IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| TGac First Sponsor Ballot Comments Resolutions for Sub-Clause 9.19 | | | | |
| Date: 2013-06-13 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | Email |
| Chunhui (Allan) Zhu | Samsung Electronics | 75 W. Plumeria Dr,  San Jose, CA, USA | +1-408-544-2751 | [c.zhu@samsung.com](mailto:c.zhu@samsung.com) |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

This document provides resolutions for comments in sub-clause 9.19 of draft spec D5.0 (first sponsor ballet). All CIDs are for MAC ad hoc.

* 10048, 10050, 10326, 10327

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 10048 | 98.32 | 8.4.2.160.2 | Change Encoding part to "Set to 0 if the AP does not support TXOP Power Save Mode. Set to 1 if the AP supports TXOP Power Save Mode. Set to 0 if the STA does not enable TXOP Power Save Mode. Set to 1 if the STA enables TXOP Power Save Mode." | Change Encoding part to "Set to 0 if the AP does not support TXOP Power Save Mode. Set to 1 if the AP supports TXOP Power Save Mode. Set to 0 if the STA does not enable TXOP Power Save Mode. Set to 1 if the STA enables TXOP Power Save Mode." | **Accepted** |

**The original Text:**

****

**Discussion:**

The Definition column mentions definitions for both AP and non-AP STA, but the Encoding column only specifies activities for the non-AP STA. The commentor is correct and therefore the Proposed Change is accepted.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 10050 | 154.47 | 9.19.2.4 | CTS-to-Self protection is not consistant with the RTS/CTS protection when the TXOP has multiple CTS e.g. CTS-to-Self, A-MPDU, BlkAck, A-MPDU, BlkAck, RTS/CTS, A-MPDU, BlkAck. | Disallow TXOPs like "CTS-to-Self, A-MPDU, BlkAck, A-MPDU, BlkAck, RTS/CTS, A-MPDU, BlkAck" or rewrite the rule the TXOP protected for CTS-to-Self. | **Revised** |

**The Original Text:**

If a TXOP is protected by a CTS-to-self frame carried in a non-HT or non-HT duplicate PPDU, the TXOP

holder shall set the TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH of a PPDU to be the same or narrower than

the TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH of the CTS-to-self in the same TXOP.

**Discussion**:

Disallowing the use of one CTS-to-Self and one or more RTS/CTS in a TXOP may complicate the current implementation. A better way may be to limit the CH\_BANDWIDTH of a non-initial RTS/CTS to be the same or narrower than the TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH of the CTS-to-self and disallow the use of dynamic bandwidth.

**Editorial Instrution:**

***Change the text of P154L47-L50 as below.***

If a TXOP is protected by a CTS-to-self frame carried in a non-HT or non-HT duplicate PPDU, the TXOP

holder shall set the TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH of a PPDU to be the same or narrower than

the TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH of the CTS-to-self in the same TXOP. If there are one or more RTS/CTS exchanges following the initial CTS-to-self in a TXOP, the TXOP holder shall disable the use of dynamic bandwidth and shall set the TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH of a non-initial RTS to be the same or narrower than the TXVECTOR parameter CH\_BANDWIDTH of the CTS-to-self and each of the preceding RTSs.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 10326 | 158.47 | 9.19.3.2.4 | What is an "element primary"? Are there also element secondaries, element tertiaries, etc.? Apparently something was left out about the value of the channel-list parameter (not 'element') having the value " {primary} ". But even correcting that would not change the fact that a significant amout of 11mc text related to pre-VHT STAs is being changed here, and who knows to what. | Remove this change to lines 46 through 55. | **Revised** |

**The Original Text:**

The beginning of reception of an expected response is detected by the occurrence of PHYCCA.indication(

BUSY, channel-list) primitive at the STA that is expecting the response where the channel-list parameter

is absent, or, if present, includes the element primary.

**Discussion**:

According to the spec, “primary” is one of the PHYCCA.indication channel-list elements. In its context, element has the same meaning as value. It will not cause confusion to the readers. To emphasize that primary is one of the possible values, we can quote the word.

**Editorial Instrution:**

***Change the text of P158L45-47 as below.***

The beginning of reception of an expected response is detected by the occurrence of PHYCCA.indication(

BUSY, channel-list) primitive at the STA that is expecting the response where the channel-list parameter

is absent, or, if present, includes the element “primary”.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 10327 | 159.04 | 9.19.3.5.4 | "obtained in this fashion" does not refer to a fashion of obtaining TXOPs, at all. There is no subject to this qualifier. | Replace "During a TXOP obtained in this fashion, the STA" with "During this TXOP the STA" and make this sentence the second sentence of the paragraph above. | Accepted |

**The Original Text:**

A VHT STA in a BSS that supports multiple channel widths is granted a TXOP for a specified duration and for a channel width that is equal to the channel width of the frame containing the QoS CF-Poll.

During a TXOP obtained in this fashion, the STA shall not transmit in a wider channel width than that granted.

**Discussion**:

Although the original wording looks fine to me, the proposed change may be better.

**Editorial Instrution:**

***Change the text of P158L62-P159L5 as below.***

**9.19.3.5.4 HCCA transfer rules for a VHT STA**

A VHT STA in a BSS that supports multiple channel widths is granted a TXOP for a specified duration and for a channel width that is equal to the channel width of the frame containing the QoS CF-Poll. During this TXOP, the STA shall not transmit in a wider channel width than that granted.

~~During a TXOP obtained in this fashion, the STA shall not transmit in a wider channel width than that granted.~~