

WG P&P proposed changes

Overview

- After a Sponsor's P&P is approved, AudCom reviews one of the WG's P&P
- IEEE 802's WG P&P was submitted for review
- However, it is not based on the current WG P&P baseline
- Goal is to update the WG P&P to use the current WG P&P baseline

Overview

- Sections
 - SNBM – Shall not be modified
 - MBM – May be modified

Changes, Clause 1-3

- Clause 1 → Clause 1.1 (**SNBM**)
 - Removed “Unless otherwise specified, the term WG applies to both WGs and TAGs”
 - Should be taken care of in Clause 1.2 OK?
- Clause 2 → Clause 1.2 (**SNBM, except to identify the WG**)
 - Change “by the WG” to be “by an IEEE 802 Working Group (WG) or Technical Advisory Group (TAG), hereinafter referred to as “the Working Group””.
- Clause 3 → Clause 1.3 (**SNBM except to add superior documents**)
 - No changes

Clause 4 → Clause 1.4 (SNBM)

- Same except last paragraph:
 - Was “The standards development process should strive to have both a balance of interests and not be dominated by any single interest category.”
 - Now “In addition, due process requires openness and balance (i.e., the standards development process shall strive to have a balance of interests and not to be dominated by any single interest category). However, for the IEEE Standards Sponsor ballot, there shall be a balance of interests without dominance by any single interest category.”

Clause 5 → Clause 2.0

- **SNBM except to add additional responsibilities**
- Deleted first paragraph “Each draft standard produced by a WG must be within the scope of Sponsor and the scope of the WG as determined by the Sponsor. It must also be within the scope of an approved PAR.”
- Item a)
 - Was “within the allotted times (normally 48 months) that are assigned to them by the Sponsor”
 - Now “as specified by the PAR, and in compliance with IEEE Standards policies and procedures”
- Change item f) “Maintain ~~and amend~~ existing standards issued by IEEE developed by the Working Group, or assigned to the Working Group by the Sponsor”

Clause 5 → Clause 2.0 (cont.)

- Deleted last two paragraphs:

“Primary responsibility for achieving these goals shall sit with the WG Chair. The WG Chair may assign activities within the WG (in ways compliant with this document and other WG approved documents) so as to facilitate completion of those activities. The WG chair may assign to and be advised by others (Task Group Chairs, Task Force Chairs, Advisory Groups, etc) on matters within the WG to ensure they are attended to and completed.

The WG shall periodically review and confirm that the response to the five criteria, refer to the “Criteria for standards development” subclause in the IEEE 802 LMSC Operations Manual , used to approve its PAR(s) still reflect the state of the project(s) to which they relate. Should a WG need to modify the responses to the five criteria during a projects’ development in order to accurately reflect the state of the project, the modified responses shall be submitted to the Sponsor for approval.”

- Rationale: The first paragraph is covered by the WG Chair responsibilities and the second paragraph is covered by the IEEE 802 LMSC OM,10.2.

Clause 6.1 → Clause 3.0

- **SNBM except to add additional officers**
- Added “A person may simultaneously hold the positions of Secretary and Treasurer.”
- Membership requirements for Chair and Vice Chairs
 - Was “All WG Chairs and Vice Chairs shall be members of the IEEE SA and non-student members or affiliate of either the IEEE or the IEEE Computer Society.
 - Now “The Chair and Vice Chair(s) shall each be IEEE members of any grade, except Student grade, or IEEE Society affiliates, and also be members of IEEE-SA.”
- Deleted “The specific WG officers and their activities should be described in a WG Operations Manual if one exists.”
- Deleted last two paragraphs

Clause 6.1 → Clause 3.0 (cont.)

- Deleted last two paragraphs
- “At the first plenary session, the WG shall elect its chair and vice chair(s) in accordance with the procedures of the Sponsor, and, where necessary, Robert’s Rules of Order. WG officers should read the training material available through IEEE Standards Development Online [6] .”
 - Covered under elections
- “Initial appointments and temporary appointments to fill vacancies due to resignations or removals for cause, may be made by the Sponsor Chair, and shall be valid until the end of the next plenary session.”
 - Covered in 3.2 Temporary appointments to vacancies

Clause 6.2 → 3.1

- MBM (Three cases are provided; either choose one of these cases -- Case 1, Case 2, or Case 3 – or create a similar process for this clause and delete the other options.)
- Election of officers
- No changes
- Adopting the last option, replaced with our current text.

Clause 6.3 → 3.2

- Temporary appointments ([MBM](#))
- Slight rewording
 - Was “If an office becomes vacant due to resignation, removal, lack of nomination at an election or for another reason, a temporary appointment shall be made for a period of up to six months. In the case of Chair or Vice-Chair, the Sponsor Chair shall make the temporary appointment, with input from the WG. In the case of Secretary, the WG Chair shall make the temporary appointment. An appointment or election for the vacated office shall be conducted at the earliest practical time.”
 - Now “If an office other than the Chair or Vice Chair becomes vacant for any reason (such as resignation, removal, lack of nomination at an election), a temporary appointment shall be made by the Chair for a period of up to six months. In the case of Chair or Vice Chair, the Sponsor Chair shall make the temporary appointment, with input from the Working Group. An appointment or election for the vacated office shall be made in accordance with the requirements in Clause 3.0 and 3.1 at the earliest practical time.”

Clause 6.4 → 3.3

- Removal of officers (**MBM**)
- No changes

6.5 → 3.4

- First paragraph (SNBM)
- Added new paragraphs (MBM with additional officers and responsibilities):
 - When carrying out the duties of an officer described in IEEE's policies and procedures, elected and appointed officers of the Working Group:
 - a) shall not act:
 - a. in bad faith;
 - b. to the detriment of IEEE-SA;
 - c. to further the interest of any party over the that of the Working Group, including, but not limited to, his or her employer or any entity with whom such officer is affiliated; or
 - d. in a manner that is inconsistent with the purposes or objectives of IEEE; and
 - b) shall use best efforts to ensure that participants of the Working Group conduct themselves in accordance with applicable policies and procedures including, but not limited to, SASB Bylaws 5.2.1.
 - The officers of the Working Group shall manage the day-to-day operations of the Working Group. The officers are responsible for implementing the decisions of the Working Group and managing the activities that result from those decisions.

6.5 → 3.4

- New suggestion based on AudCom discussion:
 - When carrying out the duties of an officer described in IEEE's policies and procedures, elected and appointed officers of the working group:
 - (a) shall not act:
 - (i) in bad faith;
 - (ii) to the detriment of IEEE-SA;
 - (iii) to further the interest of any party outside IEEE over the interest of IEEE; or
 - (iv) in a manner that is inconsistent with the purposes or objectives of IEEE; and
 - (b) shall use best efforts to ensure that participants of the working group conduct themselves in accordance with applicable policies and procedures including, but not limited to, SASB Bylaws 5.2.1.
- Last paragraph is the same.

6.5.1 → 3.4.1 (Chair)

- **MBM only to add responsibilities**
 - Note: I deleted from the baseline “Forming Study Groups as necessary” as it conflicts with our P&P
 - Rationale: This conflicts with our P&P, section 5.4.
- Deleted “The main responsibility of the WG Chair is to enable the WG to operate in an orderly fashion, produce a draft standard, recommended practice, or guide, or to revise an existing document.”
- Some of the tasks are reworded but same intent.
- Added “Being familiar with training materials available through IEEE Standards Development Online.”
- Will delete “To ensure lists of unresolved issues, action items, and assignments are maintained.”
- Deleted “To establish WG rules beyond the WG rules set down by the Sponsor. These rules must be written and all WG members must be aware of them”

6.5.2 → 3.4.2 (Vice Chair)

- **MBM only to add responsibilities**
- Added “Being knowledgeable in IEEE standards processes and parliamentary procedures and assisting the Chair in ensuring that the processes and procedures are followed.”

6.5.3 → 3.4.3 (Secretary)

- New tasks (MBM to add responsibilities. If an item is not given to Secretary, needs to be given to other officers)
 - a) Scheduling meetings in coordination with the Chair and distributing meeting notices.
 - b) Distributing meeting agenda (as per 6.0). Notification of the potential for action shall be included on any distributed agendas for meetings.
 - c) Recording minutes of each meeting according to Clause 6.5 and IEEE guidelines (see <http://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/stdslaw.pdf>), and publishing them within 60 calendar days of the end of the meeting.
 - d) Creating and maintaining the participant roster and submitting it to the IEEE Standards Association annually.
 - e) Being responsible for the management and distribution of Working Group documentation.
 - f) Maintaining lists of unresolved issues, action items, and assignments.
 - g) Recording attendance of all attendees.
 - h) Maintaining a current list of the names of the voting members and distributing it to the members upon request.
 - I) Forwarding all changes to the roster of voting members to the Chair.
 - j) Being familiar with training materials available through IEEE Standards Development Online

6.5.4 → 3.4.4 (Treasurer)

- MBM to include additional responsibilities
- Two changes
 - Added “Being familiar with training materials available through IEEE Standards Development Online”
 - Deleted “Bring any discrepancies between the requirements of the IEEE financial operations manual and sponsor P&P to the attention of the sponsor”

7.1 through 7.2.4

- SNBM except to conform with Sponsor P&P
- 7.1 → 4.1: No substantive changes
- MBM except for number of meetings can only be increased
- 7.2, 7.2.1-7.2.4 → 4.1.1, 4.1.1.1-4.1.1.4:
Copy from our existing rules

7.2.5 → /dev/null

- Was:
 - The rights of the WG's members include the following:
 - a) To receive a notice of the next session
 - b) To receive a copy of the minutes
 - c) To vote at meetings if and only if present
 - d) To vote in WG Letter Ballots
 - e) To examine all Working Draft documents
 - f) To lodge complaints about WG operation with the Sponsor
 - g) To petition the Sponsor in writing
 - Members of WG/TAG's are members of IEEE 802 LMSC. A petition signed by two-thirds of the membership of IEEE 802 LMSC forces the Sponsor to implement the resolution if allowed by applicable governance.

7.2.5 → 11

- Add in the following to match our old rules
 - The rights of the Working Group's members include the following:
 - a) To receive a timely notice of the next session
 - b) To receive a copy of the minutes
 - c) To vote at meetings if and only if present
 - d) To vote in Working Group Letter Ballots
 - e) To examine all the Working Group ~~Working~~ Draft documents
 - f) To lodge complaints about Working Group operation with the Sponsor
 - g) To petition the Sponsor in writing

7.2.6 → /dev/null

- Meetings and participation, was:
 - WG meetings are open to anyone who has complied with the registration requirements (if any) for the meeting. Only members have the right to participate in the discussions. The privilege of observers to participate in discussions may be granted by the WG Chair.
 - [Suggest add back in, unless covered elsewhere.](#)

New subclause, 4.2

- 4.2 Review of Membership ([MBM to include additional membership requirements](#))
- The Chair shall review the voting membership list at least annually. Voting members are expected to fulfill the obligations of active participation as defined in Clause 4.1.1. When a voting member is found in habitual default of these obligations, the Chair shall consider the matter for appropriate action, which may include termination of membership.
 - Rationale: This is already covered in our text, but in the baseline our rules aren't there. While it may be redundant, it doesn't hurt to keep it.

8.1 → 4.3

- SNBM except for distribution of the roster or to be compliant with Sponsor procedures.
- 1st paragraph: “of members and meeting attendees”
- 2nd paragraph: “~~The WG Chair~~ A Working Group officer or ~~WG Chair's~~ designee” shall maintain a current and accurate roster of members and meeting attendees in the Working Group.
- Item d)
 - Was: “Members (including names, email addresses, and affiliations for all members)”
 - Now: “Members and attendees: for each, include name, email address, affiliation, and membership status (e.g., meeting attendee, voting member, etc.).”

8.1 → 4.3 (cont.)

- New paragraph:
 - “All Working Group members are required to update their information contained in the roster when that information changes.”
 - Note this is a change to the baseline suggestion.
- Last paragraph:
 - “... unless all Working Group members and participants have submitted ...”.

8.1-4.3 Suggestion

- The legal counsel and AudCom are wrong here to reference participants.
 - The term participant is not defined.
 - Members (i.e., voting members) are defined and have specific start and end points in time.
 - Hence, a list of members can be current
 - The role of participant has not start or end time.
- Delete participants from this subclause, the requirement is already covered in the requirements for the minutes.

8.2 → 4.4, 7.3 → 5.0

- 8.2 → 4.4: No changes ([SNBM except for the distribution of the list or to be compliant with the Sponsor's procedures](#))
- 7.3 → 5.0: Subgroups ([SNBM](#))
 - The Working Group may, from time to time, form subgroups for the conduct of its business. [Membership in the subgroup is granted to any member of the Working Group.](#) Such formation shall be explicitly noted in ~~an official record, such as~~ [the](#) meeting minutes. At the time of formation, the Working Group shall determine the scope and duties delegated to the subgroup, [and may decide to allow participation of non-Working Group members and the terms and conditions under which such members participate in the subgroup.](#) Any changes to its scope and duties will require the approval of the Working Group. Any resolution of a subgroup shall be subject to confirmation by the Working Group.”
 - The Chair of the Working Group shall appoint the Chair of the subgroup.

10 → 6.0 Meetings

- SNBM except to modify shaded values and state quorum definitions otherwise approved by the Sponsor.
- Working Group meetings may be conducted either exclusively in-person or in-person with one or more participants contributing via electronic means, or exclusively via electronic means. Working Group meetings shall be held, as decided by the Working Group, the Chair, or by petition of 15% or more of the voting members, to conduct business, such as making assignments, receiving reports of work, ~~considering~~ progressing draft standards, resolving differences between subgroups, and considering views and objections from any source. A ~~WG~~ meeting notice shall be ~~announced~~ distributed, by a Working Group officer or designee, 30 calendar days in advance to all participants. A ~~meeting~~ agenda shall be distributed to all participants at least 14 calendar days in advance of a meeting. (Meetings of subgroups may be held as decided upon by the members or Chair of the subgroup.) Notification of the potential for action shall be included on any distributed agendas for meetings.
- Action is to add 10 day notice for a subgroup of the Working Group electronic meetings to the OM.

10 → 6.0 Meetings (cont.)

- ~~The WG, or meeting host, may charge a meeting fee to cover services needed for the conduct of the meeting. The fee shall not be used to restrict participation by any interested parties.~~
- While having a balance of all interested parties is not an official requirement for a WG, it is a desirable goal. As such, the officers of the WG should consider issues of balance and dominance that may arise and discuss them with the Sponsor. ~~A balanced body is required for IEEE Standards Sponsor ballot.~~
- Participants shall be asked to state their employer and affiliation at each Working Group meeting as required by ~~5.3.3.1 of SASB OM [2]~~ the IEEE-SA SA Standards Board Operations Manual (Section 5.3.3.1 Disclosure of Affiliation).
- Please note that all IEEE Standards development meetings are open to anyone who has a material interest, has complied with the registration requirements (if any) and wishes to attend. However, some meetings may occur in Executive Session (see Clause 6.3).

10 → 6.0 Meetings (cont. 2)

- Was in 7.2.6, not put in 6.0
- Only members have the right to participate in the discussions. The privilege of observers to participate in discussions may be granted by the WG Chair.

9.5 → 6.1 Quorum

- SNBM except to increase the shaded values or to state quorum definitions otherwise approved by the Sponsor
- ~~The presence of a~~A quorum ~~must shall~~ be identified and announced ~~by the WG Chair at the beginning of each meeting~~ before the initiation of Working Group business at a meeting, but if a quorum is not present, actions may be taken subject to confirmation by letter or electronic ballot, as detailed in Subclause 7.2 or at the next Working Group meeting. Unless otherwise approved by the Sponsor, a quorum shall be defined as one-third of Working Group voting members. ~~If a quorum is not present actions may be taken subject to confirmation by letter or electronic ballot, as detailed in 9.4, or at the next Working Group meeting.~~
- Re-edit to note that quorum is defined in the OM.

11 → 6.2 Conduct

- SNBM except to be compliant with the Sponsor's procedures
- ~~It is expected that participants in the WG behave in a professional manner at all times.~~ Meeting attendees ~~Participants~~ shall demonstrate respect and courtesy towards ~~officers and~~ each other, and shall allow each participant ~~while allowing participants~~ a fair and equal opportunity to contribute to the meeting, in accordance with the IEEE Code of Ethics [9].
- All Working Group participants shall ~~comply with all applicable laws (nation-based and international) and~~ act in accordance with all IEEE Standards policies and procedure [3]. Where applicable, Working Group participants shall comply with IEEE Policies Section 9.8 on Conflict of Interest.

New subclauses 6.3 and 6.4

- 6.3 Executive Session (**SNBM**)
 - Meetings to discuss personnel or sensitive business matters (e.g., the negotiation of contracts), or for other appropriate non-public matters (e.g., the receipt of legal advice), may be conducted in Executive Session.
- 6.4 Meeting Fees (**MBM**)
 - The Working Group, or meeting host, may charge a meeting fee to cover services needed for the conduct of the meeting. The fee shall not be used to restrict participation by any interested parties.

New subclause 6.5 Minutes (1)

- 6.5 Minutes (**SNBM**)
 - The minutes shall concisely record the essential business of the Working Group, including the following items at a minimum:
 - a) Name of group
 - b) Date and location of meeting
 - c) Officer presiding, including the name of the secretary who wrote the minutes
 - d) Attendance, including affiliation
 - e) Call to order, Chair's remarks
 - f) Approval of minutes of previous meeting
 - g) Approval of agenda

New subclause 6.5 Minutes (2)

- (6.5 continued)
 - h) Technical topics
 - 1) Brief summary of discussion and conclusions
 - 2) Motions, including the names of mover and seconder
 - i) Items reported out of executive session
 - j) Next meeting--date and location
 - Copies of handouts and subgroup reports may be included in the minutes or made available as separate items.
- Previously, we had in Secretary's duties:
 - The meeting minutes are to include:
 - List of participants, their employers and affiliations
 - Next meeting schedule
 - Agenda as revised at the start of the meeting
 - Voting record (Resolution, Mover / Second, Numeric results)

9.1 → 7.1 Approval of an action

- SNBM except to be compliant with Sponsor's procedures.
- In item b) "... , excluding abstentions), ~~unless identified otherwise elsewhere in these P&P~~ provided a majority of all the voting members of the Working Group responded.
- Note that the baseline WG P&P only requires 2/3 approval to forward a standard. Sponsor ballot still require 75%. I will ask AudCom for clarification

9.2 → 7.1.1, 9.3 → 7.1.2

- 9.2 → 7.1.1: No changes (SNBM except to add items or move from 7.1.1 to 7.1.2)
- 9.3 → 7.1.2: (SNBM except to add items or be compliant with Sponsor's procedures)
 - Note: The baseline only has three items here, do we want to keep all of ours?
 - Deleted “e) Permit officer to run for election who has held the office for five (5) or more full or partial terms
 - Added:
 - Footnote to a) Approval of change of the WG scope, “Item a) is subject to confirmation by the Sponsor. “
 - “b) Establishment of fees, if necessary

9.4 → 7.2 (SNBM)

- At the discretion of the Chair, tThe Working Group shall be allowed to conduct votes between meetings ~~at the discretion of the Chair~~ by use of a letter or electronic ballot. If such actions are to be taken, they shall follow the rules of IEEE Bylaw I-300.4(4) [1].

13.0 → 8.0 Communications

- **MBM**
- Added “Communications shall be in compliance with the Sponsor’s communication requirements.”

12 → 9.0 Appeals (SNBM)

- Was:
 - The WG recognizes the right of appeal. If technical or procedural appeals are referred back to the WG, every effort should be made to ensure that impartial handling of complaints regarding any action or inaction on the part of the WG is performed in an identifiable manner.
 - If the WG must conduct an appeal hearing, it shall model its appeals process based on the appeals processes of the IEEE-SA Standards Board.
- Now:
 - Any person dissatisfied with a technical decision shall follow the approved procedures for providing technical input to the Working Group, including but not limited to presenting the concern to the Working Group, and making a technical comment during the applicable comment submission and/or balloting period.
 - Procedural concerns within the Working Group shall first be presented to the Working Group Chair for resolution. If the procedural concern is not resolved after presentation to the Chair, the concern can be brought to the Sponsor for resolution.

9.6 → 12

- Was: 9.6 Actions requiring an electronic ballot
 - Approval to forward a draft standard to the Sponsor shall require approval by a Working Group Electronic Ballot. Abstains shall require a reason be given, and Do Not Approve votes shall require comments on changes required to modify the vote to Approve. For a letter ballot on a draft standard to be valid a majority of all the voting members of the Working Group must have responded Approve, Do Not Approve, or Abstain. Comment resolution, recirculations, etc should be consistent with Sponsor ballot rules and 5.4.3.2 of the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual (SASB OM).
 - The response time for a Working Group letter ballot on a draft shall be at least thirty days. However, for recirculation ballots the response time shall be at least fifteen days.
 - Submission of a draft standard or a revised standard to the Sponsor shall be accompanied by any outstanding negative votes and a statement of why these unresolved negative votes could not be resolved.
 - Revised drafts approved in subsequent WG letter ballot for forwarding to the Sponsor Ballot Group do not require Sponsor approval for forwarding.

9.7 → 13 (not in yet)

- Was: 9.7 Roll call votes
 - A roll call vote may be held at the discretion of the chair.
 - In addition, a roll call vote may be called for by any member of the group, at any time from when the question has been put until the vote tally is completed. The call does not require a second, and cannot be debated, amended, or have any other subsidiary motion applied to it.
 - Upon a call for a roll call vote, the chair shall proceed according to these three options.
 - a) The chair may hold the vote
 - b) The chair may hold a vote on the question of whether to hold a roll call vote. This vote shall achieve greater than 25% of the members voting Yes to pass. The 25% is counted by dividing the count of Yes votes by the sum of the Yes and No votes. This vote is not subject to a roll call vote.
 - c) The chair may refuse the request for a roll call vote if this privilege is being abused by members repeatedly calling for a roll call vote. The chair shall allow both the majority and minority reasonable and fair use of the roll call vote.
 - Each roll call vote and call for a roll call vote shall be recorded in minutes of the meeting. For each roll call vote, the minutes shall include each member's name, their vote and the final result of the vote. For each call for a roll call vote, the minutes shall include:
 - i. The name of the requestor of the roll call vote.
 - ii. The decision of the chair on the request and, when applicable, the results of the vote on whether to hold the roll call or the reasons of the chair for denying the roll call vote.

14 WG Financial Operations

- Suggestion is to move the description of operating with joint treasury and joint executive committee to the Operations Manual, changes to be made simultaneously with the WG P&P changes.