

IEEE P802.3.2 unsatisfied comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P47 L44 # I-11

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

In module ieee802-ethernet-interface:

White space changes.

Simplify descriptions.

Move "import iana-if-type" up in file

import of new ieee802-ethernet-phy-type module

Obsolete dynamic-rate-control objects

Only used by obsolete 10GBASE-W, Clause 49 10 Gb/s 64B/66B and Clause 50

WIS

Simplify descriptions for PAUSE frame objects.

Update description for augment "/if:interfaces/if:interface" to remove "P2P" restriction.

Clean up "Discontinuities in the values of counters" in descriptions.

Simplify descriptions for PAUSE frame objects.

Simplify descriptions for LPI counters.

Add

Leaves

phy_type.

pmd_type.

Containers

pause.

Obsolete

Leaves

speed – already in interfaces objects.

Containers

flow-control

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate changes to D3.0 module ieee802-ethernet-interface as described in P802.3.2_D3.0_peter_jones_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-interface.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering.

Also replace the text in 5.3.1.1 ieee802-ethernet-interface with the text in ieee802-ethernet-interface.tree.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Implemented with editorial license to resolve any formatting conflicts

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.2 P62 L55 # I-12

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

In module ieee802-ethernet-interface-half-duplex:

Change module description given 10BASE-T1S/M are half-duplex

Obsolete dynamic-rate-control objects

Only used by obsolete 10GBASE-W, Clause 49 10 Gb/s 64B/66B and Clause 50 WIS

White space changes

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate changes to D3.0 module ieee802-ethernet-interface-half-duplex as described in P802.3.2_D3.0_peter_jones_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-interface-half-duplex.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering.

Also replace the text in 5.3.1.2 ieee802-ethernet-interface-half-duplex with the text in ieee802-ethernet-interface-half-duplex.tree.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Implemented with editorial license to resolve any formatting conflicts

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.3 P67 L22 # I-13

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

In module ieee802-ethernet-mac-merge:

description simplification and cleanups

add typedef enable-disable to avoid copy/paste definitions

add "Discontinuities in the values of counters" boilerplate for statistics container

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate changes to D3.0 module ieee802-ethernet-mac-merge as described in P802.3.2_D3.0_peter_jones_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-mac-merge.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering.

Also replace the text in 5.3.1.3 ieee802-ethernet-mac-merge with the text in ieee802-ethernet-mac-merge.tree.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Implemented with editorial license to resolve any formatting conflicts

IEEE P802.3.2 unsatisfied comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.4 P73 L60 # [-14]

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type GR Comment Status A

In module ieee802-ethernet-lldp:
import of new ieee802-ethernet-phy-type module
add "config false" to " augment "/lldp:lldp:port" {"
description cleanups
remove unneeded "config false;" for leaves in augment "/lldp:lldp:port/lldp:remote-
systems-data" {
Add
Comments for "leaf block" functional areas
Leafs
auto-negotiation-cap-bits
operational-pmd-type
local-max-frame-size
Link Aggregation leaves
Obsolete
Leafs
auto-negotiation-cap – PHY/PMD types now defined.
auto-negotiation-cap-bits – PHY/PMD types now defined

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate changes to D3.0 module module ieee802-ethernet-lldp as described in
P802.3.2_D3.0_peter_jones_changes.docx and contained in module ieee802-ethernet-
lldp.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and
numbering.
Also replace the text in 5.3.1.4 ieee802-ethernet-lldp with the text in ieee802-ethernet-
lldp.tree.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Implemented with editorial license to resolve any formating conflicts

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.4 P107 L35 # [-16]

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

Add new subclause after 5.3.2.4 for new ieee802-ethernet-phy module based on IEEE8023-
MAU-MIB

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate new module ieee802-ethernet-phy as described in
P802.3.2_D3.0_peter_jones_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-phy.yang as
submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering.
Also incorporate the text in ieee802-ethernet-phy.tree into new subclause after 5.3.1.4
ieee802-ethernet-lldp.
In "5.1 YANG module structure", add "ieee802-ethernet-phy YANG module contains
definitions for managing IEEE Std 802.3 PHY devices after the paragraph starting
"ieee802-ethernet-mac-merge YANG module contains...".

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Implemented with editorial license to resolve any formating conflicts and generate YANG
tree

IEEE P802.3.2 unsatisfied comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.4 P107 L35 # [-15]

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

Add new subclause after 5.3.2.4 for new ieee802-ethernet-phy-type module based on IANA-MAU-MIB REVISION 202309070000Z

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate new module ieee802-ethernet-phy-type as described in P802.3.2_D3.0_peter_jones_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-phy-type.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering.
 Also incorporate the text in ieee802-ethernet-phy-type.tree into new subclause after 5.3.1.4 ieee802-ethernet-lldp.
 In "5.1 YANG module structure", add "ieee802-ethernet-phy-type YANG module contains definitions including PHY type, PMD type, etc" after the paragraph starting "ieee802-ethernet-mac-merge YANG module contains..."

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Amended ETHERNET-PHY-TYPE YANG, indicating it is correct as of date of writing. Additionally added note stating this module may in future be maintained by an external organization (IANA).

Implemented ETHERNET-PHY-TYPE YANG with editorial license to resolve any formatting conflicts and generate YANG tree

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P113 L33 # [-17]

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

In module ieee802-ethernet-pse:
 obsolete ieee802-ethernet-pse.yang from 802.3.2-2019

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate changes to D3.0 module ieee802-ethernet-pse as described in P802.3.2_D3.0_peter_jones_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-pse.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Implemented with editorial license to resolve any formatting conflicts and generate YANG tree

Editor to consult YANGSTERS on how to incorporate the changes of obsolete ieee802-ethernet-pse.yang

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P124 L1 # [-18]

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

Add new subclause after 6.5.1.1 ieee802-ethernet-pse for new ieee802-ethernet-pse-2024 module based on 802.3.2-2019 ieee802-ethernet-pse.yang

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate new module ieee802-ethernet-pse-2024 as described in P802.3.2_D3.0_peter_jones_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-pse-2024.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering.
 Also incorporate the text in ieee802-ethernet-pse-2024.tree into new subclause after 6.5.1.1 ieee802-ethernet-pse.
 In "6.2 YANG module structure",
 change

"The ieee802-ethernet-pse YANG module of this clause is focused on the configuration and monitoring of the Power over Ethernet (PoE) function defined in IEEE Std 802.3, including power via MDI, as well as Power over Data Line which can also be considered as the single pair PoE. The module augments the ieee802-ethernet-interface YANG module with attributes for the PoE function. The module is partitioned into two major containers.

The PoE PSE container describes a multi-pair PSE, while the PoDL PSE describes a single-pair PSE."

to
 "The ieee802-ethernet-pse-2024 YANG module of this clause is focused on the configuration and monitoring of Power over Ethernet (PoE) functions defined in IEEE Std 802.3, including:

- Clause 33: Power over Ethernet over 2 Pairs
- Clause 104: Power over Data Lines (PoDL) of Single-Pair Ethernet
- Clause 145: Power over Ethernet

The module augments the ieee802-ethernet-interface YANG module with attributes for PoE.

The PoE PSE container has two sub-containers for Multi-Pair PoE (Clauses 33 and 145) and Single-Pair PoE (Clause 104).

The ieee802-ethernet-pse YANG module has been deprecated."

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Implemented with editorial license to resolve any formatting conflicts and generate YANG tree

Editor to consult YANGSTERS on how to incorporate the changes of naming new module

IEEE P802.3.2 unsatisfied comments

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P185 L28 # L-19

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

In module ieee802-ethernet-link-oam:
add "master" to loopback-status enum descriptions.
Whitespace cleanup for "leaf threshold" description.

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate changes to D3.0 module ieee802-ethernet-link-oam as described in P802.3.2_D3.0_peter_jones_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-link-oam.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering.
Also replace the text in 8.5.1.1 ieee802-ethernet-link-oam with the text in ieee802-ethernet-link-oam.tree.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Implemented with editorial license to resolve any formating conflicts and generate YANG tree

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P191 L18 # L-21

Thomas, Angela RAC Coordination

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

The description of 'vendor-oui' includes "24-bit MAC addresses - large(MA-L). Previously know as Organizationally Unique Identifier (OUI).", citing IEEE Std 802-2014, Clause 8.2.2. The description of OUI therein was corrected and clarified in IEEE Std 802c-2017, and a new revision, nearing completion, will supersede the 2014 revision. The current description is inaccurate.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the description to "Organizationally Unique Identifier (OUI) as assigned to vendor by the IEEE Registration Authority" and the reference to "IEEE Std 802, subclause 8.2.2". Delete "-2014" from "IEEE Std 802(R)-2014" in Clause 2.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3.2 unsatisfied comments

Cl 1 **SC 1.4** **P15** **L23** # **R1-1**

Parsons, Glenn Ericsson AB

Comment Type **TR** **Comment Status** **A**

This was not the intent of my comment I-25. There are complicating implications of making the git version the authoritative version. The authoritative version of the YANG has to be part of the standard.

And then this paragraph is about formatting of YANG in PDF. So the authoritative point should be made in the first paragraph, and also in 5.3.2, 6.5.2, 7.4.2 , 8.5.2

SuggestedRemedy

Reword last sentence of last paragraph:
"In case of any discrepancies, the machine-readable files attached to this standard take precedence"

Reword previous paragraph to start:
The authoritative machine-readable YANG files are attached to this standard. A copy is also available for download at the following URL: ...

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl 5 **SC 5.3.2** **P47** **L4** # **R1-6**

Parsons, Glenn Ericsson AB

Comment Type **TR** **Comment Status** **A**

This was not the intent of my comment I-25. There are complicating implications of making the git version the authoritative version. The authoritative version of the YANG has to be part of the standard.

But this paragraph is unrelated, this is about the discrepancy within the descriptive text and tables about the module and the actual YANG module. It must be retained. To align with the formatting issues mentioned in 1.4, it is proposed that the attached version of the YANG take precedence

SuggestedRemedy

replace deleted paragraph, so that the first paragraph of this clause is:

"In the YANG module definition, should any discrepancy between the text of the description for individual YANG nodes in the YANG modules of this clause and the corresponding definition in 5.2 through 5.3 of this clause occur, the definitions in the YANG modules attached to this standard shall take precedence."

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl 6 **SC 6.5.2** **P183** **L4** # **R1-3**

Parsons, Glenn Ericsson AB

Comment Type **TR** **Comment Status** **A**

This was not the intent of my comment I-25. There are complicating implications of making the git version the authoritative version. The authoritative version of the YANG has to be part of the standard.

But this paragraph is unrelated, this is about the discrepancy within the descriptive text and tables about the module and the actual YANG module. It must be retained. To align with the formatting issues mentioned in 1.4, it is proposed that the attached version of the YANG take precedence

SuggestedRemedy

replace deleted paragraph, so that the first paragraph of this clause is:

"In the YANG module definition, should any discrepancy between the text of the description for individual YANG nodes in the YANG modules of this clause and the corresponding definition in 6.2 through 6.5 of this clause occur, the definitions in the YANG modules attached to this standard shall take precedence."

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Page 183 LINE 4
replaced deleted paragraph, so that the first paragraph of this clause reads:

"In the YANG module definition, should any discrepancy between the text of the description for individual YANG nodes in the YANG modules of this clause and the corresponding definition in 6.2 through 6.5 of this clause occur, the definitions in the YANG modules attached to this standard shall take precedence."

PAGE 201 LINE 43

PSE-2 YANG module contains an error in the "leaf detection-status"
Line containing "status obsolete;" was removed

IEEE P802.3.2 unsatisfied comments

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P215 L4 # R1-4

Parsons, Glenn Ericsson AB

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

This was not the intent of my comment I-25. There are complicating implications of making the git version the authoritative version. The authoritative version of the YANG has to be part of the standard.

But this paragraph is unrelated, this is about the discrepancy within the descriptive text and tables about the module and the actual YANG module. It must be retained. To align with the formatting issues mentioned in 1.4, it is proposed that the attached version of the YANG take precedence

SuggestedRemedy

replace deleted paragraph, so that the first paragraph of this clause is:

"In the YANG module definition, should any discrepancy between the text of the description for individual YANG nodes in the YANG modules of this clause and the corresponding definition in 7.2 through 7.4 of this clause occur, the definitions in the YANG modules attached to this standard shall take precedence."

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P266 L4 # R1-5

Parsons, Glenn Ericsson AB

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

This was not the intent of my comment I-25. There are complicating implications of making the git version the authoritative version. The authoritative version of the YANG has to be part of the standard.

But this paragraph is unrelated, this is about the discrepancy within the descriptive text and tables about the module and the actual YANG module. It must be retained. To align with the formatting issues mentioned in 1.4, it is proposed that the attached version of the YANG take precedence

SuggestedRemedy

replace deleted paragraph, so that the first paragraph of this clause is:

"In the YANG module definition, should any discrepancy between the text of the description for individual YANG nodes in the YANG modules of this clause and the corresponding definition in 8.2 through 8.5 of this clause occur, the definitions in the YANG modules attached to this standard shall take precedence."

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Changed per comment plus additional changes as outlined below:

Clause 8.5.2
Page 273
Line 54

Replaced

" when "../event-type = 'threshold-event-type" {

" With

" when "../event-type = 'ieee802-link-oam:threshold-event-type" {

Clause 8.5.2
Page 283
Line 56

Replaced

" must ". != 'threshold-event-type" {

" With

IEEE P802.3.2 unsatisfied comments

must ". != 'ieee802-link-oam:threshold-event-type" {
“

Clause 8.5.2
Page 284
Line 10

Replaced

“
must ". = 'threshold-event-type" {

With

“
must ". = 'ieee802-link-oam:threshold-event-type" {
“