and has passed pre-motion. But the CID was missing in the document header. And, hence this CID was missing in the document with motions that were accepted during the January F2F. Below resolution is copied from 14/0040r1 and the instructions to the editor refer to the same document which has already been accepted in the January F2F:“Agree with the commenter. Proposed resolution is to clarify that the Next TWT field is present in BAT frames. As for TACK frames the length of the control response may change upon request of the eliciting STA as specified in 9.42.4.TGah editor to make changes shown in 14/0040r1 under the heading for CIDs from 1169 to 2552.” |