IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Comment Collection 09 MAC CIDs (Comment Resolutions for CC09) | | | | |
| Date: 2013-September-15 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jianhan Liu | Mediatek Inc. |  |  | Jianhan.liu@mediatek.com |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document provides resolutions for CIDs in subclause **8.4.2.170a**:

* CID418, CID903

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Line** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 418 | 76 | 12 | 8.4.2.170a | Open-link margin is desirable to be defined per each sub-channel because each coverage depending on the BW is also useful | As in comments. | Reject:  Discussions are included in the following context. |
| 903 | 76 | 15 | 8.4.2.170a | As Open-Loop Link Margin Index element is not included in a Beacon or a Probe Response frame always, better not use "is included". | Modifiy the sentence from "The Open-Loop Link Margin Index element is included in a Beacon frame or Probe Response frame without a corresponding request." to "The Open-Loop Link  Margin Index element may be included in a Beacon frame or Probe Response frame without a corresponding request". | Reject:  Discussions are included in the following context. |

**Discussions:**

CID 418- **Resolution**: Reject

Received signal bandwidth is known to the receiver, the receiver calculates the link margin with the consideration of received signal bandwidth and its own transmit bandwidth. Since bandwidth is known information to the receiver, it is redundant information and shall be avoided.

Secondly, providing link-margin index for each sub-channel significantly increases the length of the IE and hurts the intention of fast link adaptation and high efficiency.

CID 903- **Resolution**: Reject

In 802.11, for any optional IE, “is” is used. For example, in 2012 802.11rmvc, for example, the TPC IE, it is also not mandatory IE. The context said “The TPC Report element contains transmit power and link margin information sent in response to a TPC Request element or a Link Measurement Request frame. A TPC Report element is included in a Beacon frame or Probe Response frame without a corresponding request.”

When an IE is mandatory, “shall” is used instead of “is”. “is” means optional. It just says a fact that where the IE is included, not saying the IE is mandatory or optional. Given the fact that almost all IEs in 11n/ac uses the same language as used in 11ah, the resolution is to keep the original language using “is” instead of changing to “may be”.