IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Comment Resolution for LB 178 (D1.0): resolutions for miscellaneous MIB CIDs |
| Date: 3 November 2011 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Robert Stacey | Apple |  | 503-724-0893 | rstacey@apple.com |

Abstract

This document provides a resolution for CIDs 3579, 3057, 2506, 3623

## Comment

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3579 | 94.57 | 57 | 10.2.1.4a | "dot11VHTPSProbeDelay" - there is no such mib variableDitto with dot11TXOPPowerSave at 94.16 | Review all references to "dot11\*" in the text outside clause C and ensure that they refer to variables in clause C by inserting new variables or correcting references. | P – Add MIB entry for dot11VHTPSProbeDelay. In D1.2 dot11TXOPPowerSave is named dot11VHTTXOPPowerSave-OptionImplemented. See 11/yyyy |

## Resolution

***Add a MIB entry for dot11VHTPSProbeDelay:***

Dot11VHTStationConfigEntry ::=

SEQUENCE {

dot11MaxMPDULength INTEGER,

dot11VHTMaxRxAMPDUFactor Unsigned32,

dot11VHTControlFieldSupported TruthValue,

dot11VHTTXOPPowerSaveOptionImplemented TruthValue,

dot11VHTRxMCSMap OCTET STRING,

dot11VHTRxHighestDataRateSupported Unsigned32,

dot11VHTTxMCSMap OCTET STRING,

dot11VHTTxHighestDataRateSupported Unsigned32

dot11VHTPSProbeDelay Unsigned32

}

dot11VHTPSProbeDelay OBJECT-TYPE

SYNTAX Unsigned32 (0..65535)

MAX-ACCESS read-write

STATUS current

DESCRIPTION

“This is a control variable.

It is written by an external management entity or the SME.

Changes take effect as soon as practical in the implementation.

This attribute indicates the minimum amount of time in units of microseconds the

STA waits before accessing the medium after transitioning from the Doze state to

Awake state while operating in TXOP power save mode."

DEFVAL { 1000 }

::= { Dot11VHTStationConfigEntry 9 }

## Comment

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3057 | 237.20 | 20 | Annex C | There are missing commas in the OPTIONAL-GROUPS list. I appreciate that these are comments, but it should be tidied up. | As per comment | AGREE – As suggested |

## Resolution

-- dot11PhyMCSGroup,

-- dot11TransmitBeamformingGroup,

-- dot11VHTTransmitBeamformingGroup,

-- dot11PhyVHTComplianceGroup,

-- dot11VHTMACAdditions,

-- dot11WNMCompliance}

## Comment

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 2506 | 198.17 | 17 | 22.4.2 | These BF modes apply to VHT, and are a break from the past wrt 11n. Suggest create a new MIB table (e.g. dot11VHTTransmitBeamformingConfigTable) and populate it with the MIB variables from P198L17-L29 | As in comment | AGREE – As suggested |

## Resolution

***Move the VHT Transmit Beamforming related entries to a new table dot11VHTTransmitBeamforming:***

Dot11VHTTransmitBeamformingConfigEntry ::=

SEQUENCE {

dot11VHTSUBeamformeeOptionImplemented TruthValue,

dot11VHTSUBeamformerOptionImplemented TruthValue,

dot11VHTMUBeamformeeOptionImplemented TruthValue,

dot11VHTMUBeamformerOptionImplemented TruthValue,

dot11VHTNumberSoundingDimensions Unsigned32,

dot11VHTBeamformeeNTxSupport Unsigned32

}

 ***etc***.

## Comment

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 3623 | C.3 | For discussion in the group. How useful does the group expect their MIB to be?The only uses that TGmb could track down were implementations of subsets of the 802.11 MIB. This can be traced to two root causes:1. The over long size of the MIB (20,000 lines)2. Breaking the IETF rules on editing of groups and module-compliance statements.3. Not having compliance requirements for ~400 of its variables.The 11MEC process (still under debate) attempts to slightly improve this picture going forward by requiring compliance statements for new variables. The proposed change is in line with the recommendations of the unapproved 11MEC process document. | Create one or more VHT-specific groups and put all VHT variables in these groups. Note editing an existing group is forbidden by IETF rules, so tacking on to the end of an existing group is forbidden. Marking an existing group as deprecated and defining a new group containing all the previous contents, plus a bunch of new ones is also allowed.The VHT groups could be organized by mandatory vs optional features.Create a single module-compliance statement for VHT that cites these groups. It can also cite other groups such as HTMACAdditions as either optional or mandatory. (You could also create additional module-compliance statements for major features such as MU, but I doubt it's worth the effort.)This can be refined, e.g. a specific object within a group can be called out as mandatory. | DISAGREE – The task group has a love-hate relationship with the MIB. Since there is still some love, keep the MIB. |