IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Comment Resolution for Miscellaneous | | | | |
| Date: 2013-09-18 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Amin Jafarian | Qualcomm  Inc. | 5775 Morehouse Dr  San Diego,  CA 92109 | 1-858-651-9464 | Jafarian@qti.qualcomm.com |
| Chittabrata Ghosh | Nokia | 2075 Allston Way, Suite 200, Berkeley, CA 94704 | 1-650-200-7566 | chittabrata.ghosh@nokia.com |

Abstract

This document provides resolution for CIDs:

113 498 526 541 797 798 635 642 643 644 770 775 126 799 99 130 124 308 637 640 753

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | P | L | Sub C. | Comment | Propose Change | Resolution |
| 113 | 84 | 38 | 8.4.2.170f | Sentence "Sector Operation element may be provided in Association Response when dot11S1GSectorization-Activated is true and it indicates the GrpID allocated to that station to be used during for the sectorization purpose...". | Remove "for" | Accept:  TGah editor to make changes as proposed in the comment CID 113 |
| 498 | 1 | 31 | 3.3 | There are two definition of "SF" in this document. One is "Speed Frame" in 8.2.4.2, 8.2.5.2, and 9.32i, another is "Scaling Factor" in subclause 8.4.1.6, 8.4.2.78 and 8.4.2.81. One of them shall be changed to avoid ambiguity. | Change the definition of "SF" to "Scaling Factor", and use "Speed Frame" instead of "SF" in subclause 8.2.4.2, 8.2.5.2, and 9.32i. | Revised -  TGah editor to make the following changes to the draft as the last change:  In subclause 8.4.1.6 Listen Interval field and in subclause 8.4.2.78 BSS Max Idle Period element change the following:  Remove occurrences of “(SF)”.  Replace the occurrences of “SF” with “Scaling Factor”. |
| 526 | 24 | 1 | 6.3 | Following MLME and MLME-SAP interface definitions are necessary. - TWT - SST - Sectorized Beam - Dynamic AID - Activity Specification | Add the following MLME and MLME-SAP interface definitions. - TWT - SST - Sectorized Beam - Dynamic AID - Activity Specification  See 11/13-0668r0 for proposed changes. | Reject:  Provided resolution is not complete. In the provided document 13/668r0, there is no resolution provided for CID 526. |
| 541 | 84 | 36 | 8.4.2.170f | dot11S1GSectorization-Activated is a typo of "dot11S1GSectorizationActivated" | Correct to "dot11S1GSectorizationActivated" | Accept:  TGah editor to make changes as proposed in the comment CID 541 |
| 797 | 160 | 8 | 9.32n.3 | No detail of access control mechanism can be found. | Current draft is premature to specific comments. | Reject:  There is no ambiguity since the STA will follow EDCA rules before access the medium |
| 798 | 160 | 8 | 9.32n.3 | No detail of access protection mechanism other than TXOP sharing can be found. | Current draft is premature to specific comments. | Reject:  There is a protection: by setting the Response\_Indication, STA can ptotect the TXOP sharing. |
| 635 | 83 | 62 | 8.4.2.170f | duplicated figure title | Delete line 62 to line 65 on page 83 | Accept:  TGah editor to make changes as proposed in the comment CID 635 |
| 642 | 84 | 51 | 8.4.2.170f | The first sentence in the paragraph in line 51 page 84 is very long and very difficult to understand. Would like to suggest some re-wording. | Replace the first sentence in the paragraph line 51 page 84 by the following text:  The Sector Operation element in the Beacon will provide:  -- information related to the type of sectorization;  -- indication if the Beacon is sectorized or not;  -- the Sector ID of the current sector;  -- the GrpID that identifies the group allowed transmitting during the currenct sector duration; and  -- the duration of this sector | Accept:  TGah editor to make changes as proposed in the comment CID 642 |
| 643 | 84 | 1 | 8.4.2.170f | In Figure 8-401cv, cannot see any reason to have a 8-bit reserved field, except for extendibility. However, for an element design, do we really need to keep some some revserved bytes as element itself has a lenghth field? | remove the Reserved 8-bit field in Figure Figure 8-401cv | Accept:  TGah editor to make changes as proposed in the comment CID 643 |
| 644 | 85 | 12 | 8.4.2.170f | Similarly, the "TBD" of the size of the Sectorization Scheme needs to be defined in Figure 8-401cw. A simple way is to keep it consistent with the same info field in the Sector Capability element, i.e., 2 bits. | in line 12 page 85, change the TBD to 2, for the size of the Sectorization Scheme field. | Revised:  TGah editor to make changes as proposed in the comment CID 644; also, modify the number of Reserved bits to 3 in order to complete the octet configuration |
| 770 | 84 | 5 | 8.4.2.170f | TBD in the figure, secterization scheme bit. | TBD | Accept:  Same resolution as for CID 644 above |
| 775 | 36 | 1 | 8.3.3.2 | IEEE1588 type TX TOD timestamp of previous TSF time stamp element is instrumental for power saving. | TOD time stamp of beacon TX at AP should be able to be included in beacon body. | Reject:  The provided resolution is not complete. |
| 126 |  |  |  | Access Network Options is given in Figure 8-386--Access Network Options field format and not in Figure 8-352. The Interworking Element appears in Section 8.4.2.91 and not in 8.4.2.94. | Correct the references | Revised  TGah editor replace 8.4.2.94 with 8.4.2.91 throughout the TGah draft. |
| 799 | 164 | 22 | 9.32r | More description of expecting behavior after eliciting response has to be included. | Provide expecting behavior. | Rejected  This is an invalid comment. Comment does not specify the problem and the suggestion for solution.  Also, sub-clause 9.32r was deleted from draft 0.1. |
| 99 | 4 | 53 | 4.11c | The sentence "...among competing STA." | Replace "STA" with "STAs". | Accepted –  TGah editor to make changes provided by commenter. |
| 130 | 150 | 25 | 9.32m.1 | Stations are allowed to move from a sector to another. | Indicate the appropriate signaling that enables this movement. | Rejected –  The commenter fails to identify an issue (not clear if the commenter refers to physical movement in which case it is out of scope of this std how signaling is done). Note that subclause 9.32m.1 already include the required signaling for correct operation of STAs that support sectorization. |
| 124 | 133 | 5 | 9.19.4a.4 | In the current draft it says that an AP sends a Resource Allocation frame in the beginning of a RAW | Clarify how a Resource Allocation Frame can be sent in the beginning of a RAW since this will change the RAW start time. | Revised –  Agree with the commenter. But this has already been addressed in the draft. Please refer to doc 1134r0. |
| 308 | 130 | 29 | 9.19.4a.1 | """But, a STA not within the group indicated by the RAW Group field in the RPS element shall not access the WM for the RAW duration, except for a STA that is allowed not to check the beacon (e.g. non-TIM STA).""  A TIM STA that is not in the page of the beacon will not check the beacon. When the TIM STA has frames for the AP, Can the TIM STA transmit the frames in the RAW that is not in the STA's beacon interval?" |  | Rejected –  The commenter fails to identify an issue. In response to the commenter the TIM STA cannot transmit in a RAW that is not assigned to it. |
| 637 | 80 | 23 | 8.4.2.170f | imcomplete specification about the Omni bit, e.g., how is it set? | "Change the paragraph in line 23 page 84 to the following:  The Omni bit indicates if the present transmission is sectorized or Omni. When it is set to 0, it indicates Sectorized. When it is set to 1, it indicates Omni." | Accepted –  TGah editor to make the changes proposed by the commenter. |
| 640 | 84 | 26 | 8.4.2.170f | system configuration parameter naming convention does not have a "dash". | in line 36 page 84, remove the dash, i.e., change "dot11S1GSectorization-Activated " to "dot11S1GSectorizationActivated " | Accepted –  TGah editor to make the changes proposed by the commenter. |
| 753 | 1 | 37 | 3.3 | Acronym SF that stand for Speed Frame seems to misleading because no "Speed Frame" itself exists but "Speed(y) Exchange". Furthermore, same acronym SF exists in this draft meaning "Scaling Factor" (page 54, 8.4.1.6. and after) | "SFE" (or other) may be preferable for "Speed Frame Exchange". | Revised -  TGah editor to make the following changes to the draft as the last change:  In subclause 8.4.1.6 Listen Interval field and in subclause 8.4.2.78 BSS Max Idle Period element change the following:  Remove occurrences of “(SF)”.  Replace the occurrences of “SF” with “Scaling Factor”. |