IEEE 802 EC SG  
Privacy Recommendation

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Minutes of EC Privacy Recommendation SG Meeting  July 13-17, 2015 | | | | | |
|  | | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | | email |
| Karen Randall | Randall Consulting |  |  | [karen@randall-consulting.com](mailto:karen@randall-consulting.com) | |
| Juan Carlos Zuniga | InterDigital |  |  | [j.c.zuniga@ieee.org](mailto:j.c.zuniga@ieee.org) | |

Abstract

Minutes of the EC Privacy Recommendation SG face-to-face meeting during the IEEE 802 July 2015 Plenary meeting in Waikoloa, HI.

**Tuesday, July 14th, 2015**

Chair: Juan Carlos Zuniga

Recording secretary: Karen Randall

**Call to order**

* Meeting called to order at 19:35 hrs.
* The chair slides were posted:
* <https://mentor.ieee.org/privecsg/dcn/15/privecsg-15-0026-01-ecsg-july-plenary-meeting-slides.pptx>

**IEEE WG Guidelines**

* The chair read the IEEE guidelines and asked for declaration of Potentially Essential Patents.
  + No IPR issues were brought up

**Appointment of recording secretary**

* Karen Randall volunteered to take notes

**Agenda**

* Welcome
* Chair's slides
  + IEEE Slides
  + Call meeting to order
* Group’s reports
  + IEEE Press Release on Privacy Trials and related media coverage
  + 802 Privacy PAR/CSD potential comments’ resolution
  + 802.1 WG Motion and 802 EC Closing Report
* Technical Presentations
  + MAC Address Randomization Trial/Experiment
  + Threat model discussions
* Next Steps

**Group’s updates**

* **Media Coverage**

There have been a number of PR and media announcements about the Privacy trials that have been held at the IEEE 802 and IETF meetings. Links to the articles are available in the agenda slide deck.

* **PAR/CSD**

The PAR and CSD were pre-circulated in June for consideration by the WGs at this meeting. Comments were received from IEEE 802.3 and IEEE 802.11. Generating responses to these comments is the first priority for this meeting. Some of the comments were administrative in nature, e.g., CSD needs to be a stand-alone document, removal of additional PAR information at the front of the CSD; text in Purpose doesn’t add anything beyond Scope. Other comments focused on clarifying some text, e.g., Purpose, Economic Feasibility, and Technical Feasibility. The WG wordsmithed the PAR/CSD based on the comments and all were asked to review prior to the next session on Wednesday.

The EC Privacy SG recessed (until Wednesday PM1) at 9:04pm.

**Wednesday, 15 July 2015**

Juan Carlos called the meeting to order at 1:32pm.

After review and some additional editorial changes, the revised PAR and CSD were posted to the mentor site at [PAR](https://mentor.ieee.org/privecsg/dcn/15/privecsg-15-0030-00-ecsg-privacy-ec-sg-par-proposal.pdf) and [CSD](https://mentor.ieee.org/privecsg/dcn/15/privecsg-15-0029-01-0000-privacy-ec-sg-csd-proposal.docx).). All comments received were addressed and responses prepared: (<https://mentor.ieee.org/privecsg/dcn/15/privecsg-15-0031-00-ecsg-response-to-par-and-csd-comments.pptx>).

It was noted that the PAR would be assigned to the IEEE 802.1 WG but the project would be IEEE 802E.

MOTION to accept the two documents as the proposed PAR/CSD for consideration by IEEE 802.1 WG approval at the 802 EC closing meeting.

MOVE: Dan Harkins; SECOND: Karen Randall

vote – 7/0/0 (room count 8). Motion passes.

**MOTION** to accept the accept the document privecsg-31 as the response to the PAR/CSD comments received from IEEE 802.3 and IEEE 802.11.

MOVE: Paul Nikolich; SECOND: Dan Harkins

vote – 7/0/0 (room count 8). motion passes.

The EC Privacy SG recessed (until Thursday AM1) at 2:55pm.

**Thursday, July 16, 2015**

JC called the meeting to order at 8:10am.

JC commented that document [privecsg-28](https://mentor.ieee.org/privecsg/dcn/15/privecsg-15-0028-00-0000-wifi-privacy-network-experiment-at-ieee-802-may-plenary-and-ietf91-meetings.pptx) contains a report of the privacy trial. It was noted that there are plans keep the network setup permanently at IETF and IEEE 802 meetings and there will be continued analysis of the impact of MAC address collision under different scenarios and with different network equipment vendors. Some conference/technical papers are under preparation or have been submitted – a paper for an IEEE conference on standards in November and another paper was submitted for a journal.

The IAB Privacy and Security Program is developing a Threat Model that is proposed to be used as a baseline document here. There are questions about how to endorse this document within an IEEE WG. More importantly, does this group think this a good document that it would want to endorse? What does endorsement mean? Is this the only threat model to consider? There is good information in the IAB document (some input from IEEE 802 members!) but process issues should be resolved before a final decision about this document can be made.

What other solutions are there for MAC privacy? Plan for some additional presentations in the future.

In summary, JC will request an extension of the Privacy Study Group until the November plenary meeting, at which time a more formal handover to IEEE 802.1 can occur (assuming EC and NesCom approval of the PAR). The privescg mail-list will remain active. JC proposed three teleconferences:

* 2 September 2015, 10:00 AM ET
* 30 September 2015, 10:00 AM ET
* 21 October 2015, 10:00 AM ET

There will be no meeting of the EC Privacy SG at either September 2015 interim meetings; the next face to face meeting will be at the November 2015 Plenary in Dallas, TX, USA.

**Adjournment**

The EC Privacy SG meeting was adjourned at 8:47am.