IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Comment resolution for CIDs: 1792, 1791, 1790, 155, 1485, 708, 1275, 1793 | | | | |
| Date: 2011-05-11 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Patil Sandhya | Samsung |  |  | [sandhya.raga@samsung.com](mailto:sandhya.raga@samsung.com) |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

The document provides the comment resolution for the CIDs: 1792, 1791, 1790, 155, 1485, 708, 1275, 1793.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 708 | Kneckt, Jarkko | 9.2.0b.6a | 45 | 50 | TR | The restriction for VHT STA not to transmit to legacy STA? What is a legacy STA? Is it non-VHT STA | Delete the sentence or justify why it is needed. | DISAGREE  Clarification: If VHT STA that initiates the TXOP by RTS with Individual/Group bit set to 1, and later if sends the RTS to legacy STA during the same TXOP, the legacy STA will not respond since the TA address does not match (Individual/Group bit for Legacy STA = 0) though it is from same TA. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1792 | Patil, Sandhya | 9.2.0b.6a | 45 | 49 | TR | A VHT STA that initiates a TXOP by transmitting a RTS with the Multicast/Unicast bit in the TA set to Multicast, shall not send a RTS to a legacy STA for the duration of the TXOP. | Is it necessary to include this condition for the transmitting VHT STA? What in case when there is not CTS received by this STA? | DISAGREE  See CID resolution #708 |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 155 | Carney, Bill | 9.2.0b.6a | 45 | 34 | TR | In order to protect against hidden nodes, CTS must be sent by all STAs that are receivers of VHT frames. To minimize overhead, a VHT RTS frame should be defined that requests all receiveing STAs to sequentially send CTSs. | As specified | DISAGREE. For MU, the group ID may change for each frame and there can be more number of STAs that are members each group ID. Hence it is not feasible to choose the reciepints per group/ per frame and request CTSs from each recipient in a group. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1790 | Patil, Sandhya | 9.2.0b.6a | 45 | 36 | TR | The Individual/Group bit is set to 1 only when the VHT STA is trying to transmit >20MHz mask PPDU and not 20MHz only | Include "when CH\_BANDWIDTH TXVECTOR is greater than 20MHz" | AGREE IN PRINCIPLE  The suggested resolution applies to the control frame that is not RTS. See 11-11-0616r2. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1791 | Patil, Sandhya | 9.2.0b.6a | 45 | 41 | TR | If the VHT STA sending the RTS frame is using dynamic bandwidth operation, it shall set the INDICATED\_DYN\_BANDWIDTH TXVECTOR parameter to Dynamic. Otherwise, the STA shall set the TXVECTOR parameter INDICATED\_DYN\_BANDWIDTH to Static. | INDICATED\_DYN\_BANDWIDTH is more meaningful if it is boolean and change the dynamic or static to true of false in the sentences | AGREE IN PRINCIPLE. CID #1798 which is same as this for TXVECTOR parameters and has been resolved with CID #197 (TXVECTOR table). |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1485 | Lv, Kaiying | 9.2.0b.6a | 45 | 49 | TR | "Multicast/Unicast "bit in TA has been changed into " Individual/Group bit" | A VHT STA that initiates a TXOP by transmitting a RTS with the Multicast/Unicast Individual/Group bit in the TA set to Multicast 1, shall not send a RTS to a legacy STA for the duration of the TXOP. | AGREE. Changed in document 11-11-0616r2. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1275 | Stephens, Adrian | 9.2.0b.6a | 45 | 50 | TR | "legacy STA" - no, no, no, no, no.  There is no such thing as a legacy STA. | Say what you mean, i.e. what combination of capabilities are you trying to express with use of the evil word "legacy". | AGREE. Changed to non-VHT STA in document 11-11-0616r2. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1793 | Patil, Sandhya | 9.2.0b.7 | 45 | 58 | TR | A non-VHT STA that is addressed by an RTS frame shall transmit a CTS frame after a SIFS period if the NAV at the STA receiving the RTS frame indicates that the medium is idle. | It is for all STAs and applies to VHT STA also. In addition to this when the RXVECTOR parameter INDICATED\_DYN\_BANDWIDTH is valid the conditions in the next two paragraphs need to be met. | WITHDRAWN  The section has been revised in document 11-11-0616r2 and comment is no more valid. |

Pre-Motion 1:

Do you accept the resolutions provided to the CIDs 1792, 1791, 1790, 155, 1485, 708, 1275, 1793?

Yes:

No:

Abstain:

**References:**

1. IEEE Draft P802.11ac\_D0.1
2. IEEE 11-11-0276-05-00ac-tgac-d0-1-comments