802.1 consent agenda items for LMSC Closing Plenary

November 2023

(V4 – 802.1 version #)
Agenda

• Drafts to SA Ballot
  – 5.0? – P802.1Qdj
  – 5.0? – P802.1ASdn
  – 5.0? – P802.1ASdm
  – 5.0? – P802.1Qdx

• Drafts to RevCom
  – 5.0? – P802.1ASdr
  – 5.0? – P802.1CS-2020/Cor1

• PARs to NesCom
  – 5.0? – P802.1ACea
  – 5.0? – P802.1CB-2017/Cor1
  – 5.0? – P802.1AXdz
Agenda

• Liaisons and external communications (ME)
  – 7.0? – Approve liaison of drafts for information to ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 under the PSDO agreement
  – 7.0? – Approve liaison of drafts for adoption to ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 under the PSDO agreement
  – 7.0? – Approve responses to ballot comments received from SC6 on FDIS and CIB ballots

• Liaisons and external communications (II)
  – 7.0? – Approve 802.1 communication to IETF DetNet
802.1 Motions
2023-11

Consent Agenda

Drafts to SA Ballot
Motion

- Approve sending P802.1Qdj D2.0 to Standards Association ballot
- Confirm the CSD for P802.1Qdj in https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/19/ec-19-0139-00-ACSD-p802-1qdj.pdf
- P802.Qdj D1.3 had 100% approval at the end of the last WG ballot
  - In the WG, Proposed: Stephan Kehrer, Second: János Farkas
    - Sending draft (y/n/a): 34 – 0 – 1
    - CSD (y/n/a): 34 – 0 – 1
  - In EC, mover: Glenn Parsons, Second: Roger Marks
    - (y/n/a): <y>,<n>,<a>
Supporting Information P802.1Qdj

- WG ballot closed: 15 October 2023
- All WG ballot requirements are met
- The ballot resulted in
  - 0 Disapprove votes
  - 0 Must Be Satisfied (MBS) comments
- Comment resolution available here: https://ieee802.org/1/files/private/dj-drafts/d1/802-1Qdj-d1-3-dis-v01.pdf

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CATEGORY</th>
<th>All respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TOTAL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Voting Yes or No        | 46    | 74.19%
| Abs. Time               | 0     | 0.00%
| Abs. Expertise          | 16    | 25.81%
| Abs. Other              | 0     | 0.00%
| Respondents             | 62    |      |
| Voting members          | 73    |      |
| Non-voting commenters   | 0     |      |
| No. of commenters       | 3     |      |
| No. of comments         | 15    |      |
Motion

• Approve sending P802.1ASdn D2.0 to Standards Association ballot
• Confirm the CSD for P802.1ASdn in https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/20/ec-20-0202-00-ACSD-p802-1asdn.pdf
• P802.ASdn D1.2 had 98% approval at the end of the last WG ballot
  • In the WG, Proposed: János Farkas, Second: Ludwig Winkel
    - Sending draft (y/n/a): 34 – 0 – 2
    - CSD (y/n/a): 34 – 0 – 1
• In EC, mover: Glenn Parsons, Second: Roger Marks
  - (y/n/a): <y>,<n>,<a>
Supporting Information P802.1ASdn

- WG ballot closed: 28 October 2023
- All WG ballot requirements are met
- The ballot resulted in
  - 1 outstanding Disapprove votes
  - 1 outstanding Must Be Satisfied (MBS) comments
- Comment resolution available here: https://ieee802.org/1/files/private/asdn-drafts/d1/802-1ASdn-d1-2-dis-v01.pdf

Ballot results:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>All respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approve</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dissapprove</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voting Approve or Disapprove</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain (Lack of Expertise)</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain (Lack of Time)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain (Other)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respondents</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voting members</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Voting commenters</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of commenters</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of comments</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Supporting Information P802.1ASdn

- 1 disapprove vote associated with 1 MBS comment is maintained from the initial WG ballot on D1.0
Motion

• Conditionally approve sending P802.1ASdm D2.0 to Standards Association ballot
• Confirm the CSD for P802.1ASdm in https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/20/ec-20-0093-01-ACSD-p802-1asdm.pdf
• P802.ASdm D1.3 had 94% approval at the end of the last WG ballot
  • In the WG, Proposed: Geoffrey Garner, Second: János Farkas
    – Sending draft (y/n/a): 35 – 3 – 3
    – CSD (y/n/a): 36 – 2 – 3
• In EC, mover: Glenn Parsons, Second: Roger Marks
  – (y/n/a): <y>,<n>,<a>
Supporting Information P802.1ASdm

- WG ballot closed: 27 October 2023
- All WG ballot requirements are met
- The ballot resulted in
  - 3 outstanding Disapprove votes
  - 3 outstanding Must Be Satisfied (MBS) comments
- Comment resolution available here: [https://ieee802.org/1/files/private/asdm-drafts/d1/802-1ASdm-d1-3-dis-v01.pdf](https://ieee802.org/1/files/private/asdm-drafts/d1/802-1ASdm-d1-3-dis-v01.pdf)

Recirculation ballot will be conducted during November/December with comment resolution in TSN TG meetings. A possible final recirculation in January/February if required with comment resolution in TSN TG meetings.

Ballot results:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>94.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>21.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. of Voters</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voters responding</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>89.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-voters responding</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Supporting Information P802.1ASdm

- Voters maintaining Disapprove vote
  - Christian Boiger
  - Johannes Specht
    - Wants to see the subsequent drafts
  - Max Turner
Supporting Information P802.1ASdm

- Outstanding MBS comments associated with Disapprove vote from D1.1 ([802-1ASdm-d1-1-dis-v01.pdf](802-1ASdm-d1-1-dis-v01.pdf))

---

This is an excerpt from a document discussing comments related to the P802.1ASdm standard. The comments are related to changes in the standard that are proposed, with responses and suggested remedies. The document includes detailed text explaining the issues and the responses to those issues. The comments are related to the implementation of Hot Standby Initial Working Group ballot results and include specific comments and responses from different contributors.
Motion

- Conditionally approve sending P802.1Qdx D2.0 to Standards Association ballot
- Confirm the CSD for P802.1Qdx in https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/23/ec-23-0075-00-ACSD-p802-1qdx.pdf
- P802.Qdx D1.0 had 81% approval at the end of the last WG ballot
  - In the WG, Proposed: János Farkas, Second: Jordon Woods
    - Sending draft (y/n/a): 30 – 2 – 8
    - CSD (y/n/a): 30 – 1 – 9
- In EC, mover: Glenn Parsons, Second: Roger Marks
  - (y/n/a): <y>,<n>,<a>
Supporting Information P802.1Qdx

- WG ballot closed: 13 November 2023
- All WG ballot requirements are met
- The ballot resulted in
  - 7 Disapprove votes
  - 12 outstanding Must Be Satisfied (MBS) comments
- Comment resolution available here: [https://ieee802.org/1/files/private/dx-drafts/d1/802-1Qdx-d1-0-dis-v01.pdf](https://ieee802.org/1/files/private/dx-drafts/d1/802-1Qdx-d1-0-dis-v01.pdf)
- Recirculation ballot will be conducted during November/December with comment resolution in TSN TG meetings. A possible final recirculation in January/February if required with comment resolution in TSN TG meetings.

Ballot results:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CATEGORY</th>
<th>All respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TOTAL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voting Yes or No</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain Expertise</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abtain Time</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain Other</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respondents&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Voters</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liaisons responding</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. of commenters</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. of comments</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Supporting Information P802.1Qdx

• Voters maintaining Disapprove vote
  - Christian Boiger
  - Paul Bottorff
  - Marina Gutierrez
  - Hiroki Nakano
  - Jessy Rouyer
  - Michael Seaman
  - Johannes Specht

• MBS comments are on the following slides
  - (commenter was not present during comment resolution)
Supporting Information P802.1Qdx

IEEE P802.1Qdx

IEEE P802.1Qdx D1.0 YANG for CBS Initial Working Group ballot comments

Comment Disposition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CI</th>
<th>SC</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>L</th>
<th>#</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>12.34</td>
<td>P17</td>
<td>L3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Seaman, Mick
Mick Seaman

Comment Type ER Comment Status A
Throughout 802.1Q, "credit-based shaper" is not capitalized, except when it occurs at the beginning of a sentence or title, in which case "Credit-based shaper" is used.

SuggestedRemedy
Correct capitalization throughout as indicated, with the exception of the title of the amendment where "Credit-based Shaper" or "Credit-Based Shaper" should be used (the IEEE has recently decided on maximal capitalization in standard/amendment titles, which rule is consistent with usage elsewhere :-).

Response
Response Status W
ACCEPT.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CI</th>
<th>SC</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>L</th>
<th>#</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>00</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Seaman, Mick
Mick Seaman

Comment Type ER Comment Status A
Do not use "Credit-Based Shaping" in the clause title, elegant variation adds no value here.

SuggestedRemedy
Retitle 12.34 as "Managed objects for the credit-based shaper" or "Managed objects for the credit-based shaper". Note that the clause number will now be 12.35 or later. Similarly retitle B.21 as "Credit-based shaper".

Response
Response Status W
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Delete clause 12.34
Retitle B.21 as "Credit-based shaper"

Comment ID 5 Page 1 of 3 11/15/2023 2:08:50 PM
Supporting Information P802.1Qdx

IEEE P802.1Qdx

Seaman, Mick
Comment Type ER Comment Status A

The boiler-plate "Important Notices. *" has been recently updated by the IEEE, with significant changes to the "IMPORTANT NOTICE" at the end of the section. To avoid problems in MEC, and potentially in the WG, this should be updated.

SuggestedRemedy
I suggest that the whole text of the amendment be merged back into the in progress 802.1Q source base before a final WG recirculation ballot. Apart from detecting any discrepancies/mismatches before entering SA Ballot, this will clean up pro forma items such as boiler plate text with minimum effort.

Response Response Status W
ACCEPT.

Seaman, Mick
Comment Type ER Comment Status A

The capitalization of the amendment name in the text should be changed to match that used in the box above and the amendment title.

SuggestedRemedy
As per comment.

Response Response Status W
ACCEPT.

Seaman, Mick
Comment Type ER Comment Status A

48.5.27 is incorrectly named "-obs" is missing.

SuggestedRemedy
Correct it.

Response Response Status W
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Seaman, Mick
Comment Type ER Comment Status A

48.5.27 is incorrectly named "-obs" is missing.

SuggestedRemedy
Correct it.

Response Response Status W
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Seaman, Mick
Comment Type ER Comment Status A

48.5.27 is incorrectly named "-obs" is missing.

SuggestedRemedy
Correct it.

Response Response Status W
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Seaman, Mick
Comment Type ER Comment Status A

48.5.27 is incorrectly named "-obs" is missing.

SuggestedRemedy
Correct it.

Response Response Status W
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Seaman, Mick
Comment Type ER Comment Status A

48.5.27 is incorrectly named "-obs" is missing.

SuggestedRemedy
Correct it.

Response Response Status W
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Seaman, Mick
Comment Type ER Comment Status A

48.5.27 is incorrectly named "-obs" is missing.

SuggestedRemedy
Correct it.

Response Response Status W
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Seaman, Mick
Comment Type ER Comment Status A

48.5.27 is incorrectly named "-obs" is missing.

SuggestedRemedy
Correct it.

Response Response Status W
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Supporting Information P802.1Qdx

IEEE P802.1Qdx

IEEE P802.1Qdx D1.0 YANG for CBS Initial Working Group ballot comments

Comment Disposition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CI</th>
<th>SC</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>L</th>
<th>#</th>
<th>Comment Type</th>
<th>TR</th>
<th>Comment Status</th>
<th>A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>48.3.12</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>This section contains a single Table (48-9) listing the YANG modules needed to implement the CBS model in a bridge. There is no analogous table for end-station implementations.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>SuggestedRemedy</td>
<td></td>
<td>Remove YANG model augmenting IETF interfaces.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Response
W
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Remove YANG model augmenting IETF interfaces.

Type: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general

COMMENT STATUS: Dispatched Accepted Rejected RESPONSE STATUS: Open W/withdrawl U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn

SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID: 55
Page 3 of 3
11/15/2023 2:08:50 PM

IEEE 802 LMSC
802.1 Motions
2023-11

Consent Agenda

Drafts to RevCom
Motion

- Approve sending P802.1ASdr to RevCom
- Approve CSD documentation in [https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/21/ec-21-0097-00-ACSD-p802-1asdr.pdf](https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/21/ec-21-0097-00-ACSD-p802-1asdr.pdf)
- P802.1ASdr had 97% approval at the end of the last SA ballot
  - In the WG, Proposed: Mark Hantel, Second: Silvana Rodrigues
    - Sending draft (y/n/a): 37 – 1 – 2
    - CSD (y/n/a): 37 – 1 – 0
- In EC, mover: Glenn Parsons, Second: Roger Marks
  - (y/n/a): <y>,<n>,<a>
Supporting Information P802.1ASdr

- SA recirculation ballot closed: 29 October 2023
- All SA ballot requirements are met
- The ballot resulted in
  - 176 comments for SA initial ballot
    - 2 outstanding Disapprove votes
    - 172 outstanding Must Be Satisfied (MBS) comments
  - 2 comments for the SA recirculation
    - No MBS comments
- Final Comment resolution available here:

Ballot results:
2 disapprove votes associated with 172 MBS comments maintained from the initial SA ballot on D1.2

- Rejected comments to the right.
- One commenter added one comment (e.g. I-7) for each of the many instances of “Grandmaster” in the draft

Both disapprove votes are maintained from the initial SA ballot
Supporting Information P802.1ASdr

• Initial SA ballot
  • 2 Disapprove vote maintained (Benjamin Rolfe, C. Huntley)
  • 172 MBS comments
  • [https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/dr-drafts/d1/802-1ASdr-d1-2-dis-v00.pdf](https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/dr-drafts/d1/802-1ASdr-d1-2-dis-v00.pdf)

• First recirculation ballot
  • 2 comments
Motion

- Conditionally approve sending P802.1CS-2020/Cor1 to RevCom
  - Note: there is no CSD statement since this maintenance project is not intended to provide any new functionality

- P802.1CS-2020/Cor1 had 100% approval at the end of the last SA ballot
  - In the WG, Proposed: Mark Hantel, Second: Norm Finn
    - Sending draft (y/n/a): 38 – 0 – 2
  - In EC, mover: Glenn Parsons, Second: Roger Marks
    - (y/n/a): <y>,<n>,<a>
Supporting Information P802.1CS/Cor1

- SA ballot closed:
  - 15 November 2023
- All SA ballot requirements are met
- The ballot resulted in
  - 0 Disapprove votes
  - 3 comments

- Ballot comment resolution will be held on Maintenance TG meetings in November/December.
- Recirculation ballot will be conducted during December/January comment resolution in Maintenance TG meetings. A possible final recirculation in February if required with comment resolution in Maintenance TG meetings.
802.1 Motions
2023-11

Consent Agenda

PARs to NesCom
Motion

- In the WG, Proposed: Mark Hantel, Second: Jessy Rouyer
  - Sending draft (y/n/a): 33 – 1 – 6
  - CSD (y/n/a): 33 – 0 – 7
- In EC, mover: Glenn Parsons, Second: Roger Marks
  - (y/n/a): <y>,<n>,<a>
Motion

• Approve forwarding P802.1CB-2017/Cor1 PAR documentation in

• Note: there is no CSD statement since this maintenance project is not intended to provide any new functionality

• In the WG, Proposed: Mark Hantel, Second: Norm Finn
  – Sending draft (y/n/a): 36 – 1 – 3

• In EC, mover: Glenn Parsons, Second: Roger Marks
  – (y/n/a): <y>,<n>,<a>
Motion

- Approve forwarding P802.1AXdz PAR documentation in https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/dz-PAR-1123-v01.pdf to NesCom


- In the WG, Proposed: Stephen Haddock, Second: János Farkas
  - PAR (y/n/a): 34 – 1 – 5
  - CSD (y/n/a): 35 – 0 – 6

- In EC, mover: Glenn Parsons, Second: Roger Marks
  - (y/n/a): <y>,<n>,<a>
802.1 Motions
2023-11

Consent Agenda

Liaisons and external communications (ME)
Motion

• Approve submission of the following draft(s) to ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 for information under the PSDO agreement, once SA balloting begins.
  – IEEE P802.1Qdj, IEEE P802.1Qdx, IEEE P802.1ASdm, IEEE P802-REVc

• In the WG, Proposed: Mark Hantel     Second: Karen Randall
  – Sending draft (y/n/a):  37 – 0 – 3

• In EC, mover: Glenn Parsons     Second: Roger Marks
  – (y/n/a): <y>,<n>,<a>
Motion

• Approve submission of the following draft(s) to ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 for adoption under the PSDO agreement, once approved and published.
  – IEEE 802.1ASdr, IEEE 802.1CS-2020/Cor1

• In the WG, Proposed: Mark Hantel   Second: Karen Randall
  – Sending draft (y/n/a): 36 – 0 – 4

• In EC, mover: Glenn Parsons   Second: Roger Marks
  – (y/n/a): <y>,<n>,<a>
Motion

• Approve submission of the following comment responses to ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 for information under the PSDO agreement:
  
  – IEEE 802.1Qcz-2023
  
  – IEEE 802.1AEdk-2023

• In the WG, Proposed: Mark Hantel   Second: Karen Randall
  
  – Sending draft (y/n/a):  34 – 0 – 5

• In EC, mover: Glenn Parsons   Second: Roger Marks
  
  – (y/n/a): <y>,<n>,<a>
802.1 Motions
2023-11

Consent Agenda

Liaisons and external communications (II)
Motion

• Approve https://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2023/liaison-IETF-DetNet-status-update-1123-v01.pdf as communication to the IETF Deterministic Networking (DetNet) WG, granting the IEEE 802.1 WG chair (or his delegate) editorial license.

• Proposed: János Farkas
  • Second: Norm Finn

• In the WG (y/n/a): 37 – 0 – 3

• In the EC, for information (or motion to block)