IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| LB 200 clause 8.4.2.170f comment resolution |
| Date: 2014-01-20 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| George Calcev  | Huawei |  |  | George.Calcev@huawei.com |
| James Wang  | MediaTek |  |  | james.wang@meddiatek.com  |
| Minho Cheong | ETRI |  |  | minho@etri.re.kr  |
| Yongho Seok | LGE |  |  | yongho.seok@lge.com |
| Younghoon Kwon | Huawei |  |  | younghoon.kwon@huawei.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes comment resolutions of the clause 8.4.2.170f from TGah Draft 1.0.

* CIDs: 1134-1136, 2325-2328, 2839-2840

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGah Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGah Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGah Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGah Editor” are instructions to the TGah editor to modify existing material in the TGah draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGah editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGah Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 1134 | 8.4.2.170f | 94 | "Sector Operation element"802.11ad has a lot of stuff to do with sectors. This is a completely different kind of model. | Rename element "S1G Sector Operation element"Review the names of all S1G elements, and prefix with "SIG" where they relate to concepts specific to S1G. | Accept |
| 1135 | 8.4.2.170f | 94 | ".. the duration of the current sector transmissions and it is measured in 10 milliseconds time units."Somewhat awkward. Also doesn't follow style for a value/unit pair. | Replace with " the duration of the current sector transmissions, in units of 10 ms"Change 94.45 to match. | Accept |
| 1136 | 8.4.2.170f | 95 | "provided in Association Response when dot11S1GSectorizationActivated"" the station in the Association Response message."An "Association Response frame" is always exactly that. Not a message, not a empty <type of thing>. | Review all "Association Response" and ensure it is followed by "frame".Also insert missing article in first cited sentence.Review all <name of frame> used in the draft (e.g. RTS, CTS, Ack, Beacon, Association Request, Probe Request ...) and ensure:1. They are initial capitals2. That they are followed by "frame", and remove any "message" following. | Accept |
| 2325 | 8.4.2.170f | 94 | The format of the Sector Operation element has two descriptions depending on sectorization type. The sentence here, refering to only one type, is confusing. | Change to, "The format of the Sector Operation element is as presented in Figure 8-401cv or as presented in Figure 8-401cw, depending on the setting of the Sectorization Type field." | Accept |
| 2326 | 8.4.2.170f | 94 | The sentence "When the Sectorization Type isset to 0, it indicates group sectorization operation" seems like only a partial description, and is confusing. | Change sentence to, "The Sectorization Type field is set to 0 to indicate group sectorization operation, and the use of this format for the Sector Operation element." | Counter |
| 2327 | 8.4.2.170f | 94 | Format this "Note" sentence as a Note. | Format in the style of "NOTE -- ..." | Accept |
| 2328 | 8.4.2.170f | 95 | Format this "Note" sentence as a Note. | Format in the style of "NOTE -- ..." | Accept |
| 2839 | 8.4.2.170f | 94 | The unit of sector duration set to 10 ms is too long since each sector in the 3-sectors BSS has a chance of transmission on every 30 ms. It will impact the latency of QoS services. | Please clarify this issue or change the design. | Reject |
| 2840 | 8.4.2.170f | 95 | "Period duration" is not defined. | Suggest to change "Period duration" to "Period field" | Accept |

**CID1134**

**Discussion:**

Commenter suggests changing name of Sector Operation Element to S1G Sector Operation Element to aovid confusion with names in 11ad.

**Propose:**

Accept.

*Instruct the editor to replace Sector Operation Element with SiG Sector Operation Element in P94L9 and throughout the text.*

**CID1135**

**Discussion:**

Commenter suggests changing the text ".. the duration of the current sector transmissions and it is measured in 10 milliseconds time units." with " the duration of the current sector transmissions, in units of 10 ms"

**Propose:**

Accept.

*Instruct the editor to make the suggested change in P94L62 and change 9.45 to match the proposed text.*

**CID1136**

**Discussion:**

Commenter suggests changing the text to make sure that the “Association response” is followed by the word “frame” and that the word “message” is removed. Also he suggests to make sure that all abbreviations use capitalized letters.

**Propose:**

Accept.

*Instruct the editor to review all "Association Response" and ensure it is followed by "frame" in P95L1.*

Also insert missing article in first cited sentence.Review all <name of frame> used in the draft (e.g. RTS, CTS, Ack, Beacon, Association Request, Probe Request ...) and ensure:

1. They are initial capitals

2. That they are followed by "frame” and remove any "message" following.

**CID2325**

**Discussion:**

Commenter suggests some editorial changes.

**Propose:**

Accept

*Instruct the editor to make the following change in P94L17.*

The format of the Sector Operation element is presented in Figure 8-401cv (Sector Operation element (Sectorization Type is group sectorization)) and Figure 8-401cw (Sector Operation element (Sectorization Type is TXOP-based sectorization)).

**CID2326**

**Discussion:**

Commenter suggests modifying the sentence inP94L41 so that it is complete description.

**Propose:**

Counter.

*Instruct the editor to make the following change in P94L41.*

The Sectorization Type is 1 bit length and specifies the type of sectorization. When the Sectorization Type is set to 0, it indicates the format of Sector Operation element is for group sectorization operation.

*Instruct the editor to make the following change in P95L51.*

The Sectorization Type field is set to 1 to indicate the format of Sector Operation element is for TXOP-based sectorization operation.

**CID2327 and CID2328**

**Discussion:**

Commenter suggests modifying the sentence in P95L51 and P94L42 into the style of a Note.

**Propose:**

Accept.

*Instruct the editor to make the following change in P95L51.*

Note - The Sectorization Type can be set to 1 only when the AP Sectorized Beam-Capable setting is 1 or 3.

*Additionally, instruct the editor to make the following change in P94L42.*

Note - The Sectorization Type can be set to 0 only when the AP Sectorized Beam-Capable setting is either 2 or 3.

**CID2839**

**Discussion:**

The reviewer makes the observation that “the unit of sector duration set to 10 ms is too long since each sector in the 3-sectors BSS has a chance of transmission on every 30 ms. It will impact the latency of QoS services.”

**Propose:**

Reject.

The sectorization operation, as well as any grouping type or scheduling such RAW inherently spread the access in time in order to address the hidden node problem or a surge in association request for instance. If the device operation does not allow latency values higher than 20ms (the minimum number of sectors is 2) the group sectorization should not be used. In addition, a single transmission of a long packet at low rate could take rather long time; therefore having sector duration too short might not allow such transmissions.

**CID2840**

**Discussion:**

The reviewer proposes to change “Period duration” with period field”

**Propose:**

Accept.

*Instruct the editor to change the “Period duration” with “Period field” in P95L4*