IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| TGah D0.1 Comment Resolutions |
| Date: September 16, 2013 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Chao-Chun Wang | MediaTek |  |  | Chaochun.wang@mediatek.com |
| James Yee  | MediaTek |  |  | james.yee@mediatek.com |

Abstract

These domument proposes resolutions for following comments of P802.11ah D0.1 Comment Correction (CC9) [1]. Specification Version #

MAC resolution for clause 8.2.4.1.11

CIDs: 340, 767, 626

MAC resolution for clause 8.2.4.1.2

CID: 361

MAC resolution for clause 8.2.4.1.4

CID: 339

MAC resolution for clause 8.3.1.19

CIDs: 342, 372, 936

MAC resolution for clause 8.3.3.2

CIDs: 487, 394, 630

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Number** | **Page** | **Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed Changes** |
| 340 | 8.2.4.1.11 | 29 | 38 | Better wording. | Change "together identify the bandwidth negotiation of the TXOP" to "are used to negotiate the bandwidth of the TXOP" |
| 767 | 8.2.4.1.11 | 29 | 39 | Clarify the meaning of Dynamic Indication Encoding and its relation of to PHY MIB. | Describe the (possible) relation to SST or TXVECTOR in term of Table 8-4b if exist. And clarify the meaning of "TXOP bandwidth". |
| 626 | 8.2.4.1.11 | 29 | 36 | Should indicate this is for the S1G somewhere in the text. | Change the title to "S1G Bandwidth indication and dynamic indication fields" |

**Discussion:**

CID 340: agree with the comment and revise the text as suggested

**Proposed Response:**

Revised

*(Instruction to TGah Editor) revised the sentense as follows;*

**[clause** 8.2.4.1.11, page 29, lines 44-45**]**

The Bandwidth Indication and Dynamic Indication fields ~~together identify the bandwidth negotiation~~ are used to negotiate the bandwidth of ~~the~~ a TXOP.

**Discussion:**

CID 767:

The description may not be clear to some readers. The text is revised to provide better description of the fields.

**Proposed Response:**

Revised

*(Instruction to TGah Editor) revised the sentense as follows;*

**[clause** 8.2.4.1.11, page 29, lines 45-49**]**

The Bandwidth Indication and Dynamic Indication fields together identify the bandwidth negotiation of the TXOP.

Table 8-2a (Bandwidth Indication encoding) defines the ~~valid~~ bandwidth ~~indication~~ used for exchanging PPDUs between a TXOP initiator and a TXOP responder. Table 8-2b (Dynamic Indication encoding) indicates ~~defines~~ ~~the dynamic/static indication~~ whether the bandwidth used for exchanging PPDUs in a TXOP is static or can change dynamically. When the dynamic indication is set to 1, the TXOP initiator wants to negotiate TXOP bandwidth with the TXOP responder.

**Discussion:**

CID 626:

[Commenter] Should indicate this is for the S1G somewhere in the text.

The commentor has the good intention to make the section more clear that the field is for S1G frame only.

The section is a subsection of 8.2.4.1 Frame Control field.

Since it is clearly stated that

“The Control frames transmitted by S1G STAs are called S1G Control frames.” And “The remaining subfields of the Frame Control field also depend on the setting of the Type and Subtype subfields.”

It is not necessary to further state the obvious explicitly.

**Proposed Response:**

Rejected

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Number** | **Page** | **Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed Changes** |
| 361 | 8.2.4.1.2 | 27 | 14 | The correct conjunction is "and" | change "and" to "or" |

**Discussion:**

CID 361: agree with the comment and revise the text as suggested

**Proposed Response:**

Revised

*(Instruction to TGah Editor) revised the sentense as follows;*

**[clause** 8.2.4.1.2, page 27, lines 14**]**

for regular MAC frames per 8.2 (MAC frame formats for regular frames) ~~or~~ and 1 for short MAC frames per 8.7 (MAC frame format for short frames). All other values are reserved.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Number** | **Page** | **Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed Changes** |
| 339 | 8.2.4.1.4 | 29 | 27 | Better wording. | Change "This standard defines procedures forusing this combination of field values only in a mesh BSS, or a BSS with Relay" to "This standard defines procedures for using this combination of field values in mesh BSSs and by Relays." |

**Discussion:**

CID 339: agree with the comment and revise the text as suggested

**Proposed Response:**

Revised

*(Instruction to TGah Editor) revised the sentense as follows;*

**[clause** 8.2.4.1.4, page 29, lines 35-37**]**

This standard defines procedures for using this combination of field values ~~only~~ in ~~a~~ mesh BSSs ~~, or a BSS with Relay~~ and by Relays.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Number** | **Page** | **Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed Changes** |
| 342 | 8.3.1.19 | 32 | 41 | S1G should appear in the subclause heading name so that people can find the S1G NDP Announcement frame | As per the comment |
| 372 | 8.3.1.19 | 32 |  | The "Duration/AID" field in Figure 8-18 is inconsistent with the "Duration/ID" in the paragraph. | Replace "Duration/AID" with "Duration/ID" in Figure 8-18. |
| 936 | 8.3.1.19 | 32 | 53 | Typo? | In Figure 8-29k1 "AID13" should be "AID" |

**Discussion:**

CID 342: agree with the comment and revise the text as suggested

**Proposed Response:**

Revised

*(Instruction to TGah Editor) revised the sentense as follows;*

**[clause** 8.3.1.19, page 32, lines 54**]**

**8.3.1.19 ~~VHT~~ S1G NDP Announcement frame format**

**Discussion:**

CID 372: It is unclear what’s the commentor is addressing with this comment.

There is no table 8-18. The only place has Duration/AID field is table 8-16 and the field has been change to Duration/ID already.

**Proposed Response:**

Reject.

**Discussion:**

CID 342: agree with the comment and revise the text as suggested

**Proposed Response:**

Revised

*(Instruction to TGah Editor) revised the sentense as follows;*

**[clause** 8.3.1.19, page 33, lines 6, B0-B12 field **]**

AID~~13~~

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause Number** | **Page** | **Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed Changes** |
| 487 | 8.3.3.2 | 35 | 44 | The Order column of the Table 8-24 - Beacon frame body has TBDs. Define the TBDs. | Tgac D5.0 added Order 60 to 66. Define TBDs by adding Order 67 to 75 starting from the RPS element to the S1G Capabilities element. |
| 394 | 8.3.3.2 | 36 | 17 | Change Sequence is not described in BSSDescription Set in 6.3.3.3.2 | Add description related to Change Sequence in BSSDescription Set in 6.3.3.3.2 |
| 630 | 8.3.3.2 | 35 | 44 | The order of elements in the Beacon frame body is not defined. | Specify the order of elements for the Beacon frame body. |

**Discussion:**

CID 487, 630: agree with the comment and revise the text as suggested

**Proposed Response:**

Revised

*(Instruction to TGah Editor) revised the sentense as follows;*

**[clause** 8.3.3.2, page 35, Table 20 **]**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| ~~TBD~~ 67 | RPS | The RPS element is present in Beacon frames generated by APs for medium access of a group of STAs.This element is present if dot11RAWOptionActivated is true. |
| ~~TBD~~ 68 | Segment Count | The Segment Count element is used for indication of TIM and page segments served in DTIM intervals.This element is present if dot11TIMSegmentSupported is true. |
| ~~TBD~~ 69 | Sector Operation | The AP provides via this element the information related to the sector duration and sector periodicity or Sector Training when dot11S1GSectorizationActivated is true and dot11S1GSectorizationBeaconElement is true. |
| ~~TBD~~ 70 | Subchannel Selective Trans- mission | The Subchannel Selective Transmission element is optionally present if dot11SubchannelSelectiveTransmissionActivated is true. |
| ~~TBD~~ 71 | Authentication Control | The Authentication Control element is present when dot11S1GAuthenticationControlActivated is true. |
| ~~TBD~~ 72 | TSF Timer Accuracy | The TSF Timer Accuracy element is optionally present when the dot11TSFTimerAccuracyImpemented is true. |
| ~~TBD~~ 73 | Relay | The Relay element is optionally present if dot11RelayCapable is true. |
| ~~TBD~~ 74 | Change Sequence | The Change Sequence is optionally present if dot11ShortBeaconOptionImplemented is true. |
| ~~TBD~~ 75 | S1G Capabilities | S1G Capabilities element is optionally present if dot11S1GOptionImplemented is true. |

**Discussion:**

CID 394: agree with the comment and revise the text as suggested

**Proposed Response:**

Revised

*(Instruction to TGah Editor) revised the sentense as follows;*

**[clause** 6.3.3.3.2, page 9, Table \_\_ **]**

Add “Change Sequence” to the table

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name** | **Type** | **Valid Range** | **Description** | **IBSS adoption** |
| Change Sequence | As defined in frame format | 8.4.2.170i Change Sequence element | A Change Sequence element indicates the change of system information within a BSS. The support of a fea- ture is described 10.43c.1 System information update procedure | Do not adopt |