IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Clause 22.3.20 Comment Resolution for D2.0 |
| Date: 08 March 2012 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Eldad Perahia | Intel Corporation |  |  | eldad.perahia@intel.com |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document provides resolutions for CIDs: 5203, 4106, 5204, 5206, 5208, 5210, 4771, 5212, 5214, 5213, 4117, 5211, 5216, 5215, 4767, 5218, 5219

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resn Status** | **Resolution** |
| 5203 | 259.41 | 22.3.20 | Section 22.3.20 should make some mention of MU transmission | This section talks about SU transmission only. While we don't need to fully reproduce the text for MU, some mention should be made of MU and how it relates to SU. | V | Revised. Make changes under heading CID 5203 in 12/0251 |

**TGac editor: modify P259L46-49 as follows:**

The first path, for which typical transmit procedures are shown in Figure 22-25, is selected if the

FORMAT parameter of PHY-TXSTART.request(TXVECTOR) is VHT. These transmit procedures

do not describe the operation of optional features, such as LDPC, STBC, or MU.

Note –for MU the A-MPDU is per user in the MAC sublayer; the VHT Training Symbols, VHT-SIG-B, and C-PSDU are per user in the PHY PLCP sublayer; and the VHT Training Symbols, VHT-SIG-B, and Data are per user in the PHY PMD sublayer in Figure 22-25.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resn Status** | **Resolution** |
| 4106 | 259.62 | 22.3.20 | "In both paths, in order to transmit data, PHY-TXSTART.request shall be enabled"This is meaningless. The primitives are not enabled/disabled. They are sent and received across a SAP boundary. | Change first sentence to read: "In both paths, in order to transmit data, the MAC generates a PHY-TXSTART.request primitive, which causes the PHY entity to enter the transmit state." | A | Accepted  |
| 5204 | 260.19 | 22.3.20 | PLCP configures the PMD | Replace "configure the PHY" with "configure the PMD" | A | Accepted  |
| 5206 | 260.40 | 22.3.20 | Sentence out of place | The sentence "The PHY proceeds with PSDU transmission through a series of data octet transfers from the MAC." looks out of place. The preceding paragraph already talks about MAC-PHY interaction.Delete this sentence. | R | Rejected. This is an introductory sentence to the paragraph. |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5208 | 260.54 | 22.3.20 | Completion of PPDU tranmission is unclear | Replace sentence "The PPDU transmission is completed and the PHY entity enters the receive state" with "When the PPDU transmission is completed, the PHY entity enters the receive state" | A | Accepted |
| 5210 | 260.59 | 22.3.20 | short GI is for data symbols only | Replace "every OFDM symbol" with "every data OFDM symbol" | A | Accepted |

**Figure 22-25 PLCP transmit procedure**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resn Status** | **Resolution** |
| 4771 | 261.00 | 22.3.20 | PMD\_TXSTART.req is missing | Add before PMD\_DATA.req | A | Accepted. |
| 5212 | 261.10 | 22.3.20 | PHY-DATA.request and PHY-DATA.confirm are in the wrong place in Figure 22-25 | The figure shows PHY\_-DATA.request and PHY\_-DATA.confirm as beginning before A-MPDU. It's possible that these primitives are used right after PHY-TXSTART, but the current location is inconsistent with the location of A-MPDU shown in the Figure. | R | Rejected. Timing between layers in the figure follows the convention in Figure 18-17 and Figure 20-22.  |
| 5214 | 261.11 | 22.3.20 | A-MPDU in Figure 22-25 is ambiguous | The MAC provides all bytes of the PSDU. It should be made clear that A-MPDU means "A-MPDU after EOF padding". Actually, it's probably correct to use PSDU instead of A-MPDU here. | V | Revised. Change “A-MPDU” to “A-MPDU including EOF padding”. Make changes under heading CID 5214 in 12/0251 |
| 5213 | 261.16 | 22.3.20 | Service field is not shown in Figure 22-25 | Service field should be inserted between "VHT-SIG-B" and "PSDU" blocks. | A | Accepted. |
| 4117 | 261.22 | 22.3.20 | Figure 22-25 shows a PMD\_TXEND.request that results in a PMD\_TXEND.indication.That's the wrong pairing of primitives. | Change PMD\_TXEND.indication to PMD\_TXEND.confirm in Figure 22-25. | A | Accepted. |
| 5211 | 261.25 | 22.3.20 | PMD\_TXSTART.request not shown in Figure 22-25 | The arrow currently labeled "PMD\_DATA.request" should be labeled "PMD\_TXSTART.request" | V | Revised. Make changes under heading CID 5211 in 12/0251 |
| 5216 | 261.33 | 22.3.20 | There is no VHT-SIG field | Replace "VHT-SIG" with "VHT-SIG-A" | A | Accepted |
| 5215 | 261.40 | 22.3.20 | Change caption of Figure 22-25 to explicitly indicate that this is SU transmission | Change caption to "PLCP transmit procedure for SU transmission" | A | Accepted. |

****

**Figure 22-26 PLCP transmit state machine**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Page** | **Clause** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resn Status** | **Resolution** |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4767 | 262.13 | 22.3.20 | What's PMD\_EXPANSIONS\_MAT.request? | Need to define in 22.6.4 | V | Revised. Its left over from 802.11n figure. Delete PMD\_EXPANSIONS\_MAT.request from figure. Make changes under heading CID 4767 in 12/0251 |
| 5218 | 262.46 | 22.3.20 | Inconsistency in PLCP state machine | The box labeled "TX PLCP Data" states: "16 bit service field prepended, padding and tail bits appended to PSDU". This implies that all data is available at this stage.Immediately following, the diagram describes a byte-by-byte exchange between MAC and PHY to get the PSDU octets. This is inconsistent. | R | Rejected. The cited sentence does not imply that all the data is available at this stage, it merely reminds the reader of the service field, padding and tail. |
| 5219 | 262.64 | 22.3.20 | Change caption of Figure 22-26 to explicitly indicate that this is SU transmission | Change caption to "PLCP transmit state machine for SU transmission" | A | Accepted. |



