IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| LB189 WSM CIDs Comment Resolutions | | | | |
| Date: 2012-11-11 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Yongho Seok | LG Electronics | LG R&D Complex 533, Hogye-1dong, Dongan-Gu, Anyang-Shi, Kyungki-Do, 431-749, Korea | +82-31-450-1947 | yongho.seok@lge.com |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document proposes resolutions for the following 28 CIDs:

98, 99, 132, 174, 175, 176, 280, 343, 347, 416, 417, 418, 421, 455, 456, 457, 458, 562, 563, 628, 642, 711, 713, 740, 741, 742, 839 and 985

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 98 | 31.50 | 6.3.101.2.2 | The ResultCode at 31.50 contains a TIMEOUT without a normative description of how it is generaterated. Per WG style it should be removed. | Remove the ", TIMEOUT". | Revise-  Because MLME does not receive any response frame as the result of WSM Announcement frame transmission, remove MLME-WSM.confirm primitive. |
| 99 | 32.61 | 6.3.101.4.2 | The WSM.response is supposed to do: "This primitive schedules transmission of a response"    What frame is this carried in? I don't see any such definition. | Either remove the WSM.response and WSM.confirm primitives, or describe the process of how a WSM response is transmitted, with particular reference to which frame type is used. | Accept-  Because MLME does not receive any response frame as the result of WSM Announcement frame transmission, remove MLME-WSM.confirm and MLME-WSM.response primitives as the proposed change from commenter. |

**Discussion:**

MLME-WSM.confirm and MLME-WSM.response primitives are not needed because WSM Announcement procedure uses a uni-direction frame exchange sequence.

**Proposed Resolution:** Accept

Because MLME does not receive any response frame as the result of WSM Announcement frame transmission, remove MLME-WSM.confirm and MLME-WSM.response primitives as the proposed change from commenter.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 132 | 41.19 | 8.2.6.1.6 | What does "WSM, US" mean? Does it mean "and" or "or"? | Define meaning of any syntax assumed in the Scope column | Revised-  Comma of Scope column in TLV format means OR condition.  But, in Table 8-14k, “WSM, US” and “WSM, UK” means the WSM of US and the WSM of UK, respectively.  Instead of OR conditation, we should define two different WSM information value fields in Annex E for each regulatorty.  But, because the proposed resolution of CID205 in 11-12/1334r1 is the same, no changes are needed by approving the editing instruction in 11-12/1334r1. |

**Discussion:**

Comma of Scope column in TLV format means OR condition.

But, in Table 8-14k, “WSM, US” and “WSM, UK” means the WSM of US and the WSM of UK, respectively.

Instead of OR conditation, we should define two different names such as WSM-US and WSM-UK. Otherwise, we should define two different WSM information value fields in Annex E for each regulatorty.

I prefer to move “8.2.6.1.6 WSM Information Values” to Annex E and to define two different WSM information value fields.

**Proposed Resolution:** Revised.

Comma of Scope column in TLV format means OR condition.

But, in Table 8-14k, “WSM, US” and “WSM, UK” means the WSM of US and the WSM of UK, respectively.

Instead of OR conditation, we should define two different WSM information value fields in Annex E for each regulatorty.

But, because the proposed resolution of CID205 in 11-12/1334r1 is the same, no changes are needed by approving the editing instruction in 11-12/1334r1.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 347 | 41.26 | 8.2.6.1.6 | UK doesn't have channel number in the rule. Change the name to reflect the ruling | per comment | Reject-  Generally, the channel number can be interpreted by the identifier of some frequency segement. The combination of the starting frequency offset and the ending frequency offset also can be defined as the channel number. |
| 417 | 41.26 | 8.2.6.1.6 | The name of Channel Number for UK is unclear because the information here is the range of the available frequency. Change the name. | per comment | Reject-  Generally, the channel number can be interpreted by the identifier of some frequency segement. The combination of the starting frequency offset and the ending frequency offset also can be defined as the channel number. |

**Discussion:**

From OFCOM regulation, available frequency in TVWS is presented by a list of lower and upper frequency boundaries.

A lower frequency is specified as (470 + 8k + 0.2n) MHz and the upper frequency is specified as (470 + 8k + 0.2m) MHz.

In this equaltion, k, n and m means the channel number, the starting frequency offset and the ending frequency offset, respectively.

Generally, the channel number can be interpreted by the identifier of some frequency segement.

For example, in IEEE 802.11-2012 spec, FHSS PHY are using the channel number as the following equation.

* *fx (i)* is the channel number (as defined in 14.7.4) for *i* th frequency in *x*th hopping pattern;

Channel number of UK WSM is also identifier of some frequency segement defined as the starting frequency offset and the ending frequency offset.

**Proposed Resolution:** Reject.

Generally, the channel number can be interpreted by the identifier of some frequency segement. The combination of the starting frequency offset and the ending frequency offset also can be defined as the channel number.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 455 | 41.00 | 8.2.6.1.6 | It uses 4 bytes to represent a channel number for WSM,UK in the table, However, other places (e.g., Table 8-14i) use only 1 byte to represent channel number, will this cause inconsistence? | Maintain the consistance of the context | Reject-  Because WSM and CSM are used for the different purposes, it is not needed to make the same format. |

**Discussion:**

From OFCOM regulation, available frequency in TVWS is presented by a list of lower and upper frequency boundaries.

In order to represent the channel number of UK WSM, more octets are needed.

Because WSM and CSM are used for the different purposes, it is not needed to make the same format.

**Proposed Resolution:** Reject.

Because WSM and CSM are used for the different purposes, it is not needed to make the same format.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 456 | 41.00 | 8.2.6.1.6 | It uses 2 bytes to represent the maximum power level for WSM,UK in the table, However, other places (e.g., Figure 8-460g) use only 1 byte to represent maxmium Tx power , will this cause inconsistence? Plus, the UK example below the table does not use 2 bytes for the maximum power level | Maintain the consistance of the context | Revise-  CPM was removed in 11-12/1119r0. So, there is no inconstancy issues regading the maximum power level field of UK WSM.  But, because UK WSM example is not correct, it may be removed from the note.  Remove UK WSM example from the notes in Lines 3-10 Page 42. |
| 458 | 42.00 | 8.2.6.1.6 | In the UK example of the NOTE, the max. channel bandwidth item is missing, | Add the value of max. channel bandwidth in the example | Revise-  Because UK WSM example is not correct, it may be removed from the note.  Remove UK WSM example from the notes in Lines 3-10 Page 42. |
| 713 | 42.00 | 8.2.6.1.6 | Examples are incorrect and confusing. Notation is HEX and math doesn't work out. | Fix these examples. | Revise-  Remove UK WSM example from the notes in Lines 3-10 Page 42 as editing instructions in 11-12/1341r0. |

**Discussion:**

CPM was removed in 11-12/1119r0. So, there is no inconstancy issues regading the maximum power level field of UK WSM.

But, because UK WSM example is not correct, it may be removed from the note.

**Proposed Resolution:** Revise.

Remove UK WSM example from the notes in Lines 3-10 Page 42.

***TGaf Editor: Remove the following sentences in 8.2.6.1.6 as as follows:***

~~In UK, an example of full Map 1 for non-AP STA describing two available Personal/Portable TV channels with power limits of 100 mW during 60 minutes and 40 mW during 90 minutes is shown as: <ANA>, 0x0C, 0x00, 0x03, 0x01, 0xA4, 0x01, 0xCC, 0x17, 0x3C, 0x02, 0xC6, 0x03, 0x20, 0x13, 0x5A.~~

~~Type is <ANA>, Length is 0x0C, Device Class is 0x00, a full map with MapID 1 is 0x03, TV channel 26 (512 MHz~516 MHz) is 0x01, 0xA4, 0x01 and 0xCC, 20 dBm Maximum Power Level is 0x17, 60 minutes validy time is 0x3C, TV channel 30 (542 MHz~550 MHz) is 0x02, 0xC6, 0x03 and 0x20, 16 dBm Maximum Power Level is 0x13, 90 minutes validy time is 0x5A.~~

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 457 | 41.00 | 8.2.6.1.6 | For the Maxmium power level entry in the table, it is unclear to me how the "in the unit of 0.5 dBm" apply to the examples in the note below the table | add clarification for how to apply "in the unit of 0.5dBm" | Revise-  Modify the maximum power level with the unit of 0.5dBm as editing instructions in 11-12/1341r0. |

**Discussion:**

The unit of the maximum power level was changed. Example should be changed accordingly.

**Proposed Resolution:** Revise.

Modify the maximum power level with the unit of 0.5dBm.

***TGaf Editor: Modify the following sentences in 8.2.6.1.6 as as follows:***

NOTE—In USA, an example of full Map 1 for US GDCnonAPSTA describing two available channels with power limits of 100 mW and 40 mW is shown as: <ANA>, 0x06, 0x00, 0x03, 0x15, 0x~~17~~28, 0x33, 0x~~13~~20.

Type is <ANA>, Length is 0x06, Device Class is 0x00, a full map with MapID 1 is 0x03, TV channel 21 is 0x15, 20 dBm Maximum Power Level is 0x~~17~~28, TV channel 51 is 0x33, 16 dBm Maximum Power Level is 0x~~13~~20.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 740 | 41.26 | 8.2.6.1.6 | The UK Channel Number field is three integers (which is in the draft), "k" "n" and "m" ("k" is missing in the bracketed list). Also, I thought we had math variables in italics whereas the "n" and "m" occuring in the text are in plain font. | Extract correct words from Ofcom "Final regulatory requirements for white space devices in the UHF TV band (date 28 June 2012)," say from 3.22.1, format correctly | Revise-  Editor changes “n” and ‘m” in IEEE 802.11 Style guidline. |

**Discussion:**

It is recommended to use IEEE 802.11 Style guidline.

**Proposed Resolution:** Revised.

Editor changes “n” and ‘m” in IEEE 802.11 Style guidline.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 174 | 89.49 | 10.42.9 | "(modulo 128)" - wrong. value 127 is used for a special purpose, so should not be used in the normal sequence. | 128->127 | Accept-  A Map ID version value of 127 is used for a special purpose.  Change “modulo 128” to “modulo 127” in Line 49, Page 89. |

**Discussion:**

A Map ID version value of 127 is used for indicating that the WSM is informative. So, as proposed by the commenter, modulo 128 shall be changed to modulo 127.

**Proposed Resolution:** Accept.

Change “modulo 128” to “modulo 127” in Line 49, Page 89.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 175 | 89.64 | 10.42.9 | "is required to move" - is this a normative requirement? | If yes: "is required to" -> shall.  If no: "is required to move" -> moves | Accept-  Line 64, Page 89 is a normative requirement.  Change “is required to move” to “shall move” in Line 64, Page 89. |

**Discussion:**

“A GDC dependent STA that has previously received a WSM and that receives an updated WSM from its AP or GDC enabling STA is required to move its channel of operation if it is operating on a channel that has become unavailable in the updated WSM.”

This sentence is a normative requirement. I agree with the proposed change.

**Proposed Resolution:** Accept.

Change “is required to move” to “shall move” in Line 64, Page 89.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 176 | 90.02 | 10.42.9 | "enabled GDC dependent STA is able to send a probe request frame" - is this granting permission? | If yes: "is able to" -> may | Accept-  Line 1, Page 90 is granting a permission to send a probe request.  Change “is able to send a probe request” to “may send a probe request” in Line 1, Page 90. |

**Discussion:**

“If dot11WhiteSpaceMapActivated is true, then the enabled GDC dependent STA is able to send a probe request frame on any channel identified in the received WSM element.”

This sentence is granting a permission to send a probe request. So, I agree with the proposed change.

**Proposed Resolution:** Accept.

Change “is able to send a probe request” to “may send a probe request” in Line 1, Page 90.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 280 | 56.01 | 8.4.2.174 | Will WSM information ever need to consist of more than 255 octets? | If so, a segmentation mechanism needs to be defined. Also check whether this is an issue for any other IEs | Reject-  A segmentation mechanism is already suppored by current 11af draft 2.0. See Line 55-58, Page 89. |

**Discussion:**

If WSM information is more than 255 octets, it can be segmented in two information element.

In that case, Map ID field can be used for constructing single WSM information from several segmented WSM information.

“If a STA receives several WSMs with the same Map version and the Type bit is equal to 0, the STA is recommended to construct the whole channel list using the multiple WSMs having the same Map version.”, Line 55-58, Page 89.

So, a segmentation mechanism is alreadt suppored by current 11af draft 2.0.

**Proposed Resolution:** Reject.

A segmentation mechanism is already suppored by current 11af draft 2.0. See Line 55-58, Page 89.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 343 | 89.42 | 10.42.9 | Can WSM element be included in beacon? | Clarify | Reject-  Regulation does not allow to transmit the available channel list in unsecure manner. |

**Discussion:**

Regulation asks to transmit the available channel list in secure manner. But, Beacon frame does not satisfy the regulation requirement.

**Proposed Resolution:** Reject.

Regulation does not allow to transmit the available channel list in unsecure manner.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 416 | 41.11 | 8.2.6.1.6 | Remove MAP ID from WSM, for the purpose of CVS, no need to use WSM to notify the change of the channel | per comment | Reject-  Map ID is used as the identifier of the WSM. A STA can construct the whole channel list using the multiple WSMs having the same Map ID. Also, by the Map ID transmitted in CVS frame, a STA can always check whether the list of available channels is changed or not. |

**Discussion:**

Map ID is used as the identifier of the WSM.

If a STA receives several WSMs with the same Map ID, the STA can construct the whole channel list using the multiple WSMs having the same Map ID.

Also, by the Map ID transmitted in CVS frame, a STA can always check whether the list of available channels is changed or not.

**Proposed Resolution:** Reject.

Map ID is used as the identifier of the WSM. A STA can construct the whole channel list using the multiple WSMs having the same Map ID. Also, by the Map ID transmitted in CVS frame, a STA can always check whether the list of available channels is changed or not.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 418 | 41.18 | 8.2.6.1.6 | Using channel number for the USA case is not efficient. In case there are many TV channel available, the overhead to deliver such information is huge. Change channel number to a bitmap for the USA case. | per comment | Reject-  The list of the available channels is not frequntely transmitted. The list of the channel number does not have a huge overhead. |

**Discussion:**

The list of the available channels is not frequntely transmitted. I don’t believe that the list of the channel number has a huge overhead.

**Proposed Resolution:** Reject.

The list of the available channels is not frequntely transmitted. The list of the channel number does not have a huge overhead.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 421 | 56.33 | 8.4.2.174 | Remove WSM type field. This amendament is designed for TVWS operation. Other band sould not be discussed here. | per comment | Reject-  Even though the scope of TGaf is designated for TVWS operation, considering a future extension is always good. |

**Discussion:**

Even though the scope of TGaf is designated for TVWS operation, considering a future extension is always good. Because WSM type field is 1 octet, the overhead of WSM type is no little.

**Proposed Resolution:** Reject.

Even though the scope of TGaf is designated for TVWS operation, considering a future extension is always good.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 562 | 40.08 | 8.2.6.1.6 | Sentence too long - "The Device Class field is set to ... as the Length field of WSM element." | Please break up into mulitple sentences. | Revise-  Break up into two sentences as editing instructions in 11-12/1341r0. |

**Discussion:**

The following sentence is too long. I agree with the proposed change.

“The Device Class field is set to a value identifying the Device Class used by the WSM and determines the length of the channel availability tuple consisting of the channel number, the maximum power level and the validity fields, which is repeated as the Length field of WSM element.”

**Proposed Resolution:** Revise.

***TGaf Editor: Modify the following sentence in 8.2.6.1.6 as as follows:***

“The Device Class field is set to a value identifying the Device Class used by the WSM ~~and~~. It determines the length of the channel availability tuple consisting of the channel number, the maximum power level and the validity fields, which is repeated as the Length field of WSM element.”

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 563 | 41.21 | 8.2.6.1.6 | In Value column for Channel Number, there is no need to describe the length of this field again. There is a preceding Length column. | Remove sentence "The length of the Channel Number field is 1 octet.". | Revise-  Remove Line 22 and 34, Page 41 as editing instructions in 11-12/1341r0. |

**Discussion:**

I agree with the proposed change.

**Proposed Resolution:** Revise.

***TGaf Editor: Remove the following sentences in 8.2.6.1.6 as as follows:***

***(Line 22 and 34, Page 41)***

“The length of the Channel Number field is 1 octet.”

“The length of the Channel Number field is 4 octets.”

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 628 | 89.11 | 10.42.9 | It is ambiguous what "does not operate" means. If a GDC dependent STA does not operate, how does it obtain the WSM?  Other parts of this clause also seem to need clarification and more consistent use of terms. For instance, is it "Map version" or "Map ID version"? and on line 56, "the STA is recommended to construct the whole channel list...". | Please clarify. | Revise-  Modify Line 49-58 Page 89 as editing instructions in 11-12/1341r0. |

**Discussion:**

Regarding Map ID field in the WSM information, Map ID version and Map version are used inconsistenly. Other parts are revised by the other comment resolution (see CID 642 and CID 985).

**Proposed Resolution:** Revise.

***TGaf Editor: Modify the following sentences in 10.42.9 as as follows:***

***(Line 49-58, Page 89)***

“The value of the Map version bits in the Map ID field is increased by 1 (modulo 128) whenever the GDC enabling STA transmits the updated WSM. The most recently received WSM is used by the WSM receiving STAs. When a STA receives a WSM with a Map ~~ID~~ version value of 127, it indicates that the WSM is informative and it does not affect the GDC enablement states of a GDC dependent STA.”

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 642 | 89.11 | 10.42.9 | "... a GDC enabling STA transmits a WSM and a GDC dependent STA does not operate unless it has a valid WSM." What does "operate" mean precisely? | Clarify the meaning of "operate" in the sentence and modify the sentence accordingly. | Revise-  “Operate” means that a GDC dependent STA can transmit frames only on the available channels indicated in its valid WSM.  Modify Line 10 Page 89 as editing instructions in 11-12/1341r0. |
| 985 | 89.11 | 10.42.9 | "... a GDC enabling STA transmits a WSM and a GDC dependent STA does not operate unless it has a valid WSM." What does "operate" mean precisely? | Clarify the meaning of "operate" in the sentence and modify the sentence accordingly. | Revise-  “Operate” means that a GDC dependent STA can transmit frames only on the available channels indicated in its valid WSM.  Modify Line 10 Page 89 as editing instructions in 11-12/1341r0. |

**Discussion:**

The following sentence may needs some clarification.

“If dot11WhiteSpaceMapActivated is true, a GDC enabling STA transmits a WSM and a GDC dependent STA does not operate unless it has a valid WSM.”

“Operate” means that a GDC dependent STA can transmit frames only on the available channels indicated in its valid WSM.

**Proposed Resolution:** Revise.

***TGaf Editor: Modify the following sentences in 10.42.9 as as follows:***

***(Line 10, Page 89)***

“If dot11WhiteSpaceMapActivated is true, a GDC enabling STA transmits a WSM and a GDC dependent STA ~~does not operate unless it has a~~ can transmit frames only on the available channels indicated in its valid WSM.”

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 711 | 41.27 | 8.2.6.1.6 | Error. | Change from "three positive ineger" to "two positive 2-octet integer". | Accept-  Modify Line 26, Page 41 as editing instructions in 11-12/1341r0 |

**Discussion:**

This is typos.

**Proposed Resolution:** Accept.

***TGaf Editor: Modify the following sentences in 8.2.6.1.6 as as follows:***

***(Line 26, Page 41)***

“The Channel Number field is ~~three~~ two positive 2-octet integer values (n, m) that indicate the available lower and upper frequency boundaries for WLAN operation.”

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 742 | 41.50 | 8.2.6.1.6 | The time validity from the Ofcom "final regulatory requirements .. 28 June 2012" is provided once for all channels (section 4.17.5). Also, is 256 minutes really the longest time we wish to indicate? | Establish actual max time, make room for it. Either make single number for whole list above or clarify duplication (i.e. difference from Ofcom regulations) | Rejected -  The validity time of 1 octet is not enough. Increase the length of the Vailidity field to 2 octet as editing instructions in 11-12/1341r0. |

**Discussion:**

The validity time of 1 octet just supports 256 minutes. It is needed to be extended.

**Proposed Resolution:** Rejected.

The validity time of 1 octet is enough.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 839 | 30.33 | 6.3.101 | Clause 6 White Space Mapl 6.3.101 is unnecessary, as no unique normative requirements appear here. | Delete editing instruction and 6.3.101 text. | Reject-  The clause 6 is useful to show the relationship between the SME and the MLME. |

**Discussion:**

Even though the clause 6 does not include any unique normative text, it is useful to show the relationship between the SME and the MLME.

**Proposed Resolution:** Reject.

The clause 6 is useful to show the relationship between the SME and the MLME.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 741 | 41.42 | 8.2.6.1.6 | Maximum Power Level should be a list with the same number of elements as the Channel Number and the same sorting (i.e. ascending channel number) | Add constraing on list to make elements paris with channel numbers | Reject-  Current draft already has such constraint in 8.2.6.1.6 (see Line 22-25, Page 41). |

**Discussion:**

Such constraint is already included in 8.2.6.1.6 as the following.

“When the Channel Number and Maximum Power Level pairs are repeated, they shall be listed in ascending TV channel order.”

**Proposed Resolution:** Reject.

Current draft already has such constraint in 8.2.6.1.6 (see Line 22-25, Page 41).