IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| SA Ballot on D5.0 – CID 22216 | | | | |
| Date: 2023-05-10 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Thomas Derham |  |  |  | thomas.derham@broadcom.com |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 22216 | 11.49 | 406 | The text "colocated APs" is equivalent to a neighbour AP. I think this text should say "colocated affiliated APs". | Change "colocated APs" to "colocated affiliated APs". | Reject – RNR carries information on neighbor APs that are not collocated, and also on colocated APs that are not necessarily affiliated with any (or the same) AP MLD. |

**Discussion**

A “colocated AP” is not equivalent to a “neighbo(u)r AP”. Per Definitions in baseline (e.g. 3.2 in REVme D5.0), a colocated AP set comprises a set of APs in the same physical device; whereas a neighbor AP is any AP that is a potential service set transition candidate. In general, the former is a subset of the latter, since potential transition candidates include BSSs that are both in the same physical device as the source BSS (e.g. in band steering) and in different physical devices as the source BSS (e.g. in mobility steering).

An “affiliated AP” is an AP that is affiliated with an AP MLD. In general, APs that are affiliated with the same AP MLD are colocated, however the opposite is not true (i.e. some colocated APs might not be affiliated with the same MLD – either because those APs are not EHT APs and hence not affiliated with any AP MLD, or because they are affiliated with a different AP MLD).

The Reduced Neighbor Report is used to indicate neighbor APs that are not colocated APs, and/or colocated APs that are not affiliated with the same AP MLD, and/or APs that are affiliated with the same AP MLD. The addition of the underlined phrase “reported neighbor APs or colocated APs…” in 11be was made for consistency with other usages in the same subclause in baseline (e.g. see the 1st sentence of 11.49 in REVme D5.0 “… contains information on neighbor APs, colocated APs, or a combination of both”. The addition of the underlined phrase is therefore not intended to be specific to (EHT) affiliated APs.

Therefore, the proposed change should not be made.

**Proposed text**

**N/A**