
November 2024 Rules Meeting

G. Zimmerman 2nd Vice Chair, IEEE 802

(11 Nov 2024, 19:30-21:30 PST)

Updated with Meeting Outcomes

APPROVED

Agenda

Call to order

IEEE SA policies & guidelines

Old Business:

- In-person attendance for gaining and maintaining membership – Awaiting Next Action
- “Deadbeat” consequences – Awaiting Proposal
- Harmonization of LMSC Ops Manual (Sec 15.2, Joint Treasury) with Wireless Chairs Standing Committee Operations Manual on ECJT Chair – Ready for Action?
- Discussion on ICCAIDs in ICCom Auto-renew – Ready for Action?
- Potential chair’s guidelines addition regarding timeline for PAR withdrawals – Ready for Action?
- Potential changes to require timeline for subgroup agenda & imat postings – For Discussion

New Business:

- Removal of “Sponsor” from LMSC Ops Manual – introduction/discussion
- Adding Open Source Positions to 802 WG P&Ps – introduction/discussion
- Adjusting Chair’s Guidelines for Room stay (4.5 Length of hotel stay for discounted registration)
- Adding Nonvoting members of LMSC (Fixing the member emeritus status...)
- Any other New Business

Adjournment

Attendance (11 Nov 2024, 19:30-21:30 PST)

Name	Affiliation
Gilb, James	General Atomics Aeronautical Systems, Inc.
Haasz, Jodi	IEEE
Hiertz, Guido	Ericsson GmbH
Jones, Chad	Cisco Systems, Inc.
Kopchuparambil, Elizabeth	Cisco Systems, Inc.
Levy, Joseph	InterDigital, Inc.
Lusted, Kent	Intel Corporation
Potterf, Jason	Cisco Systems, Inc
Rosdahl, Jon	Qualcomm Incorporated
Stacey, Robert	Intel
Stanley, Dorothy	Hewlett Packard Enterprise
Thompson, Geoffrey	GraCaSI S.A./Independent
Zimmerman, George	CME Consulting/ADI, APL Group, Cisco, Marvell, OnSemi, SenTekSe LLC, Sony

Participant behavior in IEEE-SA activities is guided by the IEEE Codes of Ethics & Conduct

- All participants in IEEE-SA activities are expected to adhere to the core principles underlying the:
 - IEEE Code of Ethics
 - IEEE Code of Conduct
- The core principles of the IEEE Codes of Ethics & Conduct are to:
 - Uphold the highest standards of integrity, responsible behavior, and ethical and professional conduct
 - Treat people fairly and with respect, to not engage in harassment, discrimination, or retaliation, and to protect people's privacy.
 - Avoid injuring others, their property, reputation, or employment by false or malicious action
- The most recent versions of these Codes are available at <http://www.ieee.org/about/corporate/governance>

Participants in the IEEE-SA “individual process” shall act independently of others, including employers

- The IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws require that “*participants in the IEEE standards development individual process shall act based on their qualifications and experience*”
- This means participants:
 - Shall act & vote** based on their personal & independent opinions derived from their expertise, knowledge, and qualifications
 - Shall not act or vote** based on any obligation to or any direction from any other person or organization, including an employer or client, regardless of any external commitments, agreements, contracts, or orders
 - Shall not direct** the actions or votes of other participants or retaliate against other participants for fulfilling their responsibility to act & vote based on their personal & independently developed opinions
- By participating in standards activities using the “*individual process*”, you are deemed to accept these requirements; if you are unable to satisfy these requirements then you shall immediately cease any participation

IEEE-SA standards activities shall allow the fair & equitable consideration of all viewpoints

- The IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws (clause 5.2.1.3) specifies that “*the standards development process shall not be dominated by any single interest category, individual, or organization*”
 - This means no participant may exercise “*authority, leadership, or influence by reason of superior leverage, strength, or representation to the exclusion of fair and equitable consideration of other viewpoints*” or “*to hinder the progress of the standards development activity*”
- This rule applies equally to those participating in a standards development project and to that project’s leadership group
- Any person who reasonably suspects that dominance is occurring in a standards development project is encouraged to bring the issue to the attention of the Standards Committee or the project’s IEEE-SA Program Manager

Guidelines for IEEE-SA Meetings

- All IEEE-SA standards meetings shall be conducted in compliance with all applicable laws, including antitrust and competition laws.
 - Don't discuss the interpretation, validity, or essentiality of patents/patent claims.
 - Don't discuss specific license rates, terms, or conditions.
- Relative costs of different technical approaches that include relative costs of patent licensing terms may be discussed in standards development meetings.
 - Technical considerations remain the primary focus
 - Don't discuss or engage in the fixing of product prices, allocation of customers, or division of sales markets.
 - Don't discuss the status or substance of ongoing or threatened litigation.
 - Don't be silent if inappropriate topics are discussed. Formally object to the discussion immediately.

For more details, see *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual*, clause 5.3.10 and *Antitrust and Competition Policy: What You Need to Know* at <http://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/antitrust.pdf>

If you have questions, contact the IEEE-SA Standards Board Patent Committee Administrator at patcom@ieee.org

IEEE SA Copyright Policy

By participating in this activity, you agree to comply with the IEEE Code of Ethics, all applicable laws, and all IEEE policies and procedures including, but not limited to, the IEEE SA Copyright Policy.

- Previously Published material (copyright assertion indicated) shall not be presented/submitted to the Working Group nor incorporated into a Working Group draft unless permission is granted.
- Prior to presentation or submission, you shall notify the Working Group Chair of previously Published material and should assist the Chair in obtaining copyright permission acceptable to IEEE SA.
- For material that is not previously Published, IEEE is automatically granted a license to use any material that is presented or submitted.

IEEE SA Copyright Policy

- The IEEE SA Copyright Policy is described in the IEEE SA Standards Board Bylaws and IEEE SA Standards Board Operations Manual
 - IEEE SA Copyright Policy, see
- Clause 7 of the IEEE SA Standards Board Bylaws
 - <https://standards.ieee.org/about/policies/bylaws/sect6-7.html#7>
- Clause 6.1 of the IEEE SA Standards Board Operations Manual
 - <https://standards.ieee.org/about/policies/opman/sect6.html>
- IEEE SA Copyright Permission
 - <https://standards.ieee.org/content/dam/ieee-standards/standards/web/documents/other/permissionltrs.zip>
- IEEE SA Copyright FAQs
 - <https://standards.ieee.org/faqs/copyrights/>
- IEEE SA Best Practices for IEEE Standards Development
 - http://standards.ieee.org/content/dam/ieee-standards/standards/web/documents/other/best_practices_for_ieee_standards_development_051215.pdf
- Distribution of Draft Standards (see 6.1.3 of the SASB Operations Manual)
 - <https://standards.ieee.org/about/policies/opman/sect6.html>

Old Business

In-person attendance credit: (Status from July 2024)

From March/July 2024:

Further discussion and socialization was needed before presenting a change

Results of Discussion in July 2024 Rules:

See <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/24/ec-24-0154-04-00EC-july-2024-rules-meeting.pdf>

Status: Determined goals, work needed on next steps

Goals:

- Encourage attendance
- “Effective teambuilding to develop a standard”
- Potential to increase empathy – ability to get consensus – “ability to read the room”
- Get more work done outside of meeting room in an expedient fashion
- Give chair the discretion – a tool to solve problems before they become critical
- Prevent misbehavior / quickly handle misbehavior

Possible Modifications:

- Possibly defer to allow working group choice
- Need better/strong explanation of the rationale (.11) – what our objectives are
- Possibly lower level of in-person credited attendance
- Possibly not change voting rights, but only allow voting / poll participation only by those attending in-person (may not be allowed by rules)
 - Motions used to only be held at in-person meetings... now held on teleconferences with advance notice... this change could cause delaying of motions for teleconferences.
- Some kind of rule that applies at a subgroup level to deal with problems...

Next Action: Subgroup to work to synthesize alternate solution & rationale

Status: Awaiting Next Action: feedback and socialization

“Deadbeat” consequences

Currently, the consequences were written at a time when we had only F2F Sessions. It is suggested to strengthen the consequences appropriately.

Possible changes to consider:

1. removal from Reflectors.
2. remove ability to post to Reflectors
3. remove deadbeats from telecons
4. Other measures that others may think are more appropriate.

Deadbeat list is growing a little. Most is from first 2 or 3 meetings post pandemic
Removal from reflectors in .11 requires attendance at a meeting to get back on reflector
Chair's removing people from telecon is not a preferred solution.
Possible mod to 1. keep them on 802ALL (auto-subscribed, but only 5 people can post)
Possible 'chair's choice' to do #3...

Status: Awaiting Next Action: specific proposal from J. Rosdahl

Harmonization of LMSC and WCSC OpsMan's on ECJT Chair

- **Summary of Issue:**
 - LMSC Opsman 15.2 states that one of the WG chairs is the chair of the Executive Committee of the Joint Treasury, while WCSC OpsMan 2.7.1 states it shall be the WCSC chair...
 - For further info, see:
<https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/24/ec-24-0165-00-00EC-2024-july-rules-re-joint-treasury-officers.pptx>
- **Proposed Change:**
 - Change LMSC Ops Manual at 15.2 (pdf page 29) to let the WCSC Opsman govern this position as follows:

The Chair of the Joint Executive Committee shall be selected by the Joint Executive Committee ~~and shall be the Chair of one of the participating Working Groups.~~
- **Status: Ready for action (discussed July 2024)**
Propose for adoption at Closing LMSC

ICAID Auto-Renewals

- Some 802 ICCAID activities are now in the ICom Auto-renewal process, and unchanged ICCAIDs don't need action
 - See <https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/24/ec-24-0151-01-00EC-lmsc-icaid-auto-renewal-proposal.pdf> for detail.
- **Proposal: make this clear in the LMSC Ops Manual:**
10.2, add new 3rd paragraph:
Notice of intent to revise or withdraw the ICAID shall be submitted to the IEEE 802 LMSC no less than 30 days prior to the day of the opening IEEE 802 LMSC meeting of an IEEE 802 LMSC Plenary Session. An ICAID subject to ICCOM auto-renewal or an unchanged renewal shall not require IEEE 802 LMSC approval.
The LMSC shall be notified when an ICAID is proposed for renewal
- **Status: Determine what notification ICCOM provides (George)**

Timeline for PAR withdrawals

- We currently do not have information describing a timeline for PAR withdrawals.
- Discussion from July 2024: this should fit under the expedited process in the 802 Ops Manual
- Proposal: Add item to LMSC Ops Manual at pdf pg 19 (9.2 IEEE 802 LMSC approval), under “PARs that use the Expedited Review process”:
 - PARs that use the Expedited Review process
 - Corrigendum PAR
 - Revision PAR
 - PAR extension
 - Splitting a project using a PAR modification and PAR for new standard
 - PAR withdrawal
- Status: Ready for Action – Propose at closing LMSC

Timelines for Agendas & IMAT Postings

Do we need rules changes to require a timeline for posting of agendas and IMAT materials for subgroups?

Summary:

Would change LMSC Ops Manual at 5.1.3 (Plenaries) and 5.2.4 (Interims) to require:

- 60 day prior notice for LMSC, WG, SC, and Tutorials agendas

- Calendars for 802, WGs, and SCs 30 days prior (w/access info)

- IMAT 5 days prior

- Allow updates until 4 hours prior

Minor changes to wording for 5.3.2 Notifications of LMSC Electronic Interims

For detail see [ec-24-0169-00-0PNP.docx](#)

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/24/ec-24-0169-00-0PNP-rules-discussion-on-when-agenda-calendar-and-imat-information-should-be-available.docx>

STATUS: For discussion –Pending revision & resubmission

New Business

LMSC Ops Manual – Removal of “Sponsor”

There are 8 instances of “sponsor” in the OM: (page numbers are PDF)

Page 1 (footnote to 1.3) – In previous documents, the IEEE 802 LMSC was also referred to as the Sponsor, IEEE 802 LMSC Executive Committee, or EC.

Recommendation: Keep as is.

Page 9 – 4.1.4 Procedure for limiting the length of the IEEE 802 sponsor meetings

Recommendation: Change “sponsor” to LMSC (this also fixes 1 entry in the table of contents)

Page 18 – 7.2.2(b) ... For public statements not presented for review in a sponsor meeting...

Recommendation: Change “a sponsor” to “an LMSC”

Pages 22 & 23 – 12. (four instances) ... “sponsor ballot” and “sponsor recirculation ballot”

Recommendation: Change “sponsor” to “SA”

Status: Ready for action (editorial license, sent to reflector Aug 16)

Addition of Open Source Positions

The 802.3 WG has been pursuing trialing an Open Source project.

Standards Board Ops Manual:

- “A Standards Committee may form one or more Open Source subgroups that coordinate Open Source development for multiple Working Groups under that Standards Committee, or delegate responsibility to the applicable Working Group to establish its own Open Source subgroup.” (6.5.2)
- “An Open Source subgroup shall be led by an IEEE Open Source Project Lead who shall be designated as an officer of the responsible Standards Committee or Working Group. The IEEE Open Source Project Lead is responsible for the vitality, organization, development, evaluation, operation, security, and maintenance of an IEEE Open Source Project. The IEEE Open Source Project Lead is the point of contact for the IEEE Open Source Platform team regarding technical and administrative matters.” (6.5.2)
- “Each IEEE Open Source Project developed by the Standards Committee or Working Group to be incorporated in an IEEE standard shall have at least one Maintainer, who may be the IEEE Open Source Project Lead”

Issue: IEEE 802 P&Ps lack the relevant sections for the OS Project Lead, Maintainer, and Leadership Subgroup.

Status of Open Source in the 802 WG P&Ps

802 WG P&Ps have the necessary definitions and the description under 3. Officers:

“When Open Source is included in the approved project, there shall be an IEEE Open Source Project Lead. The Open Source Project Lead shall be designated as an officer of the Working Group or may be an officer of the Standards Committee. The Open Source Project Lead may also serve as the Open Source Maintainer for an Open Source Project. A person may simultaneously hold the position of Open Source Project Lead and another office.”

But:

3.5.5 Open Source Project Lead, 4.5 Open Source Maintainer, and 5.1 Open Source Leadership Subgroup are marked “Not Applicable”.

OS Proposal (pg 1 of 2)

Add Audcom Approved sections into 802 WG P&Ps:

- **Add to 2. Responsibilities of the Working Group:**
Developing, governing, and maintaining any Open Source projects within the Working Group;
- **Replace “Not Applicable” under 3.5.5 Open Source Project Lead with:**
There is only one Open Source Project Lead in a Standards Committee and its subgroups (this includes the Working Group). If the Standards Committee has an Open Source Project Lead, the Standards Committee Open Source Project Lead is the Open Source Project Lead for all Working Group Open Source Projects. If the Working Group is the only subgroup of the Standards Committee that has Open Source incorporated into an IEEE standard(s), then the Open Source Project Lead may be an officer of the Working Group and not an officer of the Standards Committee.
The responsibilities of an Open Source Project Lead, when Open Source is being developed by the Working Group, are defined in the *IEEE SA BOG Open Source Committee (OSCom) Operations Manual*.
- **Replace “Not Applicable” under 4.5 Open Source Maintainer with:**
Open Source Maintainer(s), if applicable, shall be members of the Working Group responsible for the Open Source project.
Prior to the election or appointment of the Open Source Maintainer(s), the Working Group shall determine if an Open Source Maintainer(s) is also the Open Source Project Lead within their group. The Open Source Maintainer(s) is appointed by the Working Group Chair.
The responsibilities of the Open Source Project Maintainer(s) are defined in the *IEEE SA BOG Open Source Committee (OSCom) Operations Manual* and *IEEE Open Source Maintainers Manual*.

OS Proposal (pg 2 of 2)

Add Audcom Approved sections into 802 WG P&Ps (cont'd):

- Replace “Not Applicable” under 5.1 Open Source Leadership Subgroup with:
When Open Source projects are being developed within the Working Group or its subgroups, the Working Group shall form an Open Source Leadership subgroup to manage the Open Source project or multiple Open Source projects of the Working Group and its subgroups. An Open Source Leadership subgroup may exist at both the Standards Committee and Working Group levels.

The Working Group Open Source Leadership subgroup shall consist of the Open Source Project Lead and Maintainer(s), and may include Working Group participants.

The responsibilities of the Open Source Leadership Subgroup are defined in the *IEEE SA BOG Open Source Committee (OSCom) Operations Manual* clause on “Project Governance” and the *IEEE SA Standards Board Operations Manual* clause on “Open Source.”

Status: For discussion

Chair's Guidelines 4.5 –

Hotel stay for discounted registration

Current Text: (4.5 Length of hotel stay for discounted registration)

(LMSC email ballot, closed 15 October 2010)

In the November 2009 meeting, the LMSC passed the motion that enabled a surcharge of \$300 to the registration fee for those attendees not booking and staying in the IEEE 802-contracted hotel. Proof of hotel stay will be required to prevent the surcharge.

The purpose of this motion is to clarify what a "hotel stay" means. The result of the motion was that a hotel stay was defined as at least one night booking and staying in the IEEE 802 contracted hotel.

Effective beginning with the November 2010 meeting.

Discussion:

Meeting contractual room night requirements has been more difficult post pandemic.

Proposal:

Revise to require a 3 night stay at the IEEE 802-contracted hotel.

Status: Discussed, Rosdahl plans to bring motion to closing LMSC

Associate members of LMSC

LMSC P&P Manual

4.2 Non-voting Membership

The Standards Committee may include the following Non-Voting Members:

- Members Emeritus
- Chairs of Hibernating WGs
- Chairs of subgroups created by the Standards Committee

Non-voting members are appointed by the Standards Committee Chair. Appointment to each non-voting membership position is subject to confirmation by the Standards Committee. The term for each of these positions ends at close of the first plenary session of each even numbered year.

Non-voting members, prior to confirmation are required to file a letter of endorsement, as described in 4.3.

A Non-Voting Member may be removed by a two-thirds vote of the Voting Members of the Standards Committee. Grounds for removal shall be included in any motion to remove a Non-Voting Member. The Non-Voting Member suggested for removal shall be given an opportunity to make a rebuttal prior to the vote on the motion for removal.

Associate members of LMSC (2)

LMSC Chair's Guidelines

2.11.1 IEEE 802 Advisor, Member Emeritus responsibilities

- 1) Provide advice and guidance to the Standards Committee Chair and all LMSC members on all matters before the LMSC (especially on controversial and difficult topics)
- 2) Fulfill assignments from the Standards Committee Chair based on need covering a wide scope of activities: IEEE 802 items, the IEEE SA Staff, Standards Board and Board of Governor's items; and international standards development items.
- 3) Act as a mentor to Working Group/Technical Advisory Group members and leaders, especially for new groups
- 4) Note this is a non-voting LMSC position.

Backup/Reference