IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| TGac MAC Adhoc Minutes From November 2011 Plenary | | | | |
| Date: 2011-11-07 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Matthew Fischer | Broadcom | 190 Mathilda Place, Sunnyvale, CA 94086 | +1 408 543 3370 | [mfischer@broadcom.com](mailto:mfischer@broadcom.com) |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document contains the minutes of the TGac MAC adhoc sessions held during the November 2011 IEEE 802.11 plenary meeting in Atlanta.

**Minutes for TGac MAC Adhoc November 10, 2011, AM1**

1. 13:37EST – Session starts
2. Allan Zhu discussed the agenda.
3. **Submission**
   1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1518-02-00ac-resolutions-for-highest-supported-data-rate-cids.doc>
   2. Mark Rison (CSR) presented
   3. CIDs 2855, 3253, 3345 and 3798
   4. Pre-motion #13
      1. Do you agree to accept the resolution to CIDs 2855, 3253, 3345, 3798 under change Set #1, as described in Doc # 11-11/1518r3?
      2. **Pre-motion passed without objections**
      3. **Yes: 19 No: 0 Abstain: 1**
   5. Pre-motion #14
      1. Do you agree to accept the resolution to CIDs 2855, 3253, 3345, 3798 under change Set #2, as described in Doc # 11-11/1518r3?
      2. **Yes: 3 No: 10 Abstain: 8**
      3. Pre-motion failed.
   6. Decided not to run a pre-motion on Set #3
4. **Submission**
   1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1477-02-00ac-cid-3351-comment-resolution.doc>
   2. Mark Rison (CSR) presented
   3. Pre-motion #14
      1. Do you agree to accept the revised resolution to CIDs 3351 as described in Doc # 11-11/1477r3?
      2. **Yes: 2 No: 14 Abstain: 8**
      3. Pre-motion failed.
5. **Submission**
   1. [**https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1391-03-00ac-proposed-resolutions-to-lb-178-miscellaneous-comments.docX**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1391-03-00ac-proposed-resolutions-to-lb-178-miscellaneous-comments.docX)
   2. Mark Rison (CSR) presented
   3. Comment CID 3075 is withdrawn by the commenter
6. **Submission**
   1. [**https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1387-04-00ac-11ac-mac-comment-resolution.doc**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1387-04-00ac-11ac-mac-comment-resolution.doc)
   2. Mark Rison (CSR) presented
   3. Comment CID 3075 is withdrawn by the commenter
   4. Pre-motion #14
      1. Do you agree to accept the revised resolution to CIDs 2157 and 2158 as described in Doc # 11-11/1387r4?
      2. **Yes: 11 No: 3 Abstain: 10**

**Minutes for TGac MAC Adhoc November 9, 2011, PM1**

Minutes taken by Osama Aboul-Magd (Huawei Technologies)

1. 13:37EST – Session starts
2. Allan Zhu discussed the agenda.
3. **Submission**
   1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1553-01-00ac-comment-resolution-to-cid-2109.doc>
   2. David Yang (Huawei) presented
   3. Discussion Points:
      1. Conditioned on TXOP PS NOT Allowed is zero.
      2. Rewarding
   4. Pre-motion #13
      1. Do you agree to accept the resolution to CIDs 2109, as described in Doc # 11-11/1553r2?
      2. **Pre-motion passed without objections**
4. **Submission**
   1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1557-00-00ac-comment-resolution-for-cid-2542.docx>
   2. Sandhya Patil (Samsung) presented
   3. CIDs 2542
   4. Discussion Points:
      1. Include the reason for the rejection of the comment in the table.
   5. Pre-motion #11
      1. Do you agree to accept the resolution to CIDs 2542, as described in Doc # 11-11/11557r0?
      2. **Pre-motion passed without objections**
5. **Submission**
   1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1518-01-00ac-resolutions-for-highest-supported-data-rate-cids.doc>
   2. Mark Rison (CSR) presented
   3. CIDs 2855, 3253, 3345 and 3798.
   4. Discussion Point
      1. Proposed resolutions are not specific to the comment. Suggest to break it to two parts
   5. Mark is to review the submission and upload to the server
6. **Submission**
7. **Submission**
   1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1566-00-00ac-antenna-indication-in-vht-capabilities.doc> and
   2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1568-00-00ac-sta-antenna-indication-in-vht-capabilities.ppt>
   3. Reza Hedyat (Cisco Systems) presented
   4. CID 3398
   5. Pre-motion #12
      1. Do you agree to accept the revised resolution to CIDs 3398, as described in Doc # 11-11/1566r1?
      2. **Pre-motion passed without objections**
   6. **Pre-motion passed without objections**

**Minutes for TGac MAC Adhoc November 8, 2011, PM3**

Minutes taken by Allan Zhu (Samsung)

1. 19:37EST – Session starts
2. Allan Zhu discussed the agenda.
   1. Two presentations scheduled for this session
      1. Doc 1552/r0 from Matt Fischer
      2. Doc xxxx/rx from Yongho
3. Matt presented 1552/r0
   1. Covers CIDs 3554, 3094, 2182, 2719, 2990, 3040, 2326, 3041, 3352, 3111, 3110, 3113, and 3112
   2. The group confirmed the concept that “All VHT STAs are HT STAs”
   3. Pre-motion #9
      1. Do you agree to accept the resolutions to CIDs 3554, 3094, 2182, 2719, 2990, 3040, 2326, 3041, 3352, 3111, 3110, 3113, and 3112, as described in Doc # 11-11/1552r1?
      2. **Pre-motion passed without objections.**
4. Yongho presented 11/1555r0
   1. Pre-motion #10
      1. Do you agree to accept the resolutions to CIDs 2943 and 3553, as described in Doc # 11-11/1555r0?
      2. **Pre-motion passed without objections.**
5. David Yang presented 1553/r0
   1. Time was not enough to finish discussion. The presentation will continue on Wed, PM1.
6. Assigned CID 2542 to Sandhya
7. Wed AM1 session was cancelled given that MAC ad hoc has only 3 presentations left (6 CIDs in total).
   1. 11/1553r0, David
   2. 11/1518r0, Mark
   3. 11/xxxxrx, Sandhya
8. MAC ad hoc recessed at 9:35PM EST. Will meet again at PM1, Wed, Nov 09th, 2011.

**Minutes for TGac MAC Adhoc November 8, 2011, PM2**

1. **16:10 EST – session begins**
2. **Identification of officers and their affiliations**
   1. Allan Zhu continues as chair.
   2. Osama Aboul-Magd, affiliated with Huawei Technologies, takes the minutes.
3. **Submission**
   1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1448-03-00ac-comment-resolution-on-info-element.docx>
   2. Presented by Peter Loc (IWT).
   3. Topic: MAC Comment Resolution
   4. Claims CIDs 3340, 3552
   5. Discussion points:
      1. Continuation of the presentation during PM1.
      2. Two CIDs related to Extended Power Constraint element.
      3. Revise some wording of the editing.
4. **PRE-MOTION #8**
   1. **Do you agree to accept the resolutions to CIDs 3552 and 3340, as described in Doc # 11-11/1448r4?**
   2. **Approved without objection**
5. **Submission**
   1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1518-00-00ac-resolutions-for-highest-supported-data-rate-cids.doc>
   2. Presented by Mark Rison (CSR)
   3. Discussion points
      1. Rounding up and down and same as in 11n
      2. Separation of TX and RX
6. No Pre-Motion was taken. Revisions to the proposed resolutions are needed.
7. **Submission**
   1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1528-01-00ac-cid-3739.docx>
   2. Presented by Tianyu Wu (Huawei Technologies)
   3. CIDs 3739 and 3743 (withdrawn)
   4. Discussion points
      1. The use of the new format
      2. some editorial comments
      3. Changes needed for the RXVECTOR
      4. Justification for adding the proposed scheme
8. Comment was withdrawn.
9. **Schedule for rest of day:**
   1. Tianyu – not present (probable, but tbd)
   2. Mark – 1518r0 – pm2
   3. Illsoo & Yongho – not present
   4. Matt Fisher – evening
   5. David (2019)
10. **Ad-hoc Recesses at 18:00**

**Minutes for TGac MAC Adhoc November 8, 2011, PM1**

1. **13:32 EST – session begins**
2. **Identification of officers and their affiliations**
   1. Allan Zhu continues as chair.
   2. Osama Aboul-Magd, affiliated with Huawei Technologies, takes the minutes.
3. **Submission**
   1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1538-00-00ac-comment-resolution-for-cids-2110-3578-2288.docx>
   2. Presented by Sandhya Patil (Samsung).
   3. Topic: MAC Comment Resolution
   4. Claims CIDs 2110, 3578 and 2288
   5. Discussion points:
      1. CID 2110
         1. Some rewarding suggestions from Mark and Menzo.
         2. Why is the need to send the BAR if other stations are required to go to sleep?
         3. Question about the use of the “shall” and the possible restricting the use of this behaviour.
         4. Add a note to describe the required behaviour.
      2. CID 3578
         1. Agree in principle. Proposed changes are included.
      3. CID 2288
         1. Proposed resolution, Agree in Principle
         2. It should be a reject since you don’t feel there is any need to change
4. **PRE-MOTION # 6**
   1. **Do you agree to accept the resolutions to CIDs 2110, 3578, and 228, as described in Doc # 11-11/1538r1**
   2. **Approved without objection**
5. **Submission**
   1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1543-00-00ac-some-corrections-on-extended-power-constraint-element.doc>
   2. Presented by Illsoo Sohn (LG Electronics)
   3. Not related to comment resolution. It corrects errors introduced in D0.3 related to Extended Power Constraint element.
   4. Discussion Points:
      1. Restrictions for the use with primary 40 and primary 80
6. **PRE-MOTION #7**
   1. **Do you agree to accept the editing instructions on text changes related to power constraint element and extended power constrain element as proposed in doc #11-11/1543r1?**
   2. **Approved without objection.**
7. **Submission**
   1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1448-02-00ac-comment-resolution-on-info-element.docx>
   2. Presented by Peter Loc (IWT)
   3. CIDs 3340, 3552
   4. Discussion Points:
      1. Channels for which power constraint is applicable.
   5. Will be continued during the PM2 session.
8. **Schedule for rest of day:**
   1. Tianyu – not present (probable, but tbd)
   2. Mark – 1518r0 – pm2
   3. Illsoo & Yongho – not present
   4. Matt Fisher - evening
9. **Ad-hoc Recesses at 15:30**

**Minutes for TGac MAC Adhoc November 8, 2011, AM2**

1. **10:32 EST – session begins**
2. **Identification of officers and their affiliations**
   1. Allan Zhu continues as chair.
   2. Adrian Stephens, affiliated with Intel Corporation, takes the minutes.
3. **Submission**
   1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1518-00-00ac-resolutions-for-highest-supported-data-rate-cids.doc>
   2. Presented by Mark Rison (CSR).
   3. Topic: highest supported data rate
   4. Claims CIDs 2855, 3253, 3345, 2798
   5. ZF: 3253 has been resolved in MAC ad-hoc
   6. Discussion points:
      1. Does short guard interval affect interpretation of highest rate in any way?
      2. Location of insert in 9.7
      3. Inconsistency with other 9.7 sections
      4. Whether deleted fields are referenced in other comment resolutions
         1. ZF: need to review in TGac pm2 session when other authors are present to test this
   7. No straw poll until discussion in TGac pm2.
4. **Submission**
   1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1534-00-00ac-d1-0-comment-resolution-cid-2551.doc>
   2. Presented by Rezza Hedayat (CISCO)
   3. CID 2551
   4. Discussion: rewording of proposed changes (resulting in r1)
5. **PRE-MOTION #4**
   1. **Do you agree to accept the resolutions to CID 2551 as described in Doc 11-11/1534r1?**
   2. **Approved without objection**
6. **Submission**
   1. https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1020-05-00ac-comment-resolution-mac-cids-part-1.doc
   2. Presented by Rezza Hedayat
   3. Changes to CID 3091 made on the screen
   4. Topic: changes to 9.19.2.2
   5. Discussion: wording of changes related to exceeding txop limit with NDPA or Beamforming Report Poll.
   6. Discussion: which AC is used to transmit NDPA,NDP,Report sequence?
   7. Updated text uploaded as R6.
   8. What about CID 2955?
7. **PRE-MOTION #5**
   1. **Do you agree to accept the resolution to CIDs 3091 & 2955 as described in Doc 11-11/1020r6?**
   2. **Approved without objection**
8. **CID 3745**
   1. Question: Database claims it is approved, but it does not appear in 11-11-1430r2
   2. AZ agrees to research status, but it doesn’t appear to be approved.
9. **Schedule for rest of day:**
   1. Sandhya, pm1
   2. Tianyu – not present (probable, but tbd)
   3. Mark – 1518r0 – pm2
   4. Illsoo & Yongho – not present
   5. Peter Loc – not present
   6. Matt Fisher - evening
10. **Ad-hoc Recesses at 12:00**

**Minutes for TGac MAC Adhoc November 8, 2011, AM1**

1. **08:07 EST – session begins**
2. **Identification of officers and their affiliations**
   1. MAC Adhoc Co-chair identifies himself as Allan Zhu, and announces his affiliation with Samsung, he is identified as AZ in the minutes.
   2. MAC Adhoc co-chair Matthew Fischer, affiliated with Broadcom Corporation, identified as MF in the minutes, volunteers to take the minutes
3. **Agenda:**
   1. Chair: List of possible presentations as appears in doc 1531r1
   2. Agenda document: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1531-01-00ac-mac-adhoc-agenda-and-report-nov-2011.pptx>
      1. 1519 – Jason Lee
      2. 1520r1 – Jason Lee
      3. Tianyu
      4. 1041r1 – Mark Rison
      5. 1518r0 – Mark Rison
      6. Sanhya
      7. Yongho
   3. Chair: who is ready to present?
      1. Jason Lee
4. **Review of 11-11-1520r1 (Jason Lee (JL) affiliated with ETRI**
   1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1520-01-00ac-d1-0-comment-resolutions-on-mac-cids-in-clause-3-2.docx>
   2. JL: presents document contents
      1. CID 2550
         1. Robert Stacy: Partial AID refers to a field, so no definition is needed
         2. Liwen Chen: definition proposed is incomplete
         3. RS: in 9.17a, I would suggest adding an introductory paragraph to explain what these fields are used for, instead of adding a definition
         4. General agreement to the concept suggested by Robert Stacy
      2. CID 3695
         1. Discussion on whether additional changes are necessary – decided that a few more places in the draft need modification per the comment.
      3. After review of all CIDs with some changes made, the document is revised to version 2
5. **PRE-MOTION #2**
   1. **Do you agree to accept the resolutions to CID 2150, 3128, 2149, 2550, 2554, 3695, 3541, 2606 and 2718 described in doc #11-11-1520r2?**
      1. **Y**
      2. **N**
      3. **A**
      4. **AZ: Is there any discussion on the pre-motion?**
      5. **None noted.**
      6. **AZ: is there any objection to the promotion?**
      7. **None noted.**
      8. **AZ: promotion passes.**
6. **Review of 11-11-1041r1 (Mark Rison) (MR) affiliated with CSR**
   1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1041-01-00ac-resolutions-for-vht-single-mpdu-cids.doc>
   2. MR: presents document contents
      1. CID 2874, 3364
         1. Deletion of most of the proposed definitions is recommended after some discussion, modification of some portions of the document performed in response to comments from the group
         2. Modified document is straw polled for approval as r2
7. **PRE-MOTION #3**
   1. **Do you agree to accept the resolutions to CID 2874 and 3364 as described in doc #11-11-1041r2?**
      1. **Y**
      2. **N**
      3. **A**
      4. **AZ: Is there any discussion on the pre-motion?**
      5. **None noted.**
      6. **AZ: is there any objection to the promotion?**
      7. **None noted.**
      8. **AZ: promotion passes.**
8. **Recess**
   1. AZ: Who else is ready to present besides Mark R?
   2. AZ: Yongho?
   3. AZ: Sandhya?
      1. Sandhya – in the afternoon.
   4. 9:57 EST chair declares group in recess until Tuesday AM2 session

**Minutes for TGac MAC Adhoc November 7, 2011, PM1**

1. **14:48 EST – session begins (leftover time from TGac session)**
2. **Identification of officers and their affiliations**
   1. MAC Adhoc Co-chair identifies himself as Allan Zhu, and announces his affiliation with Samsung, he is identified as AZ in the minutes.
   2. MAC Adhoc co-chair Matthew Fischer, affiliated with Broadcom Corporation, identified as MF in the minutes, volunteers to take the minutes
3. **Agenda:**
   1. Chair: Agenda was sent to the reflector
      1. Agenda document: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1531-00-00ac-mac-adhoc-agenda-and-report-nov-2011.pptx>
   2. Agenda includes the following items
      1. Roll call
      2. Approval of agenda
      3. IEEE patent policy -"Refer the correct section or IEEE Patcom URL"  
         <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt>
         1. No objection to agenda
      4. Minutes from previous sessions: <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1290-03-00ac-september-2011-mac-ad-hoc-meeting-minutes.docx>
         1. No discussion on minutes
         2. No objection to approving minutes
4. **Review of outstanding comments**
   1. AZ: sent out list of CIDs to assignees – received some responses of some documents being prepared to address some of the comments
   2. AZ: some discrepancy between editor’s count and MAC adhoc count of remaining unresolved comments
   3. Discussion of questions of assignment of CIDs
   4. AZ: Who is ready for presentation at this time?
      1. Jason Lee (Jae Sung Lee) (JL) and Mark Rison (MR) respond. Jason will be first.
   5. JL: my affiliation is ETRI
   6. JL: doc 11-11-1519r0 review
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/11/11-11-1519-00-00ac-d1-0-comment-resolutions-on-clause-9-19-2.docx>
5. **PRE-MOTION #1**
   1. **Do you agree to accept the resolutions to CID 2915, 3376, 3092, 3093 as described in doc #11-11-1519r1?**
      1. **Y**
      2. **N**
      3. **A**
      4. **AZ: Is there any discussion on the pre-motion?**
      5. **None noted.**
      6. **AZ: is there any objection to the promotion?**
      7. **None noted.**
      8. **AZ: promotion passes.**

**References:**