IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Some LB 199 Proposed Comment Resolutions | | | | |
| Date: 2014-02-07 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Dorothy Stanley | Aruba Networks | 1322 Crossman ave, Sunnyvale, CA | +1 408 227 4500 | [dstanley@arubanetworks.com](mailto:dstanley@arubanetworks.com) |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Proposed resolutions to the CIDs in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-1160-05-000m-lb199-gen-adhoc-comments.xls> are included in this document:

“Personal vs Directional” tab: 2212, 2204, 2201, 2200 – resolutions agreed 2014-02-07

“11ad related” tab: CID 2183 – Still open, action assigned to Adrian

**CIDs 2212, 2200 (GEN)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 2212 | 20.06 | 3.1 |  |  | "personal control point" also is a misnomer for the directional control point. That name should be "directional control point". | Replace "personal" in "personal ... control point" with "directional", so "PCP" is replaced with "DCP" throughout the draft.. |
| 2200 | 1.61 | 1.3 |  |  | "Personal" is a use of a network, not a type of 802.11 network, and certainly is not an alternative to independent and infrastructure networks. On the other hand, the DMG network is a directional network, which is an alternative to independent and infrastructure networks. | Replace "personal" here with "directional". |

**Discussion:**

Discussion in LA (4.8.1.4 and 4.8.2) on similar comment 2210 resulted in

REJECTED: Personal is a descriptive term that reflects the anticipated use cases.

**Proposed Resolution: Rejected**

Personal is a descriptive term that reflects the anticipated use cases.

**CID 2204**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 2204 | 9.43 | 3.1 |  |  | A contention based access period is defined here to be in a DMG BSS. However, as mentioned in another definition, a DMG BSS might be an infrastructure, independent (IBSS) or directional BSS. Do such contention based access periods also apply to DMG IBSSs and DMG infrastructure BSSs? | Either include a statement whether contention based access periods also apply to DMG IBSSs and infrastructure BSSs or rename PBSS to "directional BSS (DBSS)" and limit this definition to DBSSs. |

**Discussion:**

**The cited text is below:**

****

The “other definition” is in 4.3.3:



**Proposed Resolution: Rejected**

The CBAP applies to all DMG BSSs, whether PBSS, infrastructure BSS or IBSS, when EDCA is used. The definition is as stated in the CBAP definition, and no further clarification is needed.

Personal is a descriptive term that reflects the anticipated use cases.

**CID 2201**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 2201 | 6.26 | 3.1 |  |  | An access period is defined here to be in a DMG BSS. However, as mentioned in another definition, a DMG BSS might be an infrastructure, independent (IBSS) or directional BSS. Do such access periods also apply to DMG IBSSs and DMG infrastructure BSSs? | Either include a statement whether these access periods also apply to DMG IBSSs and infrastructure BSSs, or rename PBSS to "directional BSS (DBSS)" and limit this definition to DBSSs. |

**Discussion:**

**The cited text is below:**



**Proposed Resolution: Rejected**

The access period applies to all DMG BSSs, whether PBSS, infrastructure BSS or IBSS, with associated channel access rules. The definition is as stated in the “access period” definition, and no further clarification is needed.

Personal is a descriptive term that reflects the anticipated use cases.

**CID 2183**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 2183 | 2383.00 | B.4.24.1 |  |  | Invalid or bogus references at: 2386.10 (8.4.2.111.2), 2386.11 (11.3), 2386.15 (8.4.2.145), 2386.23 (9.13a9.14), 2387.31 (9.4.2.138), 2387.35 (8.4.2.140), 2387.44 & 2387.57 (8.4.2.138), 2392.55 (8.4.2.138), 2392.59 (8.4.2.140), 2393.07 (8.4.2.138), 2393.11 (8.4.2.140) |

**Discussion:**

**The cited text is below:**



11ad had “8.4.2.137.2, 10.3, 9.12.2, 8.4.2.148” as the references for DMG-M4.4.

The current mc cell has “8.4.2.111.2, 11.3 (Authentication using a password), 8.4.2.145 (Dynamic Tone Pairing (DTP) Report element)

There is no “8.4.2.137.2”, just 8.4.2.137. Should be 8.4.2.127.2 (DMG STA Capability Info field)

10.3 is still 10.3 – STA authentication and association – delete, not relevant

9.12.2, is still 9.12.2 A-MPDU length limit rules

8.4.2.148 is now 8.2.4.145

At 2383.10, change the DMG-M4.4 reference list to include “8.4.2.127.2, 9.12.2, 8.2.4.145”

The next one:



11ad had “9.13a” as the reference for DMG-M5, “DMG A-PPDU Aggregation. In 11mc, this is section 9.14

At 2386.23, change the DMG-M5 reference to “9.14”.

The next one:



11ad had 9.33.6.2, 8.4.2.141, 8.4.2.143.

9.33.6.2 is now 9.34.6.2

8.4.2.141 is now 8.4.2.138 and 8.4.2.143 is now 8.4.2.140, but these seem unrelated to SP allocation.

8.4.2.136 DMG TSPEC element is a better reference

Change to include the SP allocation reference and 8.4.2.136.

The next one

****

The 11mc list correctly reflects what was in 11ad. 8.4.2.136 DMG TSPEC element is a better reference than 8.4.2.138. Replace.

The next one:

****

11ad had 9.33.6.2, 9.33.6.3 and 8.4.2.141. The commenter notes the 8.4.2.138=8.4.2.141 reference.

Suggest deleting the 8.4.2.138=8.4.2.141 reference, replacing with 8.4.2.136 “DMG TSPEC element” and correcting the duplicate 9.34.6.2 references, replacing with 9.34.6.2 and 9.34.6.3.

The next one:

****

The 11mc list correctly reflects what was in 11ad. ADDBA and PCP Handover elements are unrelated.

Suggest deleting the 8.4.2.138 and 8.4.2.140 references, replacing with 8.4.2.136.

And the last one:



The 11mc list correctly reflects what was in 11ad. Suggest deleting the 8.4.2.138 and 8.4.2.140 references, replacing with 8.4.2.136.

**Action (2014-02-07): 11ad published version entries not all valid. Adrian to validate with prior versions of 11ad.**

**Proposed Resolution: Revised**

At 2383.10, change the DMG-M4.4 reference list to include “8.4.2.127.2, 9.12.2, 8.2.4.145”

At 2386.23, change the DMG-M5 reference to “9.14”.

At 2387.27, delete 8.4.2.138 and 8.4.2.140 and insert 8.4.2.136 in the DMG-M7.3.1 reference list.

At 2387.44, delete 8.4.2.138 and insert 8.4.2.136 in the DMG-M7.3.2 reference list.

At 2387.49, delete 8.4.2.138 and insert 8.4.2.136 in the DMG-M7.3.3 reference list and change the second 9.34.6.2 reference to 9.34.6.3.

At 2392.55 delete 8.4.2.138 and 8.4.2.140 and insert 8.4.2.136 in the DMG-M7.12.1 reference list.

At 2393.7 delete 8.4.2.138 and 8.4.2.140 and insert 8.4.2.136 in the DMG-M7.12.2 reference list.

**References:**