­IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Comment Resolution for CIDs 527, 934, 100, 627, 935** | | | | |
| **Date:** 2013-09-17 | | | | |
| **Author(s):** | | | | |
| **Name** | **Affiliation** | **Address** | **Phone** | **email** |
| David Xun Yang | Huawei Technologies | F1-17, Huawei Base, Longgang District, Shenzhen, China | +86-15914117462 | David.yangxun@huawei.com |

Abstract

This document provides comment resolution for TGah Draft 0.1 Comment Collection 9 with these CIDs: 527, 934 ~~100, 627, and 935~~.

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGah Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGah Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGah Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “Instruction to Editor” are instructions to the TGah editor to modify existing material in the TGah draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGah editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGah Draft.***

R2: CIDs 100, 627, and 935 have been resolved in doc 11-13/1022r1.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Commenter | Clause Number(C) | Page(C) | Line(C) | Comment | Proposed Change | Resolution |
| 527 | Mitsuru Iwaoka | 8.2.4.2 | 30 | 22 | The modification of the item a) is not enough. The value if the AID is in the range 1-2007 for non S1G STA, and 0-8191 for S1G STA. | Modify the last paragraph of item a) as following. --- The value of the AID is in the range 1-2007 for non S1G STA, and 0-8191 for S1G STA. | Accept. |
| 934 | Zhongding Lei | 8.2.4.2 | 30 | 22 | "The value of the AID is in the range 1-2007" is confusing. | The value of the AID except S1G is in the range 1-2007. In S1G, the AID range is 1-8191. | Revise.  Change the last sentence in bullet a) to “The value of the AID is in the range 1-2007 for non S1G STA, and 0-8191 for S1G STA.” |

**Discussion:**

*Note in Talbe 8-6, AID is 0 for broadcasting, and 1-8191 in S1G PS-Poll frames in S1G. Hence, the range of AID in S1G should be 0-8191.*

**Proposed Resolution:**

* + - 1. **Duration/ID field**

**Instruction to Editor: *Please make the following changes in paragraph a) of this subclause:***

1. In Control frames of subtype PS-Poll except the initial frame of a Speed Frame (SF) exchange in S1G, the Duration/ID field carries the association identifier (AID) of the STA that transmitted the frame in the 14 least significant bits (LSB), and the 2 most significant bits (MSB) both set to 1. The value of the AID is in the range 1-2007 for non S1G STA, and 0-8191 for S1G STA.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| ~~CID~~ | ~~Commenter~~ | ~~Clause Number(C)~~ | ~~Page(C)~~ | ~~Line(C)~~ | ~~Comment~~ | ~~Proposed Change~~ | ~~Resolution~~ |
| ~~100~~ | ~~Anna Pantelidou~~ | ~~8.2.5.2~~ | ~~31~~ | ~~4~~ | ~~It is not clear which ACK, the normal or Short ACK, is used in setting the Duration/ID for single protection under EDCA~~ | ~~Clarify~~ | ~~Revise.~~ |
| ~~627~~ | ~~Ronald Murias~~ | ~~8.2.5.2~~ | ~~31~~ | ~~4~~ | ~~It is unclear whether the STA or AP is supposed to transmit "the following MSDU to be transmitted"~~ | ~~Change to "the Duration/ID field is set to the estimated time required for the transmission of one ACK frame, plus the estimated time required for the transmission by the STA of the following MPDU and its response if required, plus applicable IFS durations."~~ | ~~Revise.~~  ~~Please~~ |
| ~~935~~ | ~~Zhongding Lei~~ | ~~8.2.5.2~~ | ~~31~~ | ~~4~~ | ~~NDP ACK frame as the response frame to PS-Poll should be considered~~ | ~~For PS-Poll frames as the initial frame of SF exchange from S1G STAs, the Duration/ID field is set to the estimated time required for the transmission of one (NDP) ACK frame, plus the estimated time required for the transmission of the following uplink MPDU and its response if required, plus applicable IFS durations.~~ | ~~Revise.~~ |

**~~Discussion:~~**

*~~Based on Figure , the response frame of the initial frame of Speed Frame (SF) Exchange can be either ACK or Data frame.~~*

*~~On the other hand, the definition of single protection is~~*

~~“In single protection, the value of the Duration/ID field of the frame can set a NAV value at receiving STAs that protects up to the end of any following Data, Management, or response frame plus any additional overhead frames as described below.” [Revmc D1.1]~~

*~~Hence, it should more clear to identify the “following MPDU”.~~*

~~~~