

Comments

CiD	Commenter	Vote	Category	Page	Sub-clause	Line #	Comment	Proposed Change	Must Be Satisfied	Response	Proposed Change
1	Geoffrey Garner	Approve	Editorial	52	9.2.1	25	In the sentence: "Specifications associated an assigned EtherType describe the method to parse the remainder of the data field to extract the protocol identifier." "with" is needed after "associated." In addition, on subsequently looking at the resolution of comment #13 against D1.3, it appears that "with" should have been included right after "associated".	Insert "with" after "associated" so that the sentence reads: "Specifications associated with an assigned EtherType describe the method to parse the remainder of the data field to extract the protocol identifier."	No	Rejected	The draft will be professionally edited prior to publication.
2	Marco Hernandez	Approve	Technical	41	8.1	8	Clarification for standards using 64-bit MAC addresses.	Please replace the sentence "New IEEE 802 standards that only require routed connectivity should use 64-bit MAC addressing." with "IEEE standards specifying the use of 64-bit MAC addresses that require interoperability with other entities also using 64-bit MAC addresses should use a switch in L2 (link layer), but if those standards require interoperability with other entities using 48-bit MAC addresses should use a router in L3 (network layer)." And please add a footnote in "router": "The router should implement the use of 48-bit MAC addresses and 64-bit MAC addresses."	No	Rejected	The comment is on unchanged text from the previous draft and is out of scope of the current recirculation.
3	Marco Hernandez	Approve	Editorial	51	9.1	35	LPDU?	Please add LPDU to acronyms.	No	Rejected	The draft will be professionally edited prior to publication.
4	Marco Hernandez	Approve	Technical	51	9.1	36	Clarification in the use of PIF by the LLC or MAC and avoiding "opaque".	Please replace "In principle, the LPDU is carried as a MAC service data unit and is opaque to the MAC; use of the LPDU structure is limited to the LLC endpoints of the IEEE 802 network. Some exceptions to this opacity are specified in IEEE 802 standards; for example, the first two octets of the LPDU are exposed to the Ethernet MAC of IEEE Std 802.3." with "The LPDU [frame] is encapsulated in the MSDU. However, in some IEEE 802.3 standards, the first two octets of the PIF are appended to the MPDU."	No	Rejected	The comment is on unchanged text from the previous draft and is out of scope of the current recirculation.
5	Roger Marks	Approve	Technical	53	9.2.3	35	The text in the box reading "(see Figure 18)" is incomplete. As indicated above the box, the size of this field is either 0 or 6. In the case of Fig. 18, the length is 6. The uncited case, per Fig. 20, provides the example of length 0. [Note: The voter considers the comment essential but is voting Approve.]	Replace "(see Figure 18)" with "(see Figs. 18 and 20)".	No	Rejected	The group was unable to come to consensus to make the suggested change.
6	Jessy Rouyer	Approve	Editorial	52	9.2.1	25	Revised comment 13 in the previous ballot was not applied completely.	Change "associated an assigned" to "associated with an assigned".	No	Rejected	The draft will be professionally edited prior to publication.
7	Jessy Rouyer	Approve	Editorial	57	9.5.2.2	20	Accepted comment 30 in the previous ballot was not applied completely.	Change "then MAC" to "then the MAC".	No	Rejected	The draft will be professionally edited prior to publication.