IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 802.11 TGad January 2012 Minutes | | | | |
| Date: 2011-01-19 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Company | Address | Phone | email |
| James Yee | MediaTek |  |  | james.yee@mediatek.com |
| Chris Hansen | Broadcom |  |  | chansen@broadcom.com |
| Eldad Perahia | Intel Corporation |  |  | [eldad.perahia@intel.com](mailto:eldad.perahia@intel.com) |

Abstract

Minutes of the 802.11 TGad meetings during the January 2012 session.

# Minutes of TGad session – Monday January 16th, 10:30 – 12:30

Chair called meeting to order at 10:30am.

Chair reviewed IEEE-SA Patent Policy.

Chair reviewed IEEE-SA other guidelines.

Chair reviewed agenda for the week. The Tuesday AM1 session will start at 8:45am to allow WNG attendance on UWB. Thursday AM2 session was added. We will try to add TGacs slots from Tuesday will be added in AM2 and PM1. No comments from Graham Smith (DSP Group) and Alex Ashley (NDS) will be covered during PM1 because of the overlap with TGaa.

Chair reviewed November minutes.

Motion to approve November minutes (doc 11-11-1146r0). Moved Chris Hansen, Seconded James Yee. No objection. Motion passes.

Chair reviewed conference calls.

Motion to approve December 1, 2011 minutes (doc. 11-11-0016r24). Moved Chris Hansen, Seconded James Yee. No objection. Motion passes.

Motion to approve January 5, 2012 minutes (doc. 11-12-0007r0). Moved Chris Hansen, Seconded James Yee. No objection. Motion passes.

Motion to approve January 12, 2012 minutes (doc. 11-12-0007r1). Moved Chris Hansen, Seconded James Yee. No objection. Motion passes.

Editor reviewed comments from the first Sponsor Ballot. Attendees reviewed comment resolution procedures and how responses will be handled properly in the comment spreadsheet.

Motion #66 – Move to approve text as part of resolution of comment 6001 in 12/0047r1, Fixes and Clarifications, 12/0048r1, Wakeup Schedule Element, 12/0051r1, GCMP Test Vector Revised, and 12/0022r0, MB and PCP selection fixes. Moved James Yee, Seconded Chris Hansen. No objection. Motion passes.

Editor continued comment resolution.

Chair calls straw poll to change “Dband to Vband”. 1 For, 11 Against.

Chair calls straw poll to change “Oband to non-Dband”. 4 For, 10 Against.

Chair calls straw poll “Do you want to change short A-MSDU to something else?” 5 For, 9 Against.

Chair calls straw poll “Would you like to include a note in the short A-MSDU description that describes why the SA and DA fields are not included in the short A-MSDU?” 5 For, 8 Against.

Recessed until Tuesday AM1 – 8:45am.

# Minutes of TGad session – Tuesday January 17th, 8:00 – 10:00

Chair called meeting to order at 8:45am.

Chair presents Doc 12/0086r0

* Announce timeslots for ad-hoc meetings in Tuesday AM2 and Tuesday PM2 in City Terrace 12.
* Agenda discussions. No objections to the agenda.

Editor (Carlos) continues with comment resolutions (doc 12/0020r2)

* CID6007
  + Discussions between Chair, Editor, Graham Smith, David Hunter (WireFi), and James Gilb (Tensorcom).
  + In addition to P44L10, also discuss replacing new text on P44L24 to “not applicable to DBand”
  + Chair calls straw poll on: P44L10, Delete “is applicable to the Oband and Dband”: 3 For, 1 Against.
  + Chair calls straw poll on: P44L24, replace “is applicable only to the Oband” to “is not applicable to DBand”: 3 For, 0 Against.
* CID6003
  + Amend resolution with straw poll results from yesterday.
* CID6006: updated resolution.
* CID6005: assignee of Brian Hart noted.
* CID6004:
  + To address the commenter’s concern that the comment, when submitted in LB, was ignored, the Chair referred to the conference call minutes and emphasized that this comment was discussed during the conference calls and was not ignored.
  + Editor called the commenter’s attention to the usage of S-AP in 9.34.
  + Reza (Cisco) reiterated the points about S-AP usage and pronunciation made by Brian Hart (Cisco) in previous resolution of this issue.
  + David suggested that “S-PCP/S-AP” should also be defined. Editor agrees.
  + The resolution updated accordingly.
* CID6127: on FST (note that the 428 in the comment entry should refer to page #)
  + Commenter is ok with resolution but will further study the section.
* CID6128: on CBAP
  + Discussed current resolutions and no changes were made.
* CID6132:
  + Modified resolution with additional text stemming from CID6128 discussion.
* CID6130
  + Discussion of resolution, which will continue in the next session.

Recessed at 10:05 until Tuesday AM2 ad-hoc session.

# Minutes of Ad-hoc TGad session – Tuesday January 17th, 10:30 – 12:30

Chair notes that no motions can be held during the ad-hoc session.

Comment resolution continues.

* CID 6130 – commenter satisfied with comment resolution (revised)
* CID 6387 – rejected with clarification on differences between AP and PCP
* CID 6364 - commenter satisfied with comment resolution (revised)
* CID 6065 - commenter satisfied with comment resolution (revised)
* CID 6083 – Will delay resolution until next conference call.
* CID 6016 – commenter satisfied with comment resolution (revised)
* CID 6264 - commenter satisfied with comment resolution (revised)
* CID 6017 - commenter satisfied with comment resolution (revised)
* CID 6018 - commenter satisfied with comment resolution (revised)
* CID 6019 - commenter satisfied with comment resolution (revised)
* CID 6020 - commenter satisfied with comment resolution (revised)
* CID 6023 - commenter satisfied with comment resolution (revised)
* CID 6024 - commenter satisfied with comment resolution (revised)
* CID 6077 - commenter satisfied with comment resolution (revised)
* CID 6025 - commenter satisfied with comment resolution (revised)
* CID 6027 - commenter satisfied with comment resolution (revised)
* CID 6029 - commenter satisfied with comment resolution (revised)
* CID 6030 - commenter satisfied with comment resolution (revised)
* CID 6031 - commenter satisfied with comment resolution (revised)
* CID 6074 – accept
* CID 6093 – accept
* CID 6271 – accept
* CID 6269 – accept
* Recessed until next adhoc in PM2 today

# Minutes of Ad-hoc TGad session – Tuesday January 17th, 16:00 – 18:00

Chair calls the ad-hoc session into order at 16:00 and notes that no motions can be held during the ad-hoc session.

Editor continues with comment resolution.

* CID6091: No objections to proposed resolution of ACCEPT.
* CID6095: No objections to proposed resolution of ACCEPT.
* CID6512: same as CID6095
* CID6097: No objections to proposed resolution of ACCEPT.
* CID6098: Related to NextPCP List.
  + Editor, David Hunter, Alex Ashley, James Yee discussed wording of resolution text. No objections to proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID6103: assigned to Zhou Lan.
* CID6090: No objections to proposed resolution of ACCEPT.
* CID6087: No objections to proposed resolution of ACCEPT.
* CID6088: No objections to proposed resolution of ACCEPT.
* CID6098: No objections to proposed resolution of ACCEPT.
* CID6032: MIB related. No objections to proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID6034: MIB related. No objections to proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID6033: MIB related. No objections to proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID6035: MIB related. No objections to proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID6036:
  + Editor drafted MIB variable text for dot11AntennaSwitchingTime for REVISED resolution. No objections to proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID6037: duplicate of CID6036. No objections to proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID6038: No objections to proposed resolution of REJECTED.
* CID6039: No objections to proposed resolution of REJECTED.
* CID6105: Discussed and changed resolution from REJECTED to REVISED.
  + Changed “Target Address” field to “Subject Address”
* CID6110: Discussed text. No objections to proposed resolution.
* CID6040: MIB related. No objections to proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID6111: No objections to proposed resolution.
* CID6041: No objections to proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID6042: MIB related. No objections to proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID6047: MIB related. No objections to proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID6043: MIB related. No objections to proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID6044: MIB related. No objections to proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID6046: MIB related. No objections to proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID6112: Discussed rationale and proposed resolution text. No objections to the proposed REVISED resolution which removes P481L6-9 and inserts new text.
* CID6113, 6364, 6374, 6375: assigned to Brian Hart.
* CID6376: Discussion among Chair, Editor, Adrian, David, Jon Rosdahl (CSR).
  + Decided to convert usage of OBand and DBand to an adjective.
* CID6377: No objections to proposed resolution.
* CID6382: No objections to proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID6380: No objections to proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID6381: No objections to proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID6385: duplicate of CID6077.

Meeting recessed.

# Minutes of TGad session – Wednesday January 18th, 13:30 – 15:30

Chair called meeting to order.

Chair explained new sessions added at the mid-week plenary attendance.

Document 12-0020-03 is the latest revision of the comment database.

Comment resolution continues.

* CID 6388: No objections to proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6391: No objections to proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID 6393: MAC power saving – No objections to proposed REVISED resolution
* CID 6080: MAC power saving – No objections to proposed REVISED resolution
* CID 6393: MAC power saving – No objections to proposed REVISED resolution
* CID 6395: No objections to proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6398: No objections to proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6400: MAC – SFS: No objections to proposed REVISED resolution
* CID 6401: MAC – FST: No objections to proposed REJECT resolution
* CID 6402: MAC – FST: No objections to proposed REVISED resolution
* CID 6404: MAC – FST: No objections to proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6406: MAC – FST: No objections to proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6408: MAC – FST: No objections to proposed REJECT resolution
* CID 6410: MAC – FST: No objections to proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID 6415: MAC – FST: No objections to proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6417: MAC-FST: No objections to proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID 6421: MAC – FST: No objections to proposed ACCEPTED resolution.

Meeting recessed at 15:35.

# Minutes of TGad session – Wednesday January 18th, 16:00 – 18:00

Chair called meeting to order at 16:00.

Document 12-0020-03 is the latest revision of the comment database.

Comment resolution continues.

* CID6426: Change Non-DBand Technology to Non-IEEE-802.11. No objections to proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID6445, 6328, 6327, 6495, 6489, 6483, 6332, 6331: On the topic of OBand vs. DBand terminology.
  + CID6483:
    - Dorothy Stanley (Aruba Networks) comments that directionality is not a property of a band. Jon Rosdahl also comments that he concurs with Dorothy’s comment. Graham suggests DVHT instead of DBand. Sai comments that a name with VHT will create confusion with VHT in TGac. Dorothy prefers a name which does not contain the word Directional or Band. Eldad mentions that Adrian suggests a name with 3 characters.
    - Jon asks the Chair for a few words to describe the work in TGad. Eldad suggests the word “millimeter wave”. Dorothy comments that these are description of the band, not characteristics of the PHY. Eldad elaborates that “directional” is a key characteristic of the PHY.
    - Strawpoll: “Do you support changing the name DBand?”
      * Yes: 10, No: 0, Abstain: 7
    - Reza (Cisco) suggests that we do not want to have a name that competes with TGac in data rate, i.e., Gigabit.
    - Mark Rison (CSR) says that marketing concerns should not affect our naming decision.
    - Vote on Suggested names (Direction from the Chair is that each person can vote for as many choices as s/he likes)
      * MGR- Multi gigabit rate: 11
      * MGT – Multi gigabit throughput: 10
      * DVHT – directional VHT: 4
      * DHT – Directional HT: 3
      * GHT – Gigabit HT: 3
      * MHT - Millimeter HT: 6
      * DMG – Directional Multi Gigabit: 11
      * MMW – milli meter wave: 1
    - Vote on the short list of suggested names (one vote per person)
      * MGR- Multi gigabit rate: 7
      * MGT – Multi gigabit throughput: 0
      * DMG – Directional Multi Gigabit: 11
    - Noting the consensus on using DMG instead of DBand, the Chair asked the room if there is any objection to changing OBand to non-DMG. There were no objections.
    - No objections to adopting the new name of DMG in the proposed REVISED resolution to CID6483.
  + The same resolution is applied to CID6445, 6328, 6327, 6495, 6489, 6332, 6331, and there were no objections to the proposed resolutions.
* CID6003: No objections to updating REVISED resolution to incorporate the resolution of CID6483.
* CID6006: No objections to updating REVISED resolution to incorporate the resolution of CID6483.
* CID6376: No objections to updating REVISED resolution to incorporate the resolution of CID6483.
* CID6377: No objections to updating REVISED resolution to incorporate the new DMG terminology.
* CID6427: No objections to the proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID6432: No objections to the proposed REVISED resolution using the “DMG MAC” terminology.
* CID6433: No objections to the proposed REVISED resolution using the “DMG STAs” terminology.
* CID6434: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID6435: No objections to the proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID6441: No objections to the proposed REJECTED resolution.
* CID6312: duplicate of CID6441. No objections to the proposed REJECTED resolution.
* CID6446: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.

Meeting recessed at 18:00.

# Minutes of TGad session – Thursday January 19th, 8:00 – 10:00

Chair calls meeting to order.

Sponsor ballot comment review continues.

* CID 6160: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CIDs 6158 and 6159: Assigned to Payam Torab (Broadcom Corporation).
* CID 6438: No objections to the proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID 6149: No objections to the proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID 6488: No objections to the proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID 6487: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6486: No objections to the proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID 6507: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6484: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6493: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6485: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6114: No objections to the proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID 6120: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6119: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6118: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6123: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6124: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6117: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6090: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6116: No objections to the proposed REVISED resolution to match 6090.
* CID 6333: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6334: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID 6229: No objections to the proposed REJECTED resolution.
* CID 6299: No objections to the proposed REJECTED resolution.
* CID 6298: No objections to the proposed REVISED resolution to match 6248.
* CID 6327: No objections to the proposed REJECTED resolution.
* CID 6308: Additional comment language added. No objections to the proposed REJECTED resolution.
* CID 6309 started discussion

Chair called recess at 10:00am.

# Minutes of TGad session – Thursday January 19th, 10:30 – 12:30

Chair calls meeting to order at 10:30.

Sponsor ballot comment review continues with 11-12/0020-05.

* CID6309: continue discussion on Multiple MAC.
  + Mark Rison (CSR) commented that he does not agree with the power-saving argument in the proposed resolution since it is not a concern in current web access. Chris Hansen counters by pointing out that at Gbps rates on mobile devices power consumption is a serious concern, therefore re-encryption is undesirable. Although, the exact impact is implementation specific.
  + Added reference to specific URL.
  + No objections to the proposed REJECTED resolution.
* CID6310: On Reverse Direction protocol.
  + No objections to the proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID6313: skipped.
* CID6314: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID6315,6316,6317: assigned to Brian Hart.
* CID6320: assigned to Assaf (Intel)
* CID6321,6322,6326: assigned to Sai (Tensorcom)
* CID6323: to be resolved with Mark Hamilton’s architecture discussion.
* CID6324,6325: assigned to Yong (ETRI)
* CID6151: duplicate of 6323
* CID6152: duplicate of 6326
* CID6302: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.

The group discussed which CID resolutions can be motioned today in observance of the 4-hour rule.

* CID6476: Discussion on the proposed REJECTED resolution.
  + defer discussion until the commenter to join the discussion in person during PM1.
* CID6464: No objections to the proposed ACCEPTED resolution.
* CID6162: No objections to the proposed REJECTED resolution.
* CID6168: Duplicate of CID6364. No objections to the proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID6307: Lengthy discussion about Beacon Interval, BI, Beacon Interval structure.
  + No objections to the proposed REVISED resolution.
* CID6279: duplicate of CID6307.

Chair called for recess at 12:31.

# Minutes of TGad session – Thursday January 19th, 13:30 – 15:30

Chair calls meeting to order and reviews agenda.

Vote on motions is scheduled for 2pm.

* CID 6476 Discussion
  + Peter Ecclesine reviewed issues related to 2 letter acronyms in his comment. Two letter acronyms cannot be re-used in the current format. All 2 letter acronyms can be included in a separate sub-clause 3.1.1, so that 2 letter acronyms could be re-used at some other point. Some people were firmly against this idea. Others suggested avoiding 2 letter acronyms and employing 3 letter acronyms.

Motion #67 – comments on server to 10:06am this morning.

Move to approve resolution of comments

6003 6004 6007 6009 6010 6011 6016 6017 6018 6019 6020 6021 6022 6023 6024 6025 6026 6027 6028 6029 6030 6031 6032 6033 6034 6035 6036 6037 6038 6039 6040 6041 6042 6043 6044 6045 6046 6047 6048 6049 6065 6067 6074 6077 6080 6081 6087 6088 6089 6090 6091 6092 6093 6095 6097 6098 6105 6110 6112 6114 6116 6117 6118 6119 6120 6121 6122 6123 6124 6126 6127 6128 6129 6130 6131 6132 6149 6158 6160 6264 6269 6271 6273 6291 6298 6299 6308 6312 6333 6334 6364 6373 6377 6378 6380 6381 6382 6385 6388 6391 6393 6395 6396 6398 6399 6400 6401 6402 6404 6406 6408 6410 6415 6417 6421 6426 6427 6432 6433 6434 6435 6438 6441 6446 6484 6485 6486 6487 6488 6493 6507 6512

in 11-12/0020r5

Mover Alex / Second John – motion passes with unanimous consent

Returned to discussion on CID 6489.

Motion #68 – approve comments 6489, 6445, 6328, 6327, 6006, 6495, 6483, 6332, 6331, 6376 in 11-12/0020r5

Move: Jon Rosdahl, Second: Chris Hansen Vote: 17/2/1 – Motion Passes

Motion #69 – Thursday AM2 CIDS – 6309, 6310, 6314, 6302, 6464, 6162 in 11-12/0020r6

Move: Chris Hansen, Second: Jon Rosdahl – motion passes with unanimous consent

Continued discussion on CID 6476. Agreement reached on reject.

Comment resolution concluded for this meeting.

Goals for March – complete comment resolution on sponsor ballot and possibly first recirculation ballot.

Presentation of 11-12-0118-00, CID 6001. Author will modify document to include editing instructions including change bars. Presentation will be made on a future conference call.

Meeting adjourned at 15:18.