IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| D1.0 Comment Resolutions on CID 3378 and 3356 | | | | |
| Date: 2014-01-22 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jae Seung Lee | ETRI | 161 Gajeong-dong,  Yuseong-gu, Daejeon, Korea | +82 42 860 1326 | jasonlee@etri.re.kr |
| Minho Cheong | ETRI | 161 Gajeong-dong,  Yuseong-gu, Daejeon, Korea | +82 42 860 5635 | [minho@etri.re.kr](mailto:minho@etri.re.kr) |
| Sok-kyu Lee | ETRI | 161 Gajeong-dong,  Yuseong-gu, Daejeon, Korea | +82 42 860 5919 | sk-lee@etri.re.kr |

Abstract

This document proposes resolutions on CIDs 3378 and 3356

Changes in the text refer to: Draft P802.11ai/D1.1

Comments (CID 3378 and 3356)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Proposed**  **Resolution** |
| 3378 | 10.1.4.3.2 | 72 | 40 | Figure 10-3d is not a legacy compatible. When a scanning STA is a legacy STA, it can ignore the broadcasted Probe Response frame, because IEEE 802.11 spec does not allow the broadcast transmission of the Probe Response frame for 15 years. So, you should mention that the broadcast transmission of the Probe Response is not allowed when the responder STA receives a Probe Request frame from a legacy STA. | For a backward compatibility, please add the following rule. The broadcast transmission of the Probe Response is not allowed when the responder STA receives a Probe Request frame from a legacy STA. | Revised  The comment is similar to CID 2778 which has been already resolved in November 2013 Dallas Meeting.  (See the discussion on CID 2778 in 11-13/1317r1.  Proposed text has been already merged into 11-13/1269r6 and passed motion in Nov 2013).  Additional text change to the previous approved text in November 2013 is not necessary. |
| 3356 | 10.1.4.3.2 | 72 | 40 | Figure 10-3d is not a legacy compatible. When a scanning STA is a legacy STA, it can ignore the broadcasted Probe Response frame, because IEEE 802.11 spec does not allow the broadcast transmission of the Probe Response frame for 15 years. So, you should mention that the broadcast transmission of the Probe Response is not allowed when the responder STA receives a Probe Request frame from a legacy STA. | For a backward compatibility, please add the following rule. The broadcast transmission of the Probe Response is not allowed when the responder STA receives a Probe Request frame from a legacy STA. | Revised  See Resolution of CID 3378  (Duplicated with CID 3378) |

Discussion

The comment is similar to the following CID (CID 2778) which has been already resolved in November 2013 Dallas Meeting.

*Reference: approved resolution to CID 2778*

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Proposed**  **Resolution** |
| *2778* | *10.1.4.3.9* | *76* | *50* | *This paragraph make non 11ai and Legacy station non std compliant, an 11ai AP with Dot11FILSActivated will send broadcast Probe Rsp, the ACTIVE SCAN procedure at a legacy or non 11ai STA will be "waiting on event" which is unicast (directed frame) and thus procedure will fail.* | *Limit transmission of Broadcast Probe Rsp to STA's indicating FILS support.* | *REVISED (TGai General: 2013-11-14 02:58:45Z)  The commenter is right.  Changed the text accordingly.  Adopt  https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/13/11-13-1269-06-00ai-active-scanning-text.docx* |

Detailed discussion on CID 2778 is in 11-13/1317r1, and the proposed text during previous meeting has been already merged into 11-13/1269r6 and passed motion in Nov 2013.

The following text has been approved during last Dallas meeting (by Doc.11-13/1269r6):

**10.1.4.3.4 Sending a response to probe request**

A STA in which dot11FILSActivated is true that transmits a Probe Response frame shall either set the Address 1 field to the address of the STA that generated the probe request or shall set it to the broadcast address if the STA that generated the probe request is indicating FILS Capability. The Address 1 field shall be set to the address of the STA that generated the probe request if the STA is not indicating FILS Capability.

A STA in which dot11FILSActivated is false that transmits a Probe Response frame shall set the Address 1 field to the address of the STA that generated the probe request.

The above text has been already approved, and additional changes are not necessary.

**Proposed resolution**:

Revised

See the discussion on CID 2778 in 11-13/1317r1.Proposed text has been merged into 11-13/1269r6 and already passed motion in Nov 2013 meeting.

Additional text change to the previous approved text in November 2013 is not necessary.