IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| [July 2011 MAC ad hoc meeting minutes] | | | | |
| Date: 2011-07-21 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | Email |
| Matthew Fischer | Broadcom | 190 Mathilda Place, Sunnyvale, CA 94086 | +1 408 543 3370 | [mfischer@broadcom.com](mailto:mfischer@broadcom.com) |
| Jae Seung Lee | ETRI | 161 Gajeong-dong, Yuseong-gu, Daejeon, Korea | +82 42 860 1326 | [jasonlee@etri.re.kr](mailto:jasonlee@etri.re.kr) |
| Chunhui (Allan) Zhu | Samsung Electronics | 75 W Plumeria Dr.  San Jose, CA 95134 | +1-408-544-2751 | [c.zhu@samsung.com](mailto:c.zhu@samsung.com) |

Abstract

[This document contains the minutes of TGac MAC ad hoc group meetings held between July 18 and July 21, 2011. The minutes were taken by Allan Zhu. Note texts in green indicate CIDs that have resolutions passed the ad hoc group pre-motions and texts in Red indicate CIDs that are pending for more discussions or further resolutions.]

AM1, Mon, 7/18/2011

Matt Fischer from Broadcom hosted this MAC ad hoc meeting.

9:05AM, Matt called the meeting to order.

Matt went through the agenda (doc # 11-11/1022r0)

Matt asked for any known patents related to our TGac. Heard none.

The ad hoc approved the meeting minutes taken by Jason Lee for IEEE May meeting in Palm Springs by unanimous consent.

Matt collected submissions for this ad hoc.

**Simon Marlin (Qualcomm) presented “Duration Field in MU PPDUs”, doc # 11/11-994r0.**

* No rejections to the resolution for CID 3095 as presented in doc # 11/11-994r0.

**Simon Marlin (Qualcomm) presented “A-MSDU section”, doc # 11/11-993r0.**

Robert reminded people that the LB is based on REVmb D8.0. It is mentioned in the title page of draft D1.0.

Long discussion on the wording of the last paragraph of the document. Simon will come back with a revision of this document.

**Simon Marlin (Qualcomm) presented “ACK policy for QoS Null”, doc # 11/11-992r0.**

* No rejections to the resolutions for CIDs 3403 and 3418 as presented in doc # 11/11-992r0.

**Liwen Chu (STMicro) presented “D0.1 Comment Resolution – CID 2163, 2714, 2715, 2716”, doc # 11/11-931r1.**

* No rejections to the resolutions for CIDs 2163, 2714, 2715 and 2716 as presented in doc # 11/11-931r1.

**Liwen Chu (STMicro) presented “9.19.2.5 Comment Resolutions”, doc # 11/11-933r0.**

* There were discussions on resolutions related to CIDs 3746, 3752, 3793, 3406, and 3421. David Yang from Huawei and Allan Zhu from Samsung would like to work on the topic together. Allan mentioned that simulations on backoff rules are undergoing and preliminary results have shown the current backoff rules have fairness issues for both successful and failed transmission.
* No rejection to the resolutions for CID 3794 as presented in doc # 11/11-933r0.
* No rejections to the resolutions for CIDs 2888 and 3379 as presented in doc # 11/11-933r0.

Matt went through the comments that have not been assigned to any owners.

The meeting recessed at 11:01AM.

AM2, Tuesday, 19 July 2011

Meeting started at 10:30AM.

Matt Fischer discussed agenda and presentations submitted.

**Simon Marlin (Qualcomm) presented “Partial AID”, doc # 11/11-991r0.**

* Comments/questions received on the proposed new text and the equation in Table 9-YYY.
* Modifications to the document were made during the discussion.
* Simon will submit an updated version (991r1) for pre-motion later.

**Chao-chun Wang (MediaTek) presented “D0.1 Comment Resolution” related to Section 8.4.2.102 (doc # 11/11-1018r1).**

* No rejections to the resolutions for CIDs 2608, 2623, and 3698, as presented in doc # 11/11-1018r2 (a revision of r1).
* No rejections to the resolutions for CIDs 3254, 2674, and 3184, as presented in doc # 11/11-1018r1.
* No rejections to the resolutions for CIDs 2297 and 2726, as presented in doc # 11/11-1018r1.
* No rejections to the resolutions for CIDs 2274, 2275 and 3258, as presented in doc # 11/11-1018r1.

**Reza Hedayat (Cisco) presented “D1.0 Comment Resolution – Various MAC comments”, doc # 11/11-1020r0.**

* Time was not enough for finishing the discussion. No promotions passed. The presentation will continue in next MAC session on Thursday.

The meeting recessed at 12:35PM.

PM1, Wednesday, 20 July 2011

Meeting started at 1:35PM.

**Reza Hedayat (Cisco) continuted to presented the revised “D1.0 Comment Resolution – Various MAC comments”, doc # 11/11-1020r1.**

* Heavy discussion on the whether the rule “The inclusion of secondary AC traffic in an MU PPDU shall not increase the duration of the PPDU beyond that required to transport the primary AC traffic alone.”
  + The concerns raised are related to whether this limition is actually testable and whether the spec should give implementers more flexibility.
  + It was accepted with a small modification; removing the word “alone” at the end and adding “MU” before the second “PPDU” in the sentence.
* A new revision has been created (11/11-1020r2) reflecting changes during the discussion.
* No rejections to the resolutions for CIDs 2786, 3621, 2008, 3493, 2107, 3304, 2946, 3090, 3485, 2295, 3373, 2009, 3495, as presented in doc # 11/11-1020r2.
* Peter Loc would like to see more discussions on CIDs 2955 and 3091 regarding the dynamic bandwidth operation. Matt would wait until Thu, 21 July, to hear more discussions/proposals. If no submissions received for these two resolutions, a pre-motion will be made.

Matt discussed the agenda and collected more submissions.

**Simon Marlin (Qualcomm) presented a revised version of “A-MSDU section”, doc # 11/11-993r2.**

* No rejections to the resolutions for CIDs 2292, 2293, 3060, 3063, and 3349 as presented in doc # 11/11-993r3 (a new revision).

**Simon Marlin (Qualcomm) presented a revised version of “Partial AID”, doc # 11/11-991r1.**

* No rejections to the resolutions for CIDs 2167, 3088, 3496, 3089, 2171, 3370, 3371, 3704, 2294, 2680, 3674, and 3350, as presented in doc # 11/11-993r2 (a new revision created during the presentation).

**Hongyuan Zhang (Marvell) presented “D1.0 Comment Resolutions on (V)HTC Field Format”, doc #** **11/11-969r0**

* The ad hoc group reviewed the resolutions for CIDs 2085, 2086, 3482 and 3706, as presented in doc # 11/11-969r1, but no decisions were made. Robert suggested talking to 11aa people before we do pre-motion for these CIDs.
* No rejections to the resolutions for CIDs 2024, 3773, and 3774, as presented in doc # 11/11-969r1.
* David from Huawei announced that he would propose a resolution to CIDs 3749. So the resolution to this CID is deferred and Huawei will provide the resolution.
* No rejections to the resolutions for CIDs 3772 as presented in doc # 11/11-969r1.
* No rejections to the resolutions for CIDs 3130, 3737, 3738, 2116, and 2122, as presented in doc # 11/11-969r1.
* Hongyuan didn’t have enough time to finish his presentation. He will continue the presentation during AM2 of Thu.

The meeting recessed at 3:35PM.

AM2, Thursday, 21 July 2011

Meeting started at 10:31AM.

Matt discussed the agenda and the submissions.

**Mark Rison (CSR)** **presented “Resolutions for VHT single MPDU CIDs”, doc #** **11/11-1041r0**

* No rejections to the resolutions for CIDs 2874 and 3364 as presented in doc # 11/11-1041r1.
* Mark to upload the new revision.

**Sun Bo (ZTE)** **presented “VHT Operation Information Subfields”, doc #** **11/11-1048r0**

* No rejections to the resolution for CID 2949 as presented in doc # 11/11-1048r0.

**Hongyuan Zhang (Marvell) continue his presentation of “D1.0 Comment Resolutions on (V)HTC Field Format”, doc #** **11/11-969r1**

* No rejections to the resolution for CIDs 2986, 2987, 2988, 3023, 3024 and 3025, as presented in doc # 11/11-969r1.
* CIDs 2085, 2086, 3482 and 3706 were revisited. Hongyuan had sent emails to the comments and Robert mentioned the commentors had agreed with the resolutions. So the resolutions to these CIDs have been accepted.

**Kaiying Lv would like to defer her presentation of 11-11/ 988 to next F2F meeting.**

**Reza Hedayat (Cisco) presented “D1.0 Comment Resolution – Various CIDs”, doc # 11/11-1060r0.**

* Straw Poll: “How many people believe TGac should reject the CID 3702 (and its duplicates) since it is out of scope of TGac?”
  + Reject: 12
  + Do not reject: 4
  + Abstain: 7
* Reza would continue to work on the resolutions.
* No rejections to the resolutions for CIDs 3500, 2177, and 3109, as presented in doc # 11/11-1060r1.

**David Yang (Huawei) presented “Comments Resolution on CID 3749”, doc # 11/11-1081r0**

* Questions raised on the simulation results. People tried to understand why there is a big difference gap between the two curves on slide 4.
* Matt suggested deferring the discussion on this resolution to PM1. No objections to the suggestion.

Matt asked Peter whether he had resolution to CIDs 2955 and 3091 as presented in 11/11-1020r1. Peter mentioned that he is still working on the resolutions and he would like to present it during PM1, Thu.

James Wang (MediaTek) mentioned that he had a contribution to be presented in PM1, Thu.

Matt went through the comment sheet to assign CIDs that have no owners.

The meeting recessed at 12:30PM and will resume at 1:30PM, today.

PM1, Thursday, 21 July 2011

Meeting started at 1:35PM.

**Illsoo Sohn (LGE ) presented “D1.0 Comment Resolution – Group ID”, doc # 11/11-1063r0.**

* This was originally a MU-MIMO ad hoc presentation; it was moved to MAC ad hoc since MU-MIMO ad hoc has no more available slots during the week.
* No rejections to the resolutions for CIDs 2014, 2015, 2115, 2117, 2461, 2665, 2700, 2918, 3426, 3682, 2701,3682, and 3713, as presented in doc # 11/11-1063r0, with “Agree in Principle” to the resolution of CID 2461.

**James Wang (MediaTek) presented “D1.0 Comment Resolution”, doc # 11/11-0966r1.**

* Hongyuan Zhang requested more time to consider the resolution to CID 2662.
* No rejections to the resolutions for CIDs 2672 and 3044, as presented in doc # 11/11-0966r1.
* There were discussions on CIDs 3174, 3175 and 3397. James will bring back new resolutions to these CIDs.

Matt continued to assign comments to indivisuals. The following comments have been resolved during the process. The resolutions can be found in the editor’s consolidated comment sheet to be released.

* 3105, 3805, 3804, 2920.

The MAC ad hoc group adjourned for this F2F meeting at 3:30PM.